



The Scots in England – a different kind of diaspora?

Murray Stewart Leith & Duncan Sim

To cite this article: Murray Stewart Leith & Duncan Sim (2017): The Scots in England – a different kind of diaspora?, *National Identities*, DOI: [10.1080/14608944.2017.1397617](https://doi.org/10.1080/14608944.2017.1397617)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14608944.2017.1397617>



Published online: 27 Nov 2017.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 2



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)



The Scots in England – a different kind of diaspora?

Murray Stewart Leith and Duncan Sim

School of Media Culture and Society, University of the West of Scotland, Paisley, UK

ABSTRACT

There is a growing interest in the Scottish diaspora, with the Scottish Government keen to develop links with Scots elsewhere. The closest diaspora is in England but appears relatively weak, with Scottish identity declining in strength. Using qualitative interviews, we explore the nature of the Scottish diaspora in England, seeking to explain why it appears less strong than diasporas overseas, for example in North America. We conclude that fewer Scots are migrating to England and that the children of migrant Scots are more likely to adopt an English identity. The diaspora is not, therefore, being 'refreshed' and is declining.

KEYWORDS



Scotland; England; diaspora; migration; national identity

Introduction

Views of the Scottish diaspora are perhaps coloured by those in North America and Australasia, which have both a strong sense of identity (Ray, 2001; Sullivan, 2009) and a nostalgic view of their homeland (Macgregor, 1980; Roberts, 1999). This image was reinforced by the establishment of 'Tartan Week' as the occasion when Scottish Americans celebrate their ancestral connection, emphasising a version of tartanry with which modern Scotland may be uncomfortable.

Nostalgia is not, however, a barrier to being well informed about contemporary Scotland and research with Scottish Americans (Sim, 2011a) shows that members of the diaspora regularly access Scottish websites, undertake online genealogical research and follow Scottish news and events. The relative ease of international travel has enabled diaspora members to travel 'home' regularly, to explore family histories and visit sites of personal significance (Basu, 2007), while the Scottish Government's Years of Homecoming have encouraged visits (Scottish Government, 2010).

Research on the Scottish diaspora in North America (Hague, 2001; Hunter, 1994; Ray, 2001, 2005) reflects its size, with 5.5 million people in the US alone claiming Scottish ancestry, according to the 2010 Census. Diasporas elsewhere are now being explored in greater detail, for example in Australia (Prentis, 2008), New Zealand (Brooking & Coleman, 2003) and Europe (Hesse, 2011a; Sim & Leith, 2014). But the closest, and arguably oldest, diaspora – in England – appears to be under-researched and, although there are some historical studies (Burnett, 2007; McCarthy, 2007; Sim, 2011b), there are few socio-political studies of the contemporary Scottish diaspora within England.

CONTACT Duncan Sim  duncan.sim@uws.ac.uk  School of Media Culture and Society, University of the West of Scotland, High Street, Paisley PA1 2BE, UK

© 2017 Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group

This paper seeks to explore aspects of the Scottish diaspora in two locations in England and why it appears, at first sight, to be weaker than Scottish diasporas elsewhere. We begin by referring to the literature on diasporas which attempted to distinguish between its different elements. We then report on some detailed qualitative interviews carried out in England, before attempting to draw conclusions on the nature of the diaspora and the ways in which it may differ from Scottish diasporas elsewhere.

Defining the diaspora

There is considerable research conceptualising and defining 'diaspora' (Cohen, 2008; Esman, 2009) and so our discussion here is limited. The term was associated originally with forced resettlement, for example of the Jews from Palestine. Consequently, a key to understanding the nature of diasporas was firstly the forcible expulsion of people from their homelands and, secondly, the continuing importance which the homelands held for them (Brubaker, 2005). The term 'diaspora' is now used more loosely to cover a range of emigrant groups, many of whom have been largely assimilated into their host societies. It has become a contemporary social construct in which a diaspora reality is based on a range of factors, including a sense of national or group identity, feelings of belonging, mythology, history, memory and dreams (Shuval, 2000).

Butler (2001) points out that most scholars agree on three basic features. The first is that, after dispersal, there should be a minimum of two destinations; this reflects the original meaning of the term as a 'scattering'. Secondly, there must be some form of homeland relationship, real or imagined. Thirdly, there must be a group identity self-awareness as a diaspora, with links to each other as well as the homeland. This acts as a form of boundary maintenance vis-à-vis the host society or other diaspora groups (Brubaker, 2005).

Cohen (2008) summarises the thinking on different types of diaspora, including *victim* diasporas such as the Jews, and *labour* diasporas, including indentured/guest workers, such as Indians, Turks and Chinese labourers. A third type is the *imperial* diaspora, of which the British are possibly the best example, defending and administering their global empire. Fourth is the *trade* diaspora, with individuals moving to work in trade, business and the professions, while a fifth is the *hybrid* or *de-territorialised* diaspora, where there may not be a specific homeland with which to connect; examples include peoples who are defined by religion rather than by territory. In applying this typology to the Scottish case, it might be argued that Scots affected by the Highland Clearances would be a part of a victim diaspora but most Scots would be trade or imperial diasporas (Buelmann, 2011).

Connections between Scotland and its diasporas were not well developed until the establishment of the Scottish Parliament in 1999 and the subsequent introduction of diaspora strategies. The Government commissioned a number of studies to assist in this process, and Rutherford (2009), exploring the value of the diaspora to Scotland, developed a specific typology. He identified the *lived* diaspora – individuals born in Scotland who have migrated from it, or who have lived and worked or studied within it; the *ancestral* diaspora – those who can trace their heritage and familial roots to Scotland; and the *affinity* diaspora – those who feel a connection to Scotland, who may be active through cultural or family groups, or who may simply be attracted to the heritage or culture of the country (Rutherford, 2009).

Much previous research on the Scottish diaspora has focused on the essentially immigrant nations in North America and Australasia. The relationship which these diasporas have with Scotland is strong but often sentimental or romanticised (Prentis, 2008; Sim, 2011a). This may result from family researches that have prioritised such things as clan membership, or from portrayals of Scotland in films such as *Brigadoon* (Macgregor, 1980) and *Braveheart* (Edensor, 1997), which often emphasise historical myths over accuracy.

Although there is historical research on Scottish migration to Europe (Devine & Hesse, 2011), researchers have tended to ignore more contemporary diasporas in England and elsewhere in Europe, although such diasporas may have a more realistic view of Scotland because of their proximity to the homeland. Our interest is in the diaspora in England and we move on to describe the nature of this group.

The Scots in England

There has long been emigration from Scotland to England, with Dr Samuel Johnson remarking that ‘the noblest prospect which a Scotchman ever sees is the high road that leads him to England’ (Mack, 2006). Some Scots were forced to move south to find work, others moved voluntarily; but in relation to Cohen’s (2008) typology, the Scottish diaspora in England is essentially a *trade* diaspora, where migration has been employment-related. Census data, however, reveal that the proportion of Scots in England has been relatively small. In 1851, for example, there were 130,087 people of Scottish birth living in England, representing just 0.7% of the total population. The numbers of Scots living in England rose over the years to hold fairly steady at around 1%, until the Second World War. After the war, numbers ‘jumped’ to around three-quarters of a million between 1971 and 2001 (1.6% of the total population of England). In 2011, there was a significant fall in absolute numbers (to 708,872) and in proportion (to 1.3%), the lowest for 50 years. Office for National Statistics population estimates for 2016, which have analysed migration within the UK from 2001 onwards, suggest that the net outflow from Scotland to England is now at its lowest level for 15 years. This would, therefore, concur with the analysis of Findlay, Mason, Harrison, Houston, and McCollum (2008) to which we refer later, that migration from Scotland to England is declining and even being reversed. The Scottish diaspora in England is no longer being ‘refreshed’ by large numbers of new migrants.

The diaspora is also ageing. In the 2011 Census, the overall proportions of those enumerated in England in the age bands 0–15, 16–64 and 65+ were, respectively 19%, 65% and 16%. But, the figures for those born in Scotland but living in England were, respectively 4%, 71% and 25%, so there was a significantly larger proportion in the upper age range.

Table 1 shows the Scots-born in selected English cities from 1851 to 2011 and illustrates patterns of migration over time. London was an important destination for migrants in numerical terms, but the proportion of Scots in London has generally been low, only rising to a peak of 1.9% in the immediate post-war period. Liverpool initially attracted significant numbers of Scots, particularly between 1861 and 1881, reflecting the opportunities offered by the city’s maritime-related industries. The most significant immigration of Scots in percentage terms was to Newcastle, the conurbation closest to the Scottish border; again, the peak years were in the late-nineteenth century. Manchester’s peak years of Scottish immigration appear to have been more evenly spread, while Scottish immigration was less significant until the post-war era in Birmingham and Leeds.

Table 1. Scots-born in Selected English cities 1851–2011.

Year	Liverpool		Newcastle		Manchester		Leeds		Birmingham		London	
	No. of Scots	% of Popn.	No. of Scots	% of Popn.	No. of Scots	% of Popn.	No. of Scots	% of Popn.	No. of Scots	% of Popn.	No. of Scots	% of Popn.
1851	9242	3.6	5745	6.5	3209	1.4	1268	0.7	1100	0.5	29,668	1.3
1861	17,870	4.0	4981	4.6	7971	1.7	1402	0.7	1432	0.5	35,733	1.3
1871	20,394	4.1	8906	6.9	7176	2.0	2198	0.8	1545	0.4	41,029	1.3
1881	20,434	3.7	8732	6.0	6089	1.8	2654	0.9	1667	0.4	49,554	1.3
1891	15,276	2.9	11,085	5.9	7599	1.5	3347	0.9	2007	0.4	53,390	1.3
1901	16,998	2.5	12,031	5.7	7515	1.4	3911	0.9	2335	0.4	56,605	1.2
1911	14,275	1.9	11,990	4.5	9065	1.3	3678	0.8	2184	0.4	50,938	1.1
1921	12,301	1.5	10,278	3.7	8239	1.1	3873	0.8	4809	0.5	49,881	1.1
1931	10,340	1.2	8780	3.1	8473	1.1	4315	0.9	5670	0.6	54,673	1.2
1941	No census											
1951	8192	1.0	7443	2.5	9018	1.3	6338	1.2	13,005	1.2	62,980	1.9
1961	6700	0.9	6096	2.3	8756	1.3	6813	1.3	13,139	1.2	59,704	1.9
1971	5350	0.9	4840	2.2	9155	1.7	8085	1.6	11,960	1.2	129,680	1.7
1981	3951	0.8	5672	2.1	7571	1.7	11,193	1.6	11,422	1.1	109,901	1.7
1991	3277	0.7	5571	2.1	6864	1.7	9955	1.5	9793	1.0	109,265	1.7
2001	3376	0.8	6249	2.4	6938	1.8	11,813	1.6	8453	0.9	108,680	1.5
2011	3196	0.7	5698	2.0	6545	1.3	10,281	1.4	6855	0.6	89,527	1.1

Note: All cities have experienced boundary changes over the years but it is not likely that this will have had much impact on the proportion of Scots in each city.

We should also note exceptional examples of Scottish migration such as Corby, where in 1932, the iron and steel company Stewarts and Lloyds established a new plant, to take advantage of nearby ironstone deposits. Labour was imported from existing works in Lanarkshire, and Corby expanded from a small village into a substantial new town (Pocock, 1960). Migration from Scotland continued well into the post-war period and even in 2011, the town still had 7765 Scots-born people living there (12.7% of the total) and retained a distinctive Scottish identity (Harper, 2013).

As noted above, research on the Scottish diaspora in England has been primarily historical (Bueltmann, Hinson, & Morton, 2013; Cage, 1985), with some studies focusing on specific locations. Sim (2011b) studied Scots on Merseyside and there is research on Scottish societies in north-east England (Burnett, 2007) and in Hull (McCarthy, 2007), while in Corby, Dyer (2002) has explored dialect and identity within the town. Migration of Scots associated with the herring fisheries have been studied by Davies (2010). There are few studies of the contemporary Scottish diaspora in England, however, possibly because of its small size relative to that in North America and perhaps also because it is overseas diasporas which have been the focus of Scottish Government activity (Scottish Executive, 2006).

Sim's (2011b) Merseyside study illustrates the significant weakening of the Scottish diaspora there, with many Scottish societies beginning to fold. In Hull, when McCarthy (2007) undertook her research into the Scots' Society of St Andrew, their membership had declined from a peak of 463 in 1954 to only 62. By 2016, the society had folded completely (McCarthy, 2016).

This decline in associational culture may simply reflect the reduction in the numbers of Scots moving south. But, it appears to be compounded by a lack of interest in their ancestry by the children of Scots. Leith and Sim (2012) identified a weak sense of a Scottish identity within second-generation Scots, with many preferring to embrace an English-only identity. In America, in contrast, there are large numbers of second-, third- and fourth-generation Scots, all apparently interested in their ancestry and playing a significant role in Scottish organisations, which have grown in size and number. Hague (2001) established that the number of Highland Games and Scottish festivals within the US increased from around 75 in the mid-1980s to 205 by 2000. An internet search for our own research revealed a total of 198 Highland Games and Scottish/Celtic festivals in the US in 2015, so the number seems to have remained relatively constant. While some have dismissed the identity celebrated in such festivals as being merely 'symbolic' (Gans, 1979), nevertheless the increase in Scottish organisations from the 1960s onwards is part of a broader growth in US cultural diversity (Hollinger, 2000), and the recognition of multiple ethnicities, of which 'Scottish' is one.

In England, it is difficult to obtain accurate data on Scottish organisations and events. The website 'Rampant Scotland' contains links to Scottish organisations in England,¹ although the list is probably incomplete. What is more telling perhaps is to examine in detail an organisation such as the Lancashire and Cheshire Federation of Scottish Societies.² Their webpage lists 41 member societies, most founded between the late-nineteenth century and the 1930s, but five of these entries have no details recorded about the society concerned and, in 14 other cases, only an email contact is given. It must be assumed that many of these societies are moribund and, if they still exist, do so in name only.

Furthermore, in contrast to the growth in the numbers of Highland Games in America, such events have all but vanished in England. In early 2016, the Ashbourne Highland Gathering in Derbyshire was cancelled due to lack of money. This prompted a discussion on the website 'X Marks the Scot'³ to the effect that there were now only two Games operating in England – in Corby and Harpenden, ironically held on the same day. For Scottish dancers, the Royal Scottish Country Dance Society (RSCDS) has a total of 191 branches and affiliated groups in England, but there is no way of knowing how healthy they actually are.

Our research seeks to explore the Scottish diaspora in England and to gain an idea of its relative health. If, as appears to be the case, it is quite weak, we seek to try and explain why this is so. We use data from qualitative interviews to try and answer these questions and, in doing so, we aim to use Rutherford's (2009) classification, distinguishing between the *lived* diaspora (those of our interviewees who were born and/or brought up in Scotland), *ancestral* Scots, who retain a family interest and connection with Scotland, and *affinity* Scots, who are simply interested in Scottish culture and activities.

Methodology

Although we have referred earlier to Census data to illustrate the changing size of the Scottish diaspora in England, we believed that our understanding of the diaspora, its different components and its future, would benefit from a qualitative approach. Consequently, we conducted semi-structured interviews in two contrasting locations. The first of these was Merseyside, reflecting its long tradition of Scottish settlement, with 4% of Liverpool's mid-nineteenth century population born in Scotland. There are a number of Scottish organisations locally, albeit many now appear fairly moribund. In 2011, the Scots-born population in the city itself was 3196 (0.7% of the total), significantly down from its historical highpoint.

The second area chosen for study was Shropshire. We sought an area which was less urban, without a long tradition of Scottish settlement, and with a limited range of Scottish organisations. This would enable us to explore differences in the persistence of Scottish identity between two contrasting locations. Shropshire's Scots-born population in 2011 was 3828 – higher than that for Liverpool and representing 1.2% of the county's population. The numbers of Scots-born have remained fairly constant, although there is no significant tradition of Scottish migration to the area. There appear, for example, to be only two or three Scottish societies in Shropshire.

Initial contact was made with members and office bearers of some of these societies in late 2009 and early 2010 to identify potential interviewees and samples then 'snowballed' to other contacts and friends. Thus, our eventual total of 22 interviewees comprised a range of individuals with varied Scottish origins and connections; only eight, for example, were actively involved with Scottish organisations. We interviewed 13 people in Merseyside, and 9 in Shropshire. Our sample was evenly split by gender, with 11 males and 11 females and the average age was 61, perhaps reflecting the rather older age profile of the Scottish diaspora. In all, 16 interviewees had been born and brought up in Scotland, while the other six had been born in England of Scottish parentage. Our sample was not large but the length of the interviews yielded a wealth of data. Furthermore, by relating it to our own and others' research, we believe it to be illustrative of the Scottish diaspora in England and it provides significant pointers as to how the diaspora functions.

Each interview lasted between 40 and 55 minutes and was recorded and later transcribed. Interviewees were asked about their personal histories, involvement with Scottish organisations and questions of identity. In relation to identity, we were seeking to explore how individuals maintained their own (Scottish) identity, how (in some cases) it had been inherited from their parents, and how – or if – they had passed it on to their children. In relation to the passing on of a Scottish identity, we were not able to ask the questions of the children themselves, not least for ethical reasons. Rather we have explored the interviewees' perceptions of their children's identity and the extent to which it coincided with their own.

In reporting on our findings below, we use a number of quotations from our interviews to illustrate our discussion.

What is the Scottish diaspora in England like?

The 'lived' diaspora

Most interviewees (16) had been born and/or brought up in Scotland and so would represent a lived diaspora. Five had moved to England as children because of their parents' jobs, eight had moved either after leaving school or university to take up employment and a further three had moved in their late 20s and early 30s, again for employment reasons. Eight interviewees were now retired and the lived diaspora appeared increasingly an ageing one.

Some interviewees reflected on how they had had to adapt when moving south, with several talking about the need to change the way they spoke.

I know my Scottish accent is very different now from when I first came down. Nobody could understand me ... Now, to my friends, I must sound very 'Englified'. But somebody in England, they can pick out the fact that I'm Scottish and I wouldn't like to lose that because I'm Scottish before I'm British. (Merseyside, female, aged 57)

Another individual found himself called upon to speak at Burns Suppers, precisely because he retained his (slightly modified) accent:

Well, we have a Burns Night – and I often get asked to say something. There are a few Scots in the area and we like the Burns supper. It brings Scotland here.

Q: How did you first become involved?

I got asked to address the haggis about two years after I got here – I was about the only Scot who would speak publicly in the Scots way.

Q: What do you mean?

A lot of people tried to lose their accent early on – they thought it was good for their careers. I never bothered about it though. I thought it was kind of silly to try to get rid of something that is a part of you. (Shropshire, male, aged 57)

A number of interviewees reflected on differences between Scotland and England. There was a belief that people in England were not as patriotic or aware of their national identity as Scots, something reflected in other research (Kumar, 2003). Hence:

We are different from the English in lots of ways. They don't get into being English all that much – except football ... we Scots celebrate being Scottish more than that. (Shropshire, male, aged 57)

Scottish people are more proud of their country than English people are. In Scotland, I think there's a national identity which they don't have in England. English people in my opinion, if you ask them about history or anything like that, they start talking about kings and queens and Empire and all this crap, whereas the Scots, I think, from their history, have always been a free and independent country – and we're proud of that. (Merseyside, male, aged 70s)

They almost seem embarrassed to say that they are English. (Shropshire, male, aged 70)

Another difference which was highlighted was in relation to class, with England being seen as a society where social class was deemed important.

I've always had the impression with the English, they're uncomfortable until they can place you within what they perceive as some kind of social 'caste'. They don't understand Scottish accents [and] what I mean by that is they can't place you within some kind of social strata, if you like. So they then start very subtly asking questions about what you do and all this kind of thing. What they're trying to do is place you in some kind of social structure ... I think in Scotland, people don't worry if you're upper class or middle class or whatever. (Merseyside, male, aged 70s)

Many interviewees, therefore, had an awareness of small differences between themselves and their English 'hosts', even though their migration had been over a relatively short distance, within the UK state.

Significant numbers of Scots, of course, choose to maintain these 'differences' by joining Scottish associations as a means of keeping their sense of identity. Of our 16 lived diaspora interviewees, 8 (plus the wife of a ninth) had been involved with a Scottish organisation. For migrants, the societies played an important welcoming role:

Well, I was brought up on the family farm [so] the city was all a bit big and strange. But I had done Scottish country dancing at school and university, and I knew of the RSCDS so I knew that there must be an RSCDS branch. So I went to the local libraries and I found an advert for the branch and went along and joined them. (Merseyside, female, aged 49)

Although the societies had been important for many interviewees on first moving south, many of them had become rather moribund. We noted earlier how some societies have folded because of a lack of 'new blood' and others appeared to be barely surviving.

The RSCDS Liverpool branch – that's been going since 1951. And it's like everybody else – we have an ageing population. We used to have contact with the university, so we got some students along. But it's sad, that we don't get the youngsters now. (Merseyside, female, aged 50s)

We've tried everything to get new members but the younger ones don't seem to be interested ... We find that members are dancing until they're in their 70s and 80s and one lady I know said that, when she gets to 70, [the society] won't be around. (Merseyside, female, aged 57)

My wife is a member of the Birkenhead St Andrews Society. But that society actually has now finished ... So the people who were in the club for many years were really quite elderly and their mobility isn't as good, and going out at night and this sort of thing. So this year, they just decided to fold up the society. (Merseyside, male, aged 70s)

Thus, Scottish organisations had played a role for new migrants from Scotland and may have helped to maintain a sense of identity for the diaspora. Although some had now folded, that in itself should not have diminished individual respondents' sense of their own 'Scottishness' and we tested this, using the 'Moreno question' (Moreno, 2006),

which seeks to balance individual feelings of ‘Scottishness’ versus those of ‘Britishness’. We found that our 16 lived diaspora respondents all retained a strong sense of their identity, with 13 stating that they felt ‘more Scottish than British’. One felt Scottish and not at all British, while the other two gave their Scottishness and Britishness equal value.

Although they retained a strong sense of Scottishness, many respondents visited the homeland less frequently, as family and friends died. Perhaps because of this reduced contact, some had adopted an overly sentimental view of Scotland.

I will never tire of Scotland’s magnificent scenery or the warm welcome given by the Scot to their many visitors. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to talk about my favourite place. (Shropshire, male, aged 68)

I feel I belong to a race of people who have a distinctive history and set of traditions and values ... It is a country and a race of people that are unique in their own right. (Shropshire, female, aged 46)

The lived diaspora has retained its Scottish identity but it is ageing and, as migration from Scotland to England is declining, it is not being refreshed. That in itself would not be fatal to the diaspora’s continued existence but, as we explore below, the ancestral diaspora is also weakening and second- and third-generation Scots are not retaining their parents’ identities.

The ‘ancestral’ diaspora

Six interviewees had been born in England of Scottish parents but had initially maintained their identity, often through participation in Scottish societies or dance groups. They, therefore, constituted an ancestral diaspora, in Rutherford’s (2009) classification.

It became clear, however, that they seldom travelled back to Scotland, not least because there were now few surviving family members to visit. Perhaps as a result, their views tended towards being rather sentimental and romanticised, not unlike some older members of the lived diaspora.

I just think it’s a wonderful place, somewhere you can go, and you can travel along the road and if you meet a car coming the other way, you’ve met a traffic jam. It’s the isolation up there I particularly like. (Merseyside, female, aged 50s)

The beauty of the countryside, such varied scenery ... I think of it as home sometimes, even though it isn’t. And I do think, when I finally retire, where would I want to live? It’s the pace of life in Scotland, there is a gentleness about it. I would have no problems living in Scotland. I have a vision of walking down the street every morning for my *Scotsman* and my morning rolls. (Merseyside, male, aged 60s)

One interviewee had decided to get married in Scotland and had not only hired full Highland dress in which to do it, but a castle for the ceremony.

We met down here but we’d always holidayed up in Scotland and when we were getting married, we came across Eilean Donan Castle on the west coast. I made an inquiry if we could get married there and they said yes ... To me [Scotland] feels like where my heart is. I’ve lived round here and was born down here but I always feel my home is Scotland ... It just feels like that’s where I belong and since I was a child, it’s always been where I need to head for. (Merseyside, male, aged 47)

Another interviewee spoke of her identification with Scotland rather than England, where she had been born and brought up:

I like to tell people that I am both English AND Scottish because to be honest, I don't like England much as a country ... because I think the quality of the country has declined over the last few years, but I don't think the same can be said of Scotland. (Shropshire, female, aged 20)

But, such views were comparatively rare and it was obvious that many second-generation Scots had chosen to embrace an English identity and appeared relatively uninterested in maintaining a Scottish connection or attending Scottish organisations. Thus:

The numbers [in the society] are depleting because the older members are not being supported by second, third, fourth generation Scots. (Merseyside, male, aged 60s)

I was the second of the non-Scottish Presidents. Previously you used to have at least one Scottish parent [but] the current ruling is that you have to have done some sort of work for the Federation. Which is still not very good because there are not that many people who go on Committees. They've now diluted the Chieftainship up to just a Scottish grandparent, rather than being Scottish-born. So gradually the 'Scottishness' has been diluted. (Merseyside, male, aged 61)

Several interviewees reflected on their children's lack of interest and the way in which they had chosen to view themselves as English rather than Scottish.

I don't think it would ever enter their heads, to think of themselves as Scottish. That's mother's area. And even if England weren't playing in something, then they would go for the other team most likely to win, rather than Scotland. They really don't have a strong sense of Scottish identity. (Merseyside, female, aged 49)

Oh, being born here [my daughter] sees herself as English I think ... People like me – we will always be Scottish, but our kids, and their kids? Not really, they just don't see it. (Shropshire, male, aged 57)

My nephew wears an England shirt, and would be embarrassed to wear a Scotland one I think, so we never push it. (Shropshire, female, aged 71)

This lack of interest in retaining a sense of Scottishness has been studied by Leith and Sim (2012) and it is clear that, while 'being Scottish' was important for our Scottish-born interviewees, this was not necessarily being passed on to their children. We are relying here on interviewees telling us about the identity of their offspring rather than questioning the offspring directly, but we have no reason to doubt the accuracy of what we were told.

The 'affinity' diaspora

Rutherford (2009) identified 'affinity' Scots as individuals who make a connection to Scotland without drawing a direct family link to the country. The 'affinity' may result from contact with diaspora groups or members, or because of a creative or cultural interest such as music or art. Rutherford accepts that this group would not necessarily be included within traditional definitions of diaspora but they are numerically significant, amounting, he believes, to between 40 and 50 million people worldwide.

Hesse (2011a, 2011b) has explored the participation of affinity Scots in events such as Highland Games. He suggests that individuals are effectively playing at being Scotsmen,

with interest kindled by films like *Braveheart* and *Rob Roy*, as well as the Scottish-focused writings of American novelists such as Diana Gabaldon. There has been a long-standing interest in 'Celtic' culture in parts of Europe (Dietler, 1994) with the Scots viewed as the guardians of a European 'Celtic' past (whatever that may be), embodying an attractive rebellious spirit. While homeland Scots might find it strange for individuals with a culture of their own to be enthusiastic about someone else's, Hesse suggests that many European countries have turned against their cultural heritage (sometimes because of its association with Fascism) and have embraced an alternative and available culture, which is seen as somehow nobler and more attractive. Sim and Leith (2014) identified a similar situation in the Netherlands, with a strong Dutch interest in things Scottish.

Our interviews also indicated that many of those involved in Scottish organisations and events were, similarly, affinity Scots.

I think you'll find that an awful lot of people who dance are not Scots. But they just love the music and they love the atmosphere, they love dancing. An awful lot of people in our branch are not Scots.

Q: So if it wasn't for the non-Scots, you'd be struggling?

Oh yes. If it wasn't for the good old Scousers, we'd be on our knees. (Merseyside, female, 50s)

When I had links with a local Caledonian society, the members were mainly English folks who enjoyed a 'Scottish Experience' – usually Burns Suppers and St Andrew's Night parties. (Shropshire, male, aged 70)

They are all Sassenachs but it is warming to my heart that they all aspire to be Scottish. I am absolutely amazed how many people attend a Burns Night. (Shropshire, male, aged 68)

Clearly, there are a number of English people who participate in Scottish activities, and this reflects experiences within Scottish diasporas elsewhere. The involvement of non-Scots is often seen as highly significant in sustaining many Scottish organisations. As the numbers of organisations decline, however, it is inevitable that the opportunities available to these 'affinity' Scots will similarly decline and so it is unlikely that they will be able to help sustain the diaspora in England in the longer term.

Discussion

Our qualitative research indicates a diaspora which is weakening, and our evidence appears to be supported by other research which we describe below (Findlay et al., 2008; White, 2003). It is primarily a *lived* diaspora, deriving from Scots moving to England for employment and has previously supported a substantial range of diaspora organisations and events. But as it weakens, many organisations have folded and that in turn, reduces the opportunities for *affinity* Scots to participate in events and activities. In other parts of the world, activities are maintained by *ancestral* Scots, who seek to retain their family connection with the homeland, while in Europe, the Scottish diaspora tends to be younger and is also a *lived* one, with individuals moving to other EU countries either to work or for lifestyle reasons (Leith & Sim, 2017; Sim & Leith, 2014). But in England, demography and generational assimilation have left associational institutions unable to operate or rendered them less Scottish.

Our research would suggest that the decline in Scottish organisational culture in England reflects a decline in a sense of Scottishness, particularly within the *ancestral* diaspora (the second and third generations). But, why should the diaspora in England be different from elsewhere? As far as the *lived* diaspora is concerned, there has been a reduction in the numbers of Scots moving south. White (2003) argues that, for Scots, London is not necessarily the pinnacle of the UK urban hierarchy and that Edinburgh offers alternative opportunities, particularly for elite groups; he suggests that devolution may have reversed traditional patterns of 'brain drain'. Findlay et al. (2008) concur, noting that the fall in the numbers of Scots in London is due not just to reduced out-migration but return migration from London to Scotland. Analysis of return migrants shows that two-thirds are aged between 15 and 44, suggesting a flow of young active people contributing to the labour market and Findlay et al. wonder if this return movement reflects a view that quality of life may be better in Scotland. The policy of the then Scottish Executive to attract migrants back as one element within its Fresh Talent Initiative may also have played a role (Scottish Executive, 2004).

Census data have shown that the *lived* diaspora in England is declining, and not being 'refreshed' by new migrants. But, this does not explain why the ancestral connection is weak, compared for example with North America. Why are the second- and third-generation Scots in England so apparently uninterested in their Scottish ancestry?

One possible explanation may be that the Scots, by moving to another country (England) but within the same state (the UK) are not sufficiently distinctive from their English 'hosts' in terms of language, religion, attitudes and culture, despite differences of accent and the like. Scots may therefore be 'invisible immigrants'. Even though they opt to maintain some of their cultural characteristics, they may shed some of the cultural, social and historical differences between themselves and English people, perhaps adapting their sense of identity in the process (Hutnik, 1986). We must also recognise that both Scots and English are 'British' and so an over-arching shared British identity may serve to remove ongoing feelings of difference.

For the children of Scots migrants growing up in England, they are also faced with a growing sense of an English identity (Kenny, 2014). While some of our interviewees believed that feelings of English national identity were not strong, this may be changing, particularly in relation to sport, with supporters increasingly inclined to wave the English flag (the St George's Cross) rather than the British (and hence inappropriate) Union Jack (Skey, 2012). Second-generation Scots may therefore be inclined simply to adopt the identity of their English birthplace. Similar processes may be occurring in reverse; Bond, Charsley, and Grundy (2010) note that, despite the existence of some 'barriers to belonging', there exists a positive potential for English graduates living in Scotland to feel an increasing affinity with Scotland, thereby becoming 'settlers' rather than 'migrants'.

Being part of the same nation state and being geographically close to Scotland may also mean that Scots in England feel little need to maintain themselves as a distinctive diaspora, in contrast to more distant diasporas elsewhere. As one of our interviewees suggested:

I wonder if it is because Scotland and America have this big pond in between. In England, Scotland is just 'up there', three hours drive away. Is it that Scotland is now too close? In other words, if you want to see a Highland Games, you can go and see them in Scotland. Motorways make it really simple. (Merseyside, male, aged 60s)

Thus, proximity creates a weaker diaspora and, unlike the experiences of the Scottish diasporas overseas, Scotland may be too mundane, everyday and/or similar to England to retain the Scots' imagination over succeeding generations.

One other reason which we suggest may deter second-generation Scots from sharing in their parents' Scottish identity is a growing 'anti-Scottishness' in parts of England, notably in the media. Skey's (2012) research, for example, quotes several respondents expressing anti-Scottish views. Ichijo (2004) refers to the way in which Scots have been portrayed as 'subsidy junkies', while Tony Blair apparently referred to 'whingeing Jocks' (Campbell, 2010). The former editor of the *Sun* newspaper, Kelvin Mackenzie, has suggested shipping Scots living in England back to Scotland as 'McBoat people' and refers to Scotland pejoratively as 'Jockistan' (MacLeod, 2015). Such anti-Scottish racism was in evidence during the 2014 independence referendum and again at the General Election in 2015, where the Conservatives issued posters portraying the former leader of the Scottish National Party, Alex Salmond, as a pickpocket, presumably removing money from English pockets to benefit Scotland. This type of racism is not new; Hickman, Morgan, Walter, and Bradley (2005) have provided many examples of similar anti-Irish rhetoric.

Although we did not specifically ask our interviewees about any anti-Scottish experiences, some did refer to negative stereotyping:

Oh, I get all the stereotypes at work – although as I'm senior staff it is all good humoured. They do not want to get on the wrong side of me! ... People think we still run around in the hills I think – *Braveheart* didn't help. (Shropshire, male, aged 57)

Most of my English friends think that Scottish people are more violent than the English and they drink a lot more alcohol and have poorer diets. They also seem to think they swear a lot more too. (Shropshire, female, aged 20)

And one interviewee reported that she had often been asked 'why so many Scots were down in England'. While she felt that, for the most part, the questions were benign, she believed that there were undertones to the questioning that were 'not nice'.

Conclusion

We began our research by applying Rutherford's (2009) typology of *lived*, *ancestral* and *affinity* diaspora Scots to the Scottish diaspora in England. In doing this, we have become aware of how the diaspora there seems to differ from those elsewhere.

In mainland Europe, the contemporary Scottish diaspora appears to be a *lived* one, relatively young and often still working. As a result, diaspora organisations still function and they are supported by significant numbers of *affinity* Scots (Hesse, 2011a, b). In the long run, this may change as the children of Scots migrants settle into a host society which is non-English speaking. In North America and Australasia, the Scottish diaspora appears stronger, with an interest in heritage and genealogy being passed down the generations (Hague, 2001). This is an *ancestral* diaspora.

But in England, the picture which emerges is of a diaspora in decline. The *lived* diaspora is getting smaller, the *ancestral* diaspora appears less interested and the *affinity* diaspora may soon have fewer opportunities to participate in Scottish activities. There are, as we suggest, several possible reasons for the decline, although it may ultimately be due to a

combination of factors. Further research may be needed to explore how the younger generation of expatriate Scots actually relate to Scotland and our paper is a small contribution to the ongoing understanding of how diasporas work.

Although we have referred to Scottish Government diaspora policy, it is beyond the scope of this paper to explore this in detail. We would note, however, that, in developing its strategy, the Government has tended to focus on the far diasporas in North America and Australasia rather than the near diaspora in England. While our research suggests that there may be good reasons for this, it may nevertheless be appropriate for such policy to acknowledge what is, after all, our closest diaspora.

Notes

1. www.rampantscotland.com/features/societies.htm
2. <http://www.scotsoc.org.uk/>
3. <http://www.xmarksthescot.com/forum/f97/highland-games-england-2016-a-90442/>

Acknowledgements

A version of this paper was delivered at the ESRC seminar on 'Scots in England' at the University of Hull in January 2016. We are grateful for helpful comments from the seminar participants. We are also grateful to the University of the West of Scotland for support, and to the various interviewees for giving their time to us. Thanks also to David Walsh of the University of Glasgow for his help with Census data.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

References

- Basu, P. (2007). *Highland homecomings: Genealogy and heritage tourism in the Scottish diaspora*. London: Routledge.
- Bond, R., Charsley, K., & Grundy, S. (2010). An audible minority: Migration, settlement and identity among English graduates in Scotland. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 36(3), 483–499.
- Brooking, T., & Coleman, J. (Eds.). (2003). *The heather and the fern: Scottish migration and New Zealand settlement*. Dunedin: University of Otago Press.
- Brubaker, R. (2005). The 'diaspora' diaspora. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28(1), 1–19.
- Bueltmann, T. (2011). *Scottish ethnicity and the making of New Zealand society 1850–1930*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Bueltmann, T., Hinson, A., & Morton, G. (2013). *The Scottish diaspora*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Burnett, J. A. (2007). Hail Brither Scots O' Coaly Tyne': Networking and identity among Scottish migrants in the north-east of England, ca. 1860–2000. *Immigrants and Minorities*, 25(1), 1–21.
- Butler, K. D. (2001). Defining diaspora, refining a discourse. *Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies*, 10(2), 189–219.
- Cage, R. A. (1985). The Scots in England. In R. A. Cage (Ed.), *The Scots abroad: Labour, capital, enterprise 1750–1914* (pp. 29–45). London: Croom Helm.
- Campbell, A. (2010). *Diaries Volume 1: Prelude to power 1994–1997*. London: Hutchinson.
- Cohen, R. (2008). *Global diasporas: An introduction* (2nd ed.). London: Routledge.
- Davies, S. (2010). 'A whirling vortex of women': The strikes of Scots herring women in East Anglia in the 1930s and 1940s. *Labour History Review*, 75(2), 181–207.

- Devine, T., & Hesse, D. (Eds.). (2011). *Scotland and Poland: Historic encounters 1500–2010*. Edinburgh: John Donald.
- Dietler, M. (1994). "Our Ancestors the Gauls": Archaeology, Ethnic Nationalism, and the Manipulation of Celtic Identity in Modern Europe. *American Anthropologist*, 96, 584–605.
- Dyer, J. (2002). 'We all speak the same round here': Dialect leveling in a Scottish-English community. *Journal of Sociolinguistics*, 6(1), 99–116.
- Edensor, T. (1997). Reading *Braveheart*: Representing and contesting Scottish identity. *Scottish Affairs*, 21, 135–158.
- Esman, M. J. (2009). *Diasporas in the contemporary world*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Findlay, A., Mason, C., Harrison, R., Houston, D., & McCollum, D. (2008). Getting off the escalator? A study of Scots out-migration from a global city region. *Environment and Planning A*, 40(9), 2169–2185.
- Gans, H. J. (1979). Symbolic ethnicity: The future of ethnic groups and cultures in America. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 2(1), 1–20.
- Hague, E. (2001). Haggis and heritage – Representing Scotland in the United States. In J. Horne (Ed.), *Leisure cultures, consumption and commodification* (vol. 74, pp. 107–129). Brighton: Leisure Studies Association Publication.
- Harper, M. (2013). 'Come to Corby': A Scottish steel town in the heart of England. *Immigrants and Minorities*, 31(1), 27–47.
- Hesse, D. (2011a). Roots and hearts: Homecoming Scotland 2009 and the Scots of Europe. *Scottish Affairs*, 77, 90–109.
- Hesse, D. (2011b). Scots for a day: The Highland Games of mainland Europe. *History Scotland*, 11, 24–30.
- Hickman, M., Morgan, S., Walter, B., & Bradley, J. (2005). The limitations of whiteness and the boundaries of Englishness. *Ethnicities*, 5(2), 160–182.
- Hollinger, D. A. (2000). *Postethnic America*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Hunter, J. (1994). *A dance called America: The Scottish Highlands, the United States and Canada*. Edinburgh: Mainstream.
- Hutnik, N. (1986). Patterns of ethnic minority identification and modes of social adaptation. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 9(2), 150–167.
- Ichijo, A. (2004). *Scottish nationalism and the idea of Europe: Concepts of Europe and the nation*. London: Routledge.
- Kenny, M. (2014). *The politics of nationhood in England*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kumar, K. (2003). *The making of English national identity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Leith, M. S., & Sim, D. (2012). Second generation identities: The Scottish diaspora in England. *Sociological Research Online*, 17(3). Retrieved from <http://www.socresonline.org.uk/17/3/11.html>
- Leith, M. S., & Sim, D. (2017). Les Écossais en France: A modern diaspora? *Social Identities*, 23(2), 179–194.
- Macgregor, G. (1980). *Scotland. An intimate portrait*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin.
- Mack, D. S. (2006). *Scottish fiction and the British Empire*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- MacLeod, K. (2015, April 28). 'Load up all the Jocks and drop them off in Edinburgh': Kelvin MacKenzie's venomous tirade against Scots in England. *Daily Record*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailyrecord.co.uk/news/scottish-news/load-up-jocks-drop-edinburgh-5591890>
- McCarthy, A. (2007). 'The Scots' society of St Andrew, Hull, 1910–2001: Immigrant, ethnic and transnational association. *Immigrants and Minorities*, 25(3), 209–233.
- McCarthy, A. (2016, January 30). St Andrew's Society of Hull in context. Paper delivered at ESRC seminar 'Scots in England'. Hull: University of Hull.
- Moreno, L. (2006). Scotland, Catalonia, Europeanization and the 'Moreno' question. *Scottish Affairs*, 54, 1–21.
- Pocock, D. C. D. (1960). The migration of Scottish labour to Corby new town. *Scottish Geographical Magazine*, 76(3), 169–171.
- Prentis, M. (2008). *The Scots in Australia*. Sydney: University of New South Wales Press.
- Ray, C. (2001). *Highland heritage. Scottish Americans in the American South*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press.

- Ray, C. (Ed.). (2005). *Transatlantic Scots*. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press.
- Roberts, D. (1999, September–October). Your clan or ours?. *Oxford American*, 24–30.
- Rutherford, A. (2009). *Engaging the Scottish diaspora: Rationale, benefits and challenges*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.
- Scottish Executive. (2004). *New Scots: Attracting fresh talent to meet the challenge of growth*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.
- Scottish Executive. (2006). *Scotland's strategy for stronger engagement with the USA*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.
- Scottish Government. (2010). *Analysis report of Homecoming Scotland 2009: Diaspora events*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.
- Shuval, J. (2000). Diaspora migration: Definitional ambiguities and a theoretical paradigm. *International Migration*, 38(5), 41–56.
- Sim, D. (2011a). *American Scots: The Scottish diaspora and the USA*. Edinburgh: Dunedin.
- Sim, D. (2011b). The Scottish community and Scottish organisations on Merseyside: Development and decline of a diaspora. *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies*, 31(1), 99–118.
- Sim, D., & Leith, M. S. (2014). Scottish diasporic identities in the Netherlands. *National Identities*, 16(2), 139–155.
- Skey, M. (2012). 'Sod them, I'm English': The changing status of the "majority" English in post-devolution Britain. *Ethnicities*, 12(1), 106–125.
- Sullivan, K. (2009). A diaspora of descendants? Contemporary Caledonian Society members in Melbourne, Australia – A case study. In J. Fernandez (Ed.), *Diasporas: Critical and interdisciplinary perspectives* (pp. 127–138). Oxford: Inter-Disciplinary Press.
- White, P. (2003). Not just rugby clubs: Scottish- and Welsh-born migrants in London. *Scottish Geographical Journal*, 119(3), 209–227.