

Reviews of Books

A SHORT HISTORY OF FRANCE FROM CAESAR'S INVASION TO THE BATTLE OF WATERLOO. By Mary Duclaux (A. Mary F. Robinson). Pp. 350. 8vo. London: Fisher Unwin. 1918. 10s. 6d. net.

It is no small feat to condense the history of a country like France into 350 pages of fairly large type, but the practised pen of Madame Duclaux has accomplished it in a way which will satisfy most readers who desire to get a bird's-eye view of the origin, rise, and progress of a country with whom we are at present so intimately associated, and which we are learning to appreciate more and more every day. The author fully recognises the difficulty of her work, but she has aimed more at giving a general and complete impression than to enter into detail (which in a book of the kind is impossible), and to leave, as she says in her preface, the distance in mass, while the figures nearer our own times stand out in fuller relief. It may be said that this system necessarily involves a certain lack of the sense of proportion, and we find that more than half of the volume is taken up with incidents occurring between 1774 and 1815. Now this period was of course a most important and interesting one in the history not of France only but of the world, but it is just the one which the ordinary person, 'the man in the street,' with a taste for history knows perhaps better than any other. There is no lack of literature dealing with the days of the Revolution and the career of Napoleon, and it is conceivable that some readers will regret that a portion of the space devoted to these latter times was not used for the delineation of the history of more mediaeval France and the brilliant and fascinating period of the *Grand Monarque*.

But this is not to say that Madame Duclaux has not written a delightful book, characterised by lightness of touch, brilliance of diction, and sanity of outlook. How true her estimate of Catherine dei Medici: that she was no bigoted Catholic, although the inspirer of the massacre of St. Bartholomew, but merely an unfanatical Italian. She was indeed an opportunist, and if her lines had been cast in other places she would probably have turned out a very different woman. Had she, for instance, married our own James V., as at one time was suggested, she might have turned out a faithful supporter of John Knox!

It is not only in dealing with history proper that this book is so attractive. The chapters on the French language, Chivalry, and the Renaissance, short though they be, are full of charm as excellent literature; and the sections on the Roman Tradition and Feudal Society are admirable summaries of the conditions prevalent in the times dealt with. It is hardly however

350 Morris: Burghal Administration in Scotland

consistent to say on one page, in regard to the relations between Gaul and Rome, that 'the Gallo-Roman cities sent delegates to the metropolis, who voted there on questions of War and State and Empire on the same terms as other Roman citizens,' and on another that 'although the cities of the provinces were extraordinarily free and prosperous, they had no voice in the administration of the Empire: Rome alone governed Rome.' As a matter of fact, Augustus took away from Gallic burgesses even the right of candidature for magistracies, and at the same time excluded them from the Imperial Senate.

As a whole this volume is an excellent summary of French history, and deserves to be widely read.

JAMES BALFOUR PAUL.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF BURGHAL ADMINISTRATION IN SCOTLAND. By David B. Morris. Pp. 16. 8vo. Edinburgh and Glasgow: William Hodge & Co. 1917.

ALTHOUGH the rise and development of Scottish burghs and burghal institutions are wide subjects, Mr. Morris in this paper gives a very useful summary of the early history of royal burghs, of their governing bodies and the struggle of the crafts to be represented on them, their taxation and parliamentary representation, often giving illustrations from the history of Stirling. He also notes the chief differences in Scottish and English burghal development.

Mr. Morris does not distinguish clearly between the taxation paid to the king and the dues—rents, issues of court, petty customs—which the burgesses acquired when feu-farm charters were granted in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. He says that the burgesses performed watching and warding, but he does not point out that they were also liable for service with the host.

There is little, if any, proof of the existence of an association of burghs in the north. Dr. Gross thinks that 'anse,' in the charter of William the Lion, probably refers to a general grant of a gild merchant, or right to impose 'hanse' tribute on merchants. There is no evidence that the Great Council, before the War of Independence, included representatives of the burgesses, nor were they invariably present in parliaments even after 1326.

Mr. Morris's references to nineteenth century history are interesting and useful. He accounts for the number of separate bodies which were set up in Scottish towns for different purposes by the distrust inspired by the town councils before the Burgh Reform Act of 1833; and shows how, in some places, the Burgh Police Acts were administered by bodies different from town councils, a needless duplication of authorities not put an end to till 1900. He also speaks of the common practice of obtaining private Acts of Parliament, often for performing functions for which he considers the burghs already possess the right at common law. Such independence might give rise to interesting experiments in municipal administration. It is not, of course, possible in a short paper to touch on all points, but it would have been interesting if Mr. Morris had said something about the functions of the burgh court, a question on which he must be well fitted to speak.

THEODORA KEITH.

SOCIAL LIFE IN BRITAIN FROM THE CONQUEST TO THE REFORMATION.

Compiled by G. G. Coulton. Pp. xvi, 540. 8vo. With Frontispiece and four Plates. Cambridge: The University Press. 1918.

MR. COULTON, favourably known by his *Medieval Garner* and his *Chaucer and his England*, continues in this book to present to students that background of social history without which knowledge of our forefathers must lack intelligence and sympathy. He has gathered from Latin, Old French, and English originals, illustrations of whatever men have done and been and suffered through four centuries, and he has arranged his *farrago* in fifteen sections so various that they seem to be all medieval mankind's epitome. To name but three sections, Birth and Nurture, Wayfaring and Foreign Travel, Superstitions and Marvels, shows how widely he has cast his net. For minds which are prone to be the prey of the 'viewy' historian, this book will be a whetstone of wit to sharpen the critical faculty. If teachers would give their days and nights to its study and to a realisation of its conception of history, more good would be done to schools than from Education Bills. Let no schoolmaster teach *The Merchant of Venice* or explain Shylock until he has some such knowledge as Mr. Coulton has garnered for him on the medieval view of usury. The book is the work of one who believes in Bacon's 'dry light.' Its compiler sees the ages of faith without romantic iridescence: he talks in the gate with Cardinal Gasquet on the manumission of serfs, and as frankly with those who hold all crusaders to have been as high-souled as Saint Louis.

It would be an error to suggest, however, that the book will interest only students or schoolmasters. Mr. Coulton's extracts show the minds of medieval men as concerned with thoughts not alien to the minds of to-day. He tells how Coventry rationed bread in 1520, how London of the past checked profiteering, how the Bolsheviks of the twelfth century fared, how Etienne Marcel had his glimpse of a league of nations in 1357, how William of Ockham, heedless of Saint Paul, argued that no council, not even of the Church, could be regarded as representative unless it included women, and how a wandering mason, faring from Hungary, thanked God for the beauty of the cathedral windows at Reims. It is a book for evenings in town and wet days in the country, for youth and age, the specialist and the mere reader; it is, in brief, a delectable book.

STEWART A. ROBERTSON.

JAPAN: THE RISE OF A MODERN POWER. By Robert P. Porter.

With ten Illustrations. Pp. xii, 361. Demy 8vo. Oxford: The Clarendon Press. 1918. 5s. net.

THE story of the way in which the Japanese people suddenly grafted Western civilisation on to their own purely Oriental culture must always be a fascinating one, and we are glad to read the excellent account in this book, where the historical sequence is followed with care and an admirable sense of proportion. It tells how the primeval Imperial dynasty fell into the hands of the Clans and the Shoguns, of the veneer of Chinese culture which spread over the Court, and of the early martial successes.

We note that the Mongol invasion failed, and that Japan has been one of the few unconquered countries. Then came the Portuguese and Spanish intercourse and missions, successful Christian propaganda, until it looked as if Christianity might become the accepted Japanese religion. The zeal of the converts went too far, however, and provoked reaction first and then fierce prosecution. The result was that, except for meagre trade with the Protestant Dutch, Japan remained a 'closed country' from 1636 to 1853. The author does not think the thought of the country remained stagnant however, but that in spite of the antiquated setting it continued vigorous enough, and when American influences opened the country the native education was quite sufficient to allow the Japanese to absorb the use of every western item of material superiority, while by no means inducing them to give up their native culture and modes of thought. This was shown in the constitutional changes, when the Shoguns fell, the semi-divine Emperor came into his own again and gave the country a constitution. We are led clearly through the period of utilitarian progress, increase of armaments, and military success, first over the reactionary Chinese, then, when German intrigue had forced on the war, over Russia, whose feet of clay showed already. In the war the Japanese have assisted the Allies greatly and far more than is realised, on account of their continual naval co-operation.

A. FRANCIS STEUART.

DUMBARTON CASTLE: ITS PLACE IN THE GENERAL HISTORY OF SCOTLAND, FORMING PART I. OF A REVISED HISTORY OF DUMBARTONSHIRE, by John Irving. Pp. 147. Quarto. Bennett & Thomson, Dumbarton, 1917. 15s. net.

NOTHING supersedes in completeness and care the late Joseph Irving's *History of Dumbartonshire* (1857) and its subsequent and fuller edition in 3 volumes, *The Book of Dumbartonshire* (1879). Both are long out of print, and difficult to procure. The author of the present volume, which is the first of a series, and deals with *Dumbarton Castle* alone, is Mr. John Irving, a son of the original Joseph; and the mantle of the father has worthily fallen on the son, who inherits the archæological zeal of his parent, as well as his grace of literary expression.

Mr. John Irving owns his indebtedness to his father's volumes, which indeed are the basis of the present work. The material is condensed, rearranged, corrected and supplemented where recent research has shown it to be necessary. And this book collects into one whole the scattered history of the Castle spread over the earlier volumes.

The father's *History*, excellent as it is, is not chronological, and it requires some digging to get the connected story. Here all that is known of Dumbarton Castle is presented in the 137 pages of print and appendices—a concise and admirable account of the famous Rock.

Mr. John Irving's next two volumes will deal with the General History of the County as now constituted, and the Industries of the County. The recent industrial developments in the Leven and Clyde Valleys open a new

and interesting field of study to a generation that knew not the earlier Joseph.

Mr. Irving shatters two myths, if not three : the authenticity of the Wallace Sword, which formerly belonged to Dumbarton, now at Abbey Craig, Stirling—where it may remain with its spurious pedigree ; the idea that under the *Act of Union* Dumbarton Castle must always be a military centre ; and the cherished belief that the song *Dumbarton's drums beat bonnie O*, is a reminiscence of the Rock when a gay military stronghold of later date, whereas it is stated by both father and son to have had its origin in the time of that covenanting persecutor, Lord George Douglas, 1st Earl of Dumbarton (1636–1692). Scott favours this view in *Waverley*, chap. 34. But it might equally well be due to the admiration bestowed by the fair sex on the Dumbarton Fencibles of 1689. It is a lady's love song pure and simple. It appears in Ramsay's collection of 1724. The name of the author is not known, and Allan Cunningham quotes it in full in his *Songs of Scotland* (1825). It has always been a famous marching tune.

Burns remarks that '*Dumbarton Drums* is the last of the West Highland airs ; and from Dumbarton over the whole tract of country to the confines of Tweedside, there is hardly a tune or song that one can say has taken its origin from any place or transaction in that part of Scotland.' But is Burns right? What about the *Bonnie, Bonnie Banks of Loch Lomond* ?

P. J. B.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE SOCIETY OF ANTIQUARIES OF SCOTLAND, Session 1916-17. Vol. LI. Pp. xxxii, 266, with 121 Illustrations. 4to. Edinburgh : printed for the Society by Neill & Co. 1917.

THIS volume is noteworthy on account of Mr. James Curle's masterly paper on 'Terra Sigillata : Some Typical Decorated Bowls,' in which he continues and amplifies the study of these bowls contained in his volume on *A Roman Frontier Fort and its People : the Fort of Newstead in the Parish of Melrose*. The subject is treated comparatively as well as historically, and many of the types are illustrated.

Mr. Hugh Fraser investigates the artificial island in Loch Kinellan, Strathpeffer, and to this paper Professor Bryce and Mr. Alexander Curle add notes on the bones and the pottery found in the island.

Mr. Robert Scott Moncrieff gives an account of three tapestry hangings which were inventoried among the belongings of Mary of Guise and of Mary Queen of Scots. Probably they hung on the walls of Edinburgh Castle in Queen Mary's day, and after various hazardous wanderings they are now in Mr. Scott Moncrieff's possession in Edinburgh.

Sir Herbert Maxwell's note on the Missing Third Stone of the Crosses of Kirkmadrine is not only interesting in itself, but shows how many more articles of historical value might be preserved if local enthusiasm in historical matters is aroused.

The volume is full of interest, and the Society is to be congratulated on having made such an excellent beginning of the fifth series in the new form adopted two years ago.

354 The Book of the Old Edinburgh Club

THE BOOK OF THE OLD EDINBURGH CLUB. Ninth Volume. Pp. viii, 240-25. 4to. With 5 Illustrations. Edinburgh: printed by T. & A. Constable for the Members of the Club. 1916. Issued May, 1918.

THE ninth volume of the Old Edinburgh Club contains five papers, of which two are notable contributions by Mr. R. K. Hannay, whose studies in Scottish history during recent years have thrown light on many shadowed places.

Mr. Hannay's contributions are entitled 'Incidents and Documents, A.D. 1513-1523,' and 'Shipping and the Staple, A.D. 1525-1531.' The papers complement each other, and deal with incidents in Edinburgh and Leith during the minority of James V., which are revealed in the still unprinted minutes of the Lords of Council, entitled 'Acts of the Scottish Council.' We read of four armed men being appointed to attend the Provost of Edinburgh in 1520 'for stanching of inconvenientis that may happin within this toun this troublis tyme,' and at Leith the skippers were opposing claims made by the Carmelite Church of Bruges for quota in connection with the staple. The captain of the 'Martin' did not confine himself to peaceful methods, for 'the Martyne has takin ane merchant schip of Holland full of merchandys and brocht her to the havin and port of Leith; howbeit thar is na weir betwix us and Holland.' In revenge, the 'Christopher' of Leith was 'masterfullie reft and spulzeit be certane Hollandaris.' Mr. Hannay has fully illustrated some of the difficulties that surrounded the question of the staple in the hard days that followed Flodden.

Mr. Guy's account of Edinburgh engravers is very useful as well as interesting. The list of names is a long one, and includes many who are but seldom remembered. Mr. John A. Fairley continues his extracts from the original records of the Old Tolbooth for the year 1684, and the volume closes with an excellent paper on the 'Sedan Chair in Edinburgh' by Mr. James H. Jamieson, which not only deals with these chairs, but illustrates life in Edinburgh streets for the hundred and fifty years in which the Sedan reigned.

THE GREAT EUROPEAN TREATIES OF THE NINETEENTH CENTURY.

Edited by Sir Augustus Oakes, C.B., lately of the Foreign Office, and R. B. Mowat, M.A., Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Oxford. Pp. ix, 403. 8vo. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1918. 7s. 6d. net.

Books upon peace are the natural outcome of a state of war, and as 'the substantial basis on which international law rests is the usage and practice of nations' it is essential to have correct information as to 'the facts from which that usage and practice are to be deduced.' Thus, in an able introduction, Sir H. Erle Richards sets forth the purpose of the book, which gives the text of most of the great treaties of the nineteenth century. It is, however, no mere catalogue. Starting from that great but rather empiric settlement of Europe, the Congress Treaty of Vienna, the authors show the genesis and development of the main international problems which arose, and so work naturally to the treaty or treaties by which each

question was settled. The Independence of Belgium, the 'Danish Duchies,' the problem of the Near East, these, and every other imbroglia development, from the liberation of Greece to the Triple Alliance, are admirably treated in the clear, compact chapters by which the texts of the various treaties are introduced. Thus the book, despite a necessary departure from chronological order, preserves a wonderful unity, and—as was inevitable, perhaps—one of the guiding threads which runs through narrative and text alike is the steady rise of Prussia. There may be a certain amount of *ex parte* statement in a book produced under the aegis of the Foreign Office, but the plain text of the treaties, coupled with the actual march of events, is sufficient to establish the essential honesty of British policy, although the 'Balance of Power' was rather a fetish.

Except for an excellent chapter on the 'Technical Aspect of Treaty Making,' the authors make no claim of producing anything new, but none the less the average reader will find that a close study of the actual text of the treaties often involves a re-orientation of his ideas. A thorough examination of the Congress Treaty of Vienna, for example, sheds a surprising light on the Prussian design upon Germany; one is astonished, again, by the number of occasions upon which Great Britain, France and Russia have acted jointly in the interests of peace. Another fact which is brought into great prominence is the almost universal desire for peace produced by the stormy wars of the Napoleonic period. Will history repeat itself in that matter?

From a philosophic point of view the book is unsatisfying. A collection of treaties such as this can hardly be regarded only as the material from which one must deduce the facts as to 'the usage and practice of nations.' The practice of nations in making these treaties must have been based on something more than antecedent custom, or the world would be making no progress.

The authors are very guarded, but here and there they seem to acknowledge the existence of some moral code which governs international relations. When they tell us¹ that 'if by her subsequent conduct in the community of European states, Turkey should justify her position there, neither Russia nor any other Power would have a *moral right* to expropriate her,' they admit explicitly what is hinted at in several other places.² What constitutes a moral right? Even in this most pragmatic age one cannot utterly avoid the ethical question.

The book, however, does not affect to discuss the eternal riddle, and its merits are outstanding. It gives a clear record of what has actually been accomplished in the way of treaty-making, and apart from the information it supplies on several knotty points of present-day politics—the Salonica landing, for instance, and the 'Conversations' of 1906 about Belgium—it is of permanent value. It is a book to be studied not only by all historians, but by all politicians, especially by those who write to the press upon that 'League of Nations' so fashionable, but so vague.

J. DUNCAN MACKIE.

¹ p. 164.

² 246 n.

356 Jastrow: The War and the Bagdad Railway

THE WAR AND THE BAGDAD RAILWAY. The Story of Asia Minor and its Relation to the Present Conflict. By Morris Jastrow, LL.D. Pp. vi, 160. Post 8vo. Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Co. 1917. 6s. net.

It is to be regretted that the writer of this book has dedicated more than half of it to the ancient history of Asia Minor and to the Hittites who played such a considerable part in it, for though a sketch of the history would have been very proper, this is quite out of proportion. He holds that Asia Minor has always been 'the bridge leading to the East,' and this may be true, but he would have been better in a book of this kind to begin with the Greek colonies and the Roman conquest there, or the *drang nach Osten* of the Crusades, avoiding the earlier and more nebulous empires of antiquity. The account, on the other hand, of the German acquisition of the Bagdad railway and its consequences is well worth having and might have been much more extensive. We welcome too the speculations by the writer of what will happen 'after the war' to Asia Minor, which, he points out, is full of unexplored riches.

Dr. George Macdonald has contributed to the Society of Antiquaries, London, an important biographical monograph on 'General William Roy and his *Military Antiquities of the Romans in North Britain*.' Alexander Gordon's *Itinerarium*, famous in itself as a pioneer work on that field, was of yet wider fame as reflected in the Queensferry adventures of the Laird of Monkbarne; and the present reviewer recalls with amusement the dismay with which some five and twenty years ago in the dawn of his Romano-Caledonian enthusiasm he had the edge of some of that enthusiasm turned when on making the acquaintance of that worthy and exact antiquary, Dr. James Macdonald, he discovered that there were sides to 'Sandy Gordon,' as regards his motives and methods, not wholly satisfactory to archaeological scrutiny. It is pleasant to find that Dr. George Macdonald, writing on General Roy (a native of Carlisle, born 1726, died 1790), has not the need his father had to be censorious. Minute enquiries into Roy's career as civilian engineer and soldier show that he was as an antiquary remarkably true to his high ideals of military and archaeological research. In spite of inevitable shortcomings, such as his falling a victim to the bogus *De Situ Britanniae*, he well earned for his posthumously published maps, plans and treatise their place of permanent praise for historical illumination when, as a legacy to the London Society of Antiquaries, the work came out in 1793. The commendation implied by the present solid, industrious and informing monograph of seventy quarto pages is not merely a large and critical addition to biographical knowledge; in its homage to one of the most eminent and thorough of his predecessors, it is Dr. Macdonald's tribute at once weighty and graceful to the personal worth, archaeological sagacity and patient military draughtsmanship of a very considerable Scot.

Viscount Bryce's suggestive and inspiring presidential address to the British Academy, *The Next Thirty Years* (Milford: Oxford University Press. Pp. 30. 1s. net), evidently had as its background Bacon's eloquent

resumé on the advancement of learning. Like Bacon he takes all knowledge for his province of survey. What old questions have we answered, he asks, what problems remain? Most interesting are the historical, legal, and political sections, in which some current discussions are registered and a few are docketed as settled. He reckons the Homeric genesis as tending to a unity of compromise, Ossian as still dead, and the *King's Quair*¹ as conclusively by James First. Some more modern debates are not put on the scales, such as the genesis of tragedy and of coinage, the meaning of Troy, the palisade at Hastings, the essence of Magna Carta, the feuds of Round and Freeman and Freeman and Froude. Broader issues are ignored also, such as Darwinism under revision, Spiritualism recrudescent even among sober archaeologists, and the balance between new research and the summation of old facts as objectives of historical education. And are there no Shakespeare conundrums?

Notes and Queries for Somerset and Dorset may be congratulated on concluding its fifteenth volume and thirtieth year with increasing credit. A neat, bright and varied antiquarian repertory, it makes head steadily, despite an adverse time. Centred, of course, on local archaeology, its contributions from records have always proved a specialty. Recently there was given an important document for British history in a charter by Queen Elizabeth to Thomas Gregorie of Taunton in 1592 for a society of traders to and from the coasts of Guinea. Well indexed and illustrated, the little periodical has more than local claim to an extended circulation.

In the *Juridical Review* for March Mr. W. Roughead surveys lightly the general course of judicial activities of Lord Braxfield, a rare portrait of whom by Raeburn is reproduced from an engraving made in 1798. Mr. H. H. Brown writes on the Old Scots Law of Blasphemy.

The number of the *Revue Historique* for May-June contains a sketch of Armenian residents in France from the twelfth to the eighteenth century by M. Mathorez, who is devoting himself to a series of studies of the foreign elements in French life throughout the centuries. M. Henri Malo contributes an account of the corsair Thurot, whose ineffectual descent on Carrickfergus in 1759-1760 was one of the minor episodes of the Seven Years' War. He has confined himself to French sources, but his article will interest students of Irish history who have access to the Harcourt Papers and other collections of the period. It may be noted that Thurot received secret instructions to spare Scotland, and that when he arrived after an unfortunate voyage off the north coast of Islay, he used every effort to carry them into effect. 'Lorsque les trois frégates,' writes M. Malo, 'se représentent deux jours plus tard à la côte nord-est d'Islay, sous pavillon anglaise, le *Belle-Isle* fait tellement d'eau qu'il faut sans arrêt manœuvrer deux pompes, et parfois les six. Deux habitants de l'île, Macneil et Macdonald, se figurant être en présence de navires anglais

¹ As regards this last point, we understand that Mr. J. T. T. Brown proposes a rejoinder to his critics.

en quête de pilote, montent à bord. Ils trouvent Thurot à table en compagnie d'une douzaine d'officiers. Macdonald annonce la dérouté de Conflans aux Cardinaux (20-21 novembre). Thurot refuse d'y croire: l'Écossais sort une gazette de sa poche 'Tous baissent la tête; couteaux et fourchettes leur tombent des mains.' A quoi bon, dès lors, leur expédition?

'Le lendemain, au conseil, tous, sauf deux, émettent l'avis de piller, brûler et ravager Islay. Thurot s'y oppose avec violence, et ne vainc les résistances qu'en produisant l'article de son instruction secrète interdisant tout acte d'hostilité contre l'Écosse. Il oblige un officier, qui la veille a pillé un navire de farine, à signer au maître de ce navire un billet à ordre de cinquante et une guinées. D'accord avec les habitants, il débarque 200 hommes pour charger des provisions qu'il paie comptant. A peine à terre, ces malheureux déracinent avec leurs baionnettes les premières herbes qu'ils trouvent et, tombant sur un champ de pommes de terre, les arrachent, les essuient à leurs vêtements, et les dévorent crues.

'Mais un pays pauvre comme celui-là offre peu de ressources; il faut quitter. La ration de pain descend à trois onces par jour. Un nouveau conseil se montre partisan du retour en France immédiat par le canal Saint-Georges.'

M. Joseph Reinach prints the first instalment of *L'offensive de la Somme*.

The *Bulletin Historique* is devoted to an estimate by M. Bémont of recent works on British history, including Howarth's *Golden Days of the Early English Church*, which raises the interesting question of the extent to which an English historian is entitled to assume a knowledge of continental history on the part of his readers. Miss Levett's *The Black Death* is very highly praised as 'un modèle à proposer aux érudits qui voudraient s'y aventurer à leur tour.' An analysis of recent Italian historical reviews merits attention, and M. Pfister contributes a short estimate of the work of M. Vidal de la Blache, whose recent death will be regretted by every student of Lavisse.

The most interesting feature of the March-April number of the *Revue Historique* is a detailed study by M. Bourrilly of the campaign of Charles V. in Province in 1536. The article by M. Bourrilly, who is known to students as the author of a number of interesting monographs on the period, is a further indication of the keen contemporary interest in the events which preceded the melancholy years of the French religious wars. M. Tricoche deals with the battle of Bushy Run of August, 1763, which he invests with importance as a critical point in the French Canadian wars. The *Bulletin Historique* contains an illuminating estimate of the import of M. Brémond's *Histoire littéraire du sentiment religieux en France* from the somewhat unsympathetic pen of M. Hauser, who also deals with the *Mémoires* of the Cardinal de Richelieu. The number also contains reviews of the treatise of M. Pierre Roussel on *Délos colonie athénienne*, and of M. Mâla's *L'Art allemand et l'art français du moyen âge*.

Communications

TESTE ME IPSO. Mr. David Baird's Smith's valuable communication in the April number of this *Review* (*S.H.R.* xv. 265) raises afresh the disputed question as to when the formula *Teste me ipso* was first in use. He quotes the great authority of Léopold Delisle for the opinion that the number of charters of Henry II. in which the formula occurs is too large and the sources from which they are derived too various to justify the conclusion that they are the work of forgers. Now the number, as he says, is nine, and it may be convenient to tabulate them, with notes of identification,¹ and with the dates of the transcripts in which they are preserved. I add brief comments which I take from Delisle himself and from Mr. Round and Professor Haskins, our two chief living guides for the study of Anglo-Norman charters.

1. Saint-Évroul [c. 1158]. No. 60, *Recueil*, lxxix. Transcript of 13th cent. 'Le copiste n'avait guère souci des formules,' Delisle, *Rec.* intr. p. 287.
2. Blanchelande [1156-9]. No. 84, *Recueil*, cxix. Transcript of 14th cent. 'C'est un acte faux ou tout au moins falsifié,' Delisle, *Rec.* i. 224; cf. intr. p. 294. 'Clearly untrustworthy in this form,' Round, *Calendar of Documents preserved in France*, p. 311, note 11.
3. Saint-Évroul [1156-1162]. No. 141, *Recueil*, ccxiv. Transcript of 13th cent. 'Suspicious in form,' Haskins, *Norman Institutions*, p. 218; with a note, 'This charter combines the king's style of the latter half of the reign with a witness who cannot be later than 1162, and contains the suspicious phrase *teste me ipso* which appears in two other fabrications of this period from Saint-Évroul (Delisle, Nos. 347, 362).'
4. Équeurdreville [unknown date]. No. 214, *Recueil*, cccxl. Transcript of 15th cent.
- 5, 6. Saint-Évroul [1172-8]. Nos. 347, 362. Transcripts of 13th cent. 'Sinon absolument fausses, du moins entachées de très graves altérations,' Delisle, *Rec.*, intr. p. 316; 'très suspectes,' p. 317. Mr. Round has 'the gravest doubt' of their authenticity, *Calendar*, p. 223, note 3.

¹The numbers are those of Delisle's original collection, to which I have appended the numbers in his *Recueil* so far as it is published.

360 Robert Freebairn : The Pretender's Printer

7. Cluny [c. 1178]. No. 367. Transcript of 13th cent. (*Chartes de Cluny*, ed. A. Bruel, v. 613.)
8. Grammont [1185-89]. No. 491. Transcript of 13th cent. The number of suspicious charters of Henry II. and Richard I. for the order of Grammont is considerable: see Delisle, *Recueil*, intr. pp. 296-303. In 1259 the prior of Grammont was imprisoned for forgery.
9. Robert Marmion [unknown date.] No. 509. Transcript of the 14th cent.

It should be added that more than 300 charters of Henry II. are preserved in the originals, and not one of them contains the formula *Teste me ipso*.

REGINALD L. POOLE.

ROBERT FREEBAIRN: THE PRETENDER'S PRINTER. With reference to the Rev. W. J. Couper's article in the January number of *S.H.R.*, it may be of interest to note that the title-page of *An Essay on Ways and Means for Planting, &c., Scotland*, written by Brigadier William Mackintosh of Borlum, the well-known Jacobite leader in 1715, in the second year of his confinement in Edinburgh Castle, bears that the book was 'Printed and Sold at Mr. Freebairn's Shop in the Parliament Closs . . . 1729.' The Brigadier and Freebairn in 1729 probably renewed an acquaintance begun when both were with Mar in 1715.

A. M. MACKINTOSH.