

## Reviews of Books

MISCELLANY OF THE SCOTTISH HISTORY SOCIETY. Third Volume. Pp. vi, 343, 11, 16, 8. Demy 8vo. Edinburgh: Printed for the Society by T. & A. Constable. 1919.

THE first article in this most interesting collection consists of the records of courts-martial held at Dundee from 17th September, 1651, to 10th January, 1652, during the occupation of the town by General Monk's army, edited by Godfrey Davies, M.A. The Records themselves are preserved in volume xxi. of the Clarke MSS. in Worcester College, Oxford. Dundee fell on 1st September, 1651, to a force composed of cavalry, sailors, and the regiments of Monk and Ashfeild, after an assault lasting only a few hours, but with a loss of some 800 of all ages and sexes. After a preliminary plunder of the town, in the course of which the English army got £200,000 in money and valuables as booty, the garrisoning of the place and the establishment of martial law pursued their ordinary course; and these Records of some twenty courts-martial on soldiers and civilians give an excellent idea not only of military justice as it obtained in the Cromwellian armies, but of the methods employed in dealing with a civilian population whose opposition, though scotched, was not killed.

The military offences were mostly cases of assault on civilians, larceny, drunkenness and swearing; in only one case was the sentence of the court that the prisoner should be 'shotte to death,' though in one or two others it is difficult to see why the same sentence was not inflicted. On the other hand, for comparatively slight offences the punishments were extremely severe, judged by modern standards. 'Riding the wooden horse' was the commonest, and, aggravated as it was by the addition of weights, in the form of a couple of muskets, to the heels, must have been a most painful and embarrassing one. There were little touches of humour, too, in the methods of application which no doubt appealed to the rough humour of the time, *e.g.* hanging pint stoups round the neck of the convicted drunkard, and making him subsequently kneel and apologise for his crime. Flogging, running the gauntlet, the 'strapado,' or hanging a man up by his thumbs with only his toes on the ground, were other methods calculated to maintain discipline; and the evidence shows that officers and N.C.O.'s habitually struck men in the ranks; swearing was punished by gagging. The courts occasionally referred to the Mosaic books for enlightenment.

Of the cases against civilians, only one really serious one, that of an alleged spy, occurred. This was punished by death. Most offenders,

men and women alike, were flogged and expelled from the town; ducking was also inflicted on some of the women. The most interesting of the civilian cases was that which arose out of the refusal of the Countess of Airlie to have a troop billeted on her. This resulted in considerable damage to the property of the lady, and, incidentally, to the discovery of concealed arms.

*The Bishop of Galloway's Correspondence*, edited by William Douglas, consists of 18 letters, dated 1679-1685, and deals principally with ecclesiastical matters in that troubled diocese. James Atkine, Bishop of Galloway, formerly Bishop of Moray, lived in Edinburgh, 'it being thought unreasonable to oblige a reverend prelate of his years to live among such a rebellious and turbulent people,' and administered his diocese from there. Those were the days of the 'test' introduced by James, Duke of York; and there are frequent references to it in the correspondence. Three of the letters in 1685 are appeals from episcopal ministers for security from the visitations of 'parties of rebels sculking round and making inroads upon our borders,' and make mention of the assistance they had received from John Graham of Claverhouse and his brother.

*The Diary of Sir James Hope of Hopetoun*, edited by Sir James Balfour Paul, covers part of a rather commonplace life during the years 1646 to 1654. It is unfortunately incomplete at points where information might have been valuable. Born in 1614, Sir James was sixth son of Sir Thomas Hope of Craighall, the Lord Advocate, and was educated for the Bar. With his first wife, Anna Foulis, he acquired the considerable property of the lands and barony of Crawfordmuir in Lanarkshire, which included what is now known as the Leadhills. To the working of this estate, especially the 'leid mynes,' the laird of Hopetoun devoted much of his time, with success and profit. His family of fifteen children, all but three of whom died in early childhood, afforded him plenty of material as a diarist; and the description of their ailments and intimate details of their necropsies are an unusual feature of the work. He sat in the Scottish Parliament and was appointed a Lord of Session in 1649. Politically, as the editor shows, Hopetoun was a 'wobbler' and never really commanded the full confidence of either party. At first a Royalist, he was never quite sure where his interest lay. On one occasion, in 1651, the advice he tendered to Charles II. resulted in a brief imprisonment, and the following year he threw in his lot with the Parliamentary party. Unfortunately, details of his conversion do not appear in the *Diary*. In 1653 he was appointed by Cromwell a representative of Scotland in Barebone's Parliament, and he gives an interesting account of the dissolution of that body. He does not appear to have held any public position after that, but devoted himself to his estate, and died in 1661.

Dreams, of which he appears to have had many of great vividness, are frequently noted in the *Diary*.

It will probably never be known why, after all he had done for the position of his Church in Scotland, Patrick Graham, Archbishop of St. Andrews, was ruined judicially by those who owed him so much. In

the introduction to *The Instructions to John Herseman, Papal Nuncio, for the Trial of Patrick Graham, 1476*, Mr. Hannay opposes Buchanan's view that it was on account of his reforming zeal—on the contrary he was a Pope's man. The significance of his career was that it raised the question of interference with the appointments to prelaties, which was finally settled by severance from Rome. The 'Instructions' themselves are clearly intended to give him as fair a trial as possible—a point on which some historians hold a different opinion.

The 'distrest estate of the Kirk of Chryst' in France and elsewhere in the year following the Edict of Nantes, which its enemies were trying to render inoperative, aroused widespread sympathy in Scotland in 1622; and Dr. Hay Fleming has extracted from the receipts of M. Basnage, deputy of the General Assembly of Reformed Churches in France, and other sources, lists of individual contributions. Haddingtonshire subscribed £2305 Scots, made up of quite small sums from all classes; and St. Cuthbert's, Edinburgh, gave £800, the details of which are set out at length. In this connexion it is well to remember that the Lords of the High Commission circularised every diocese in the country.

*The Forbes Baron Court Book, 1659-1678*, is the third of the series which have now been published by the Society, and, like its predecessors, throws much light on the conditions of life in Scotland at the time. There is an admirable and instructive Introduction by Dr. Maitland Thomson, who shows how, as compared with earlier times, the Baron Courts in Scotland in the seventeenth century had ceased to exercise the powers formerly exercised by them. The right of pit and gallows had fallen into desuetude; and this, and other restrictions in the activities of these Courts, was probably largely due to the use by the Court of Session of the power of advocation, *i.e.* of removing any cause from any court and transferring it to the appropriate tribunal. The effects of Cromwell's institution of Baron Courts on the English model in 1654—although they never worked in the manner intended—resulted in the discontinuance of some of the old Baron Courts. Cromwell's institution was a small debts court, whereas the Forbes Court was more of the nature of a modern police court.

The book contains records of a large number of cases of all sorts, principally connected with the payment of rents, teinds, the performance of various obligatory duties on the barons' property, trespass and damage to woods, moors, crops, etc., and breaches of the peace. These last were extremely frequent, and must have been a source of considerable revenue to Lord Forbes.

There are references to non-payment of public dues, the cost of maintaining the militia, and the obligations of tenants to be in possession of weapons according to their position in life.

The value of the Introduction is greatly enhanced by a Glossary of archaic and provincial words.

The article is a valuable contribution to the social history of the time, and it is to be hoped that the series will be continued.

BRUCE SETON.

## Hume Brown: Surveys of Scottish History 237

SURVEYS OF SCOTTISH HISTORY. By P. Hume Brown, F.B.A., LL.D., Historiographer Royal for Scotland and Professor of Ancient Scottish History and Palæography, University of Edinburgh. Pp. xi, 192. Demy 8vo. Glasgow: James MacLehose & Sons. 1919. 7s. 6d. net.

THE recent publication of this volume of papers by the late Professor Hume Brown revives acutely the sense of loss which historical scholarship sustained in his death a little more than a year ago. They have been collected by Lord Haldane, who introduces them with a short but adequate appreciation of the life and character, and an estimate of the learning and achievements, of one who was his close friend for many years. There is still a further legacy to come from this rich inheritance in a life of Goethe—'whom the author looked upon as the greatest critic of life since Aristotle,'—which was far advanced at his death, and will doubtless be published shortly. In nothing that Professor Hume Brown has written do his learning and sound and sure judgment—which from the beginning have characterised his work—so admirably appear. His unrivalled knowledge of the sources of Scottish history, and particularly his researches in the records of the Scots Privy Council, never betrayed him into becoming a mere annalist, the easy pitfall of the too 'scientific historian,' and his wide culture in humane letters, native and foreign, saved his great *History of Scotland* from the faults of the romancer on the one hand, and the bias of the partisan on the other. Too much has been said in depreciation of his style, which was not naturally vivacious, but it is clear, adapted to its purpose and rises with the theme; and in these Surveys, several of which were introductory lectures to his class, or addresses on popular occasions, it is easy and very readable.

The book includes his inaugural address on 'Methods of Writing History' delivered on the founding of the Chair of History in Edinburgh University. In it he criticises the 'historic' method, and shows how a purely objective treatment is rendered impossible by the 'double veil' through which the historian must view past ages—'the veil of his own personality and that of the age to which he himself belongs'; but he shows how, nevertheless, 'in all of us there is the deposited impression of the national evolution of which we are the individual products, and it is precisely this impression that enables us to interpret the events and the characters of the nation to which we each belong.' 'It is certain that the history of any people can never be learned from books alone. Facts may be stated with perfect accuracy; the chain of cause and effect in the national development may be expounded with absolute clearness and precision; yet the informing spirit which produced the nation's ideals may wholly have eluded what may be a mere mechanical process. It is hardly too much to say, indeed, that half, and perhaps the better half, of our knowledge of our national history, is unconsciously learnt; and it is by this unconscious knowledge that we interpret what we deliberately acquire.' He therefore favours a view of the sources as objective as possible, checked by comparison with the history of the parallel institutions and events in other countries, and interpreted by the spirit of the age.

## 238 Hume Brown: Surveys of Scottish History

The ten other studies in this book on various epochs and aspects of Scottish history illumine many difficult periods by setting forth the ruling ideas which give meaning and coherence to the facts. They should be read by every lover of his country, and nowhere will one approaching the study of Scottish history for the first time find a more valuable introduction. For him, the greatest interest may be found in 'The Moulding of the Nation' and in 'Four Representative Documents,' which bring out clearly the great influence of religion in shaping the national destinies. But perhaps the most valuable results of this historical method are found in the studies dealing with the great part played for good by the turbulent Scottish nobles in the national history, the régime of the later Stewart Kings, and the Union of the Parliaments. All are enriched with spoil from the Privy Council records, and by setting the Scottish scene in true perspective with its contemporary European background. Other chapters deal with 'Scotland in the Eighteenth Century,' when in philosophy, science, literature and art, the genius of the nation came to flower, with the 'Intellectual Influences of Scotland on the Continent,' and with 'Literature and History,' in which the author concludes that 'it is in the literature of any period that we have the veritable expression of its spirit defeated by no distorting medium.' The volume closes with interesting sketches of the lives of 'Florence Wilson, A Forgotten Scholar of the Sixteenth Century,' and of 'Napier of Merchiston,' whose contemporary and European fame was first founded on a work on the Apocalypse, a striking instance of the state of rationalism in his day.

ROBERT LAMOND.

EUROPE AND THE LEAGUE OF NATIONS. By Charles Sarolea. Pp. vi, 317. Crown 8vo. London: G. Bell & Sons, Ltd. 1919. 6s. net.

THIS is an able work, written by one who has for many years made a close study of European politics. A native of Belgium, he has become practically one of ourselves, and yet at the same time is able to view the British position with a certain degree of impartiality, and to it he, it must be admitted, is not wholly favourable. For he is utterly opposed to the treaty recently concluded, to the conclusion of which this country contributed so large a share. 'It has,' he says, 'been the fashion for historians to sneer at the peace settlement of the Congress of Vienna. But compared to our provisional peace treaty, the Treaty of Vienna was a miracle of political wisdom; and certainly Alexander I., the Czar of all the Russias, proved more democratic than even President Wilson.' While condemning much, Dr. Sarolea is really an optimist, and is ever prepared to find good coming out of evil. He finds even in Lenin and his acolytes the true architects of the future, applying to them the words of Mephistopheles, 'they are the men that always will the evil and who ultimately always do the good.' The mujik 'is at last to come into his inheritance, and those downtrodden serfs who to-day are raiding or burning the castles of the German Baltic barons and the absentee Russian princes will eventually prove to be the steadying force of the new order.' To the question, Is a League of Nations possible and will it work? his answer appears to be in the affirmative. And yet a considerable portion of this book is devoted

to setting forth with great clearness and force the various obstacles which stand in the way of such a league. There are, to name some of them, military, naval, economic, biological, racial, and even religious difficulties to be overcome; indeed, the opponents of such a league might find in these pages much useful material wherewith to support their views. While convinced that the recent peace settlement is the worst that could have been devised, he at the same time admits that it is also 'the best that could have been made under the existing circumstances.' He is inclined to attribute its faults to the fact that it was the work of amateur diplomacy by party politicians. 'To endanger the future of the world in the interests of an ephemeral coalition . . . has been the tragedy of the Paris conference.' In the attack which he proceeds to make upon the influence and demands of the mob, the author surely overlooks the fact that a large section of it—what may be known as the Labour Party—seems to share his own views in favour of a generous dealing towards Germany and in condemnation of the blockade. But the chapter upon the limitations of Democracy is well worth reading in these days when this form of Government is sought to be identified with political perfection.

Dr. Sarolea considers that, for the peace of Europe, the best guarantee lies in the breaking up of Germany into small states, and its connection with Prussia being severed. He has a very poor opinion of the security afforded by the creation of Poland as a buffer state, looking to the mixed character of its population and the ease with which it can be invaded. There is an excellent sketch of Belgian history, Belgium being treated as the type of a composite nationality. But it is to be hoped that the author's description of the present position of his country is not warranted by the facts. On the contrary, recent reports would lead us to believe that Belgium is regaining its prosperity. He is in favour of a trial of the Kaiser as a means of ascertaining the truth, and as an 'impressive demonstration that international justice is henceforth a concrete reality.' This to be the note of the New League.

Dr. Sarolea, in looking forward to the future success of the League of Nations, evidently relies much upon American action. But since this book was published America has rather exhibited a disposition to abandon its interest in European affairs and return to its former state of isolation.

Upon the whole, it may be questioned whether the writer has succeeded in overcoming the obstacles which he has himself set forth to a successful establishment of this association of the nations.

W. G. SCOTT MONCRIEFF.

A SHORT HISTORY OF THE GREAT WAR. By A. F. Pollard, M.A., Litt. D., Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford, Professor of English History in the University of London. Pp. viii, 411. Crown 8vo. London: Methuen & Co. 1920. 10s. 6d. net.

MR. POLLARD'S History has not room to deal with the achievements of individual regiments. It deals with armies. But, in his hands, that does not lessen its attraction. It is an account of 'the broad and familiar features'

of the war. In a note the author hopes it may be a relief to a public 'distracted by the apologetic deluge which has followed on the peace' to find how little these features have been affected. His hope is justified. He is neither politician nor soldier, but an experienced historian trained to sift the essential from the superfluous, and master of the art of lucid and just narration. His work is condensed, but, for its purpose, complete; and condensation is so skilfully managed that the reader is insensible of it. Beside its firm and impartial structure the 'apologetic deluge' evaporates. One could hardly wish the story better told. We who lived through the war recall and confirm, with a better intelligence, as we read. And we read with ease and satisfaction, for arrangement and style are admirable. 'So such things should be.'

Mr. Pollard finds room for apt and illuminating criticism; for brief but clear and convincing discussion of the designs which brought about the war; the incidents of which its promoters made use; the objects of each important movement, and the reasons of its success or failure; the characters and fortunes of the leaders, political and military; the strategy, the tactics, the sometimes good, sometimes deplorable, staff work; the terrible tale of the battles; the enormous influence of mechanical and chemical science—hitherto not generally recognised—and the 'alphabet of annihilation' which the Allies had to learn in order to break the German lines.

The book throws light upon things still unsettled—Italy's claims, for example. If her sword was worth the Treaty of London of April, 1915, her help was limited to the prosecution of her own territorial ambitions, and she allowed German intrigue and Bolshevik propaganda to bring disaster to her armies. Again: for Mr. Pollard the war was virtually won in 1916, before the defection of Russia or the decision of the United States to take part, for Germany's success had reached its climax and the tide had turned, and Germany knew it and began to manoeuvre for peace. But Russia's shameful surrender was not only balanced by the American reinforcement. It removed an entanglement from the peace settlement. For, had the Russian empire survived, it would have claimed Constantinople, the Dardanelles, Poland and much territory on the Baltic, on the Black Sea and in the Balkans; and 'the great war of liberation would probably have resulted merely in the substitution of Russia for Germany as a greater menace to the independence of the little nations and the peace of the world.'

It has been said that no historian worth his salt, from Thucydides downwards, is without bias. If there is a trace of it in Mr. Pollard, it is only enough to add piquancy to his writing. It cannot impair his credit.

This history is well fitted to be a text-book, and has nineteen most useful maps and an ample index.

ANDREW MARSHALL.

ARCHAEOLOGIA AELIANA. Third Series. Vol. XVI. Pp. xxx, 229. 4to.

Printed for the Society of Antiquaries of Newcastle-upon-Tyne. 1919.

A GOOD variety distinguishes this volume for 1919. Mr. J. C. Hodgson describes the manor of Ovington on the Tyne, a Balliol holding, and traces the family descents from the forfeiture of John Balliol; edits letters

of Richard Neile (1562-1640), bishop of Durham from 1617 until 1627, and archbishop of York from 1632 until his death; and draws up a catalogue of Newcastle goldsmiths. The industrious vice-president has only one real rival as a contributor: this rival is Mr. C. H. Hunter Blair, whose editing of the late Canon Greenwell's catalogue of seals at Durham fills fifty pages of compact heraldic lore and biographical information. Scottish ecclesiologists will welcome the fact that the present instalment includes close upon a hundred Scottish ecclesiastical seals, episcopal and monastic. Noteworthy among these are: No. 3599, Bishop of Brechin (A.D. 1254); No. 3610, Bishop of Moray (A.D. 1204); No. 3616, Bishop of St. Andrews (A.D. 1167), No. 3631, Bishop of Whithorn, with a specially interesting *secretum* (A.D. 1248); No. 3659, Abbey of Dunfermline (A.D. 1200); No. 3678, Priory of St. Andrews (A.D. 1204); No. 3679, Priory of St. Andrews (A.D. 1207). There is probably nowhere else so wonderful a collection of Scottish church seals as that at Durham, and the critical industry devoted to the catalogue has been well spent toil, for which our Scottish fellow-students owe most hearty thanks to Mr. Blair.

Mr. John Oxberry offers some short editorial comments on the Diary of Major Sanderson in the year 1648, whereby to reconstitute, from a few itinerary notes, the major's personality in days when king's men and parliament men were in arms. Mr. Oxberry also contributes a notice of Richard Welford (1836-1919), a tireless antiquary, literary historian, and book-lover, of Newcastle, whose many books, pamphlets, and essays furnish a copious bibliography of the activities of a busy half-century. To some men it falls to win the affectionate regard of their fellow-workers, and Mr. Welford belonged to that happy class, as his bust in the public library attests.

Professor Allen Mawer discusses a handful of place names, bringing some light to bear on dark places. His readiness, *voce* Haltwhistle, to accept hybrids is, however, a bad principle. The note on Gamelspath is very unsatisfactory. As for Gateshead, why don't the philologists try to place it at the head of some prehistoric 'gait,' some offshoot of the Roman Way, instead of tethering it as Beda did to a most improbable goat?

GEO. NEILSON.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE ROYAL IRISH ACADEMY. Vol. XXXV. Sect. C. No. 9. H. J. Lawlor and R. I. Best. The Ancient List of the Coarbs of Patrick. Dublin: Hodges, Figgis & Co. Ltd. 1919. 1s.

IN these proceedings the object of the authors has been to present a list more perfect than has hitherto appeared, the earlier publication of Dr. Todd not containing a print of the Irish text, while that of Dr. Whitley Stokes, published in 1887, was not apparently taken from the ancient manuscript. Doubtless this new edition will prove satisfactory, and there is also a very valuable and learned discussion on the points raised by the list itself. The subject is of profound interest to students of the ancient Irish church.

W. G. SCOTT MONCRIEFF.



## 242 Mumford: Manchester Grammar School

THE MANCHESTER GRAMMAR SCHOOL, 1515-1915. A Regional Study of the Advancement of Learning in Manchester since the Reformation. By Alfred A. Mumford, M.D. Pp. xi, 563. With Nineteen Illustrations. London: Longmans, Green & Co. 1919. 21s. net.

THE object of this book may best be stated in the author's own words. It is an attempt 'to consider the way in which a collegiated ecclesiastical body established in the time of the Plantagenets; a Grammar School founded for 'godliness and good learning' in the time of the early Tudors; a town library established and well endowed during the Commonwealth; and a succession of Nonconformist academies, ultimately giving place to a provincial University in the latter half of the nineteenth century, have acted and reacted on each other, and have succeeded in arousing a zeal for truth, justice, and beauty, which has moderated the absorption in the purely self-regarding instincts, so readily fostered in a large commercial town.' Dr. Mumford approaches his subject from the point of view of the biologist rather than of the historian. For him the school is a living organism, the conditions of whose growth can be ascertained only by one who 'knows something of the soil which surrounds its roots or the circumstances of its early development, as well as the atmosphere which it breathes and the source whence it derives its stimulation.'

While, therefore, the school is his central theme, the author, as he traces its history from its foundation by Hugh Oldham in 1515 to the completion of its quatercentenary, studies its growth and explains its progress by constant reference to the great religious, industrial and international movements which throughout the four hundred years under review fundamentally affected English education. He shows us how its foundation was significant of the spirit of the sixteenth century, that period of rapid social and national transition, when the old learning of the Middle Ages was passing, owing to the rise of a middle class with new aspirations and conscious of new needs. He explains how the school, and the North of England generally, were affected by the spirit of the Elizabethan age and by the religious controversies of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries and by the widening of intellectual interests due to increasing wealth and the intercourse with foreign lands which followed in the train of international trade.

By the beginning of the nineteenth century it had lost touch with the most liberal and enterprising members of the merchant classes owing to its continued neglect of science and modern languages, and at the same time it was failing to provide training for the unprivileged industrial classes. In 1860 Mr. F. W. Walker was appointed High Master and at once set himself to create new ideals and traditions. Physics and Chemistry were introduced into the curriculum, and an attempt was made to stimulate the pupils to increased social activities. A new board of governors sanctioned by the Endowed Schools Commissioners in 1876 secured the representation of various public interests. New buildings were erected and a modern language department was created. Under Mr. Walker's successors the school made rapid progress. While constant attention was paid to cultural elements, new courses were introduced to meet the growing

demands of modern commercial and industrial life: occupational training was introduced: a medical officer was appointed, and more strict attention was paid to the physique of the pupils. At the same time through scholarships the school was thrown open to boys of all classes and creeds, and a successful attempt was made to break down the barriers of caste prejudice.

The book is a valuable addition to the history of education. It is a mine of information, a hard book to digest, all the more so because the subject-matter of the valuable appendices, extending to eighty-eight pages, are not included in the table of contents or in the index. The latter, though it extends to ten pages, is quite inadequate; but the mass of material makes a full index difficult. The book is well illustrated.

JOHN CLARK.

THE SONG OF ROLAND. Done into English in the Original Measure by Charles Scott Moncrieff. With an Introduction by G. K. Chesterton, and a Note on Technique by George Saintsbury. Pp. xxii, 131. 8vo. London: Chapman & Hall. 1919. 7s. 6d. net.

To translate an archaic piece well it is perhaps necessary for the translator to be steeped in the archaism, as, for instance, Dasent was in rendering Nial's *Saga*. But a poem is far harder to render than a prose story, and in the case of the *Song of Roland* to maintain the succession of assonances requisite to counterfeit the original measure is a trying experiment. Mr. Scott Moncrieff is not an archaeologist, and the prefatorial countenance shown him by Mr. Chesterton and Professor Saintsbury equally eschews the antiquities. The song without its archaeology is thus imperfectly presented, albeit a translation largely made in the trenches in France can set up stout defences.

One who has had the poem in his armoury for thirty years is apt to be impatient with literary exercises, more occupied with the experiment of form than with the epic feudalism of which the *Song of Roland* is so great, albeit so untechnical, an expression. As a translation in general this new version has decided merit; it is spirited, ambitious, dignified and readable. Doublets like Carle and Carlun (the latter usually and correctly as an accusative) are used for variants as in the original; the assonances are fairly well in hand and the line for line principle has its virtues. But fidelity is sacrificed very often. Some sort of archaeological scheme was necessary, but in this respect the translator is inconsistent. For instance, the curious epithet 'averse' applied to the pagans is not treated as a constant and technical term; the distinctive place of the horn raises the question whether the *graile* was not an absolute synonym; *perrun*, a rock or stone, can hardly be a terrace (as it afterwards became); recreancy in various forms is not treated as an incident of trial by battle; the feudal significance of commendation escapes notice; the 'hilt' of a spear is surely an uncommon name; 'culvert,' an untranslated transfer from French to English, badly needed a note; 'galleries' (line 2625) is an odd rendering of 'galies'; *adjurnée* (line 715) does not mean the 'day of doom.' Over all, however, Captain Scott Moncrieff has come through an ordeal of peril with considerable success. A simpler vocabulary would often have served better, e.g. lines 15, 511, 1467, although it must be owned that the

*Song of Roland* is not simple ; it is a deep poem, the religious orientation of which, with its piercing strain of high patriotic emotion, surprising at that early time, leaves one wondering how far M. Bedier's theories safely link it with the pilgrimage-cycles of romance. With an archaeological setting as good as the metrical, with a competent discussion of the date, place and origins of the poem, and with a historical analysis, which is perhaps the very first necessity, this rendering would excellently meet the requirements of an introduction of this great French poem into English literature. It is a task which Captain Scott Moncrieff may worthily make his goal for that second edition for which both literary and historical criticism can well afford to wait.

GEO. NEILSON.

ANNUAL REPORT OF THE AMERICAN HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR 1916. In Two Volumes. Vol. I. Pp. 507. Royal 8vo. Washington: 1919. Vol. II. Correspondence of Robert M. T. Hunter, 1826-1876. Pp. 383. Royal 8vo. Washington: 1918.

A GREAT sheaf of history is garnered in these yearly bulletins, which not only record the activities and conferences of the Association and its inter-connections, but also include solid contributions to research and criticism. The pieces thus embraced in the present two volumes typically mix the ancient and the modern in their themes. This refusal to recognise a dividing line between classic and current, between Byzantium, China of the eleventh century A.D. and the correspondence of a southern senator in the American Civil War, is justified by results: we turn to widely separated leaves of history thus brought together, and find them the better and more refreshing for the contact. Paul van den Ven's question on the origin of the Byzantine Empire and civilisation is a sustained argument for A.D. 326 for the beginning, as against Professor Bury's position that no Byzantine Empire ever began, and that the Roman Empire did not end till 1453. A further phase of the eastern problem is discussed by A. H. Lybyer in his essay on 'Constantinople as capital of the Ottoman Empire.' He treats the Turkish conquest as a very vigorous foundation, applauds the scholarship as well as the architecture of the city, and concludes that in many ways Turkish Constantinople has been great. A particularly interesting line of observation is taken about the Dardanelles. 'The trade routes,' says this critic, 'which cross at Constantinople are potentially among the very greatest in the world. There is probably no more pregnant phase of the great world war than the struggle of the water route through the Bosphorus against the land route between Berlin and Bagdad.' The supplementary study by Wallace Notestein on the quality of R. S. Gardiner as a historian adds several indications of insufficiently worked sources on the many unsolved problems of King and Commons in the Stuart period, and maintains, contrary to Gardiner's trend, that in 1628 and 1629 the Commons were not regaining old lost trenches but thrusting forward into new. Roland Usher too, who has been prominent in recent adverse scrutiny of Gardiner, writes a note insisting on the need for better study of the history of the common law in England. He declares that not its real history in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries,

but only the ideas about its history entertained by contemporaries, have passed into what is an erroneous legend. Also he urges the need of a re-edited text of the Commons' Journals. In 'Historic Ideals in Recent Politics,' Joseph Schafer presses the significance of the early colonising ardours, and seeks the source of American democracy as intertwined with the self-help requisite under frontier conditions. He considers that as regards the occupation of land the modern tendency is to approximate European conditions, albeit the Americans have not yet adjusted their views to tenantry. A. H. Shearer surveys bibliographically the historical periodicals of America, including that surprising item the *Magazine of History*, 1877-1893, 'out of which Mrs. Lamb is said to have made money.' The second volume consists mainly of letters written almost all before the war to R. M. T. Hunter, a secessionist Virginian senator who played respectably an insignificant part in affairs. A few letters of his own are in the collection, which is nearly silent on the convulsion of 1861-1866. He lived long enough to fall out with Jeff. Davis in 1877, and a year before he was projecting a life of John C. Calhoun. But his touch with political contemporaries, confederate or federal, never appears as either influential or dramatic.

**THE FAITH OF A SUBALTERN: Essays on Religion and Life.** By Alec de Candole, Lieutenant in the Wiltshire Regiment, killed in action September 1918. Pp. xi, 92, with Portrait. Crown 8vo. Cambridge: At the University Press. 1919. 2s. 6d. net.

THIS is a remarkable little book, and is of interest not only to theologians, but to students of history. It brings out clearly the points which have in the past divided the Church and its officers from a large proportion of the laity. And if the spirit which imbues these pages, and is the outcome of the war and all that it has meant, finds wide acceptance amongst leaders of thought, this book may mark a turning point in the history of the Church. It is of course only one of many works which denotes a revolt against the close clinging to tradition, and the magnifying of what seem to many the unimportant points in Christian teaching. But it is remarkable in its breadth of outlook and in the reverence with which it deals with points which have proved matter of controversy for two thousand years. Whether or not the future history of the Church will be affected seriously by the lessons of the last five years we cannot yet say; but few works have appeared which more clearly show the present tendencies and the possibilities of future development.

**CARNEGIE ENDOWMENT FOR INTERNATIONAL PEACE.** Preliminary Economic Studies of the War. Royal 8vo. London: Oxford University Press. 1919-20.

THESE statistics, collected as 'Preliminary Economic Studies of the War' and printed by the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, will be welcomed by historians. They are not all of equal value as they are of different dates. Two were printed before the Peace and so must necessarily be of a 'preliminary' character. One of these is that on Labour

## 246 Carnegie Endowment for International Peace

conditions and the other deals with 'Disabled Soldiers and Sailors.' Two deal with Britain alone in the aspects of her War Administration and the thorny question of 'Labor Conditions.' In the former the working of D.O.R.A. is contrasted with the 'defence' of the Kingdom under Queen Elizabeth, and Pitt's war legislation. The study on the Effects of the War on Agriculture in the U.S.A. and in Great Britain is specially valuable, for, as the Editor points out, 'never before in the history of War has the food question played so large a part as in the present World War.'

The most interesting of the series, however, is the account of the Direct and Indirect Costs of the War. Here one can read of the financial position of each country at its outset, and one is gratified to read that 'to anyone who doubts the responsibility of Germany for bringing on the War, a study of the financial measures prior to, and immediately following, the declaration of War, must bring conviction that it was carefully planned and provided for.'

BUCHANAN, THE SACRED BARD OF THE SCOTTISH HIGHLANDS: HIS CONFESSIONS AND HIS SPIRITUAL SONGS. With his Letters and a Sketch of his Life. By Lachlan Macbean. Pp. 224. Post 8vo. London: Simpkin, Marshall & Co. 1919. 5s. net.

THE Editor has supplied us with this book, as he felt that a metrical translation of the *Laidhe Spioradail* was wanted, and he gives it to us in not undignified English rhymed verse. He also contributes a short life of the writer. Dugald Buchanan was born in 1716 in Balquhider, his father being a miller at Ardoch. It is odd to find him so distinguished that at twelve years old he was made a family tutor. Then he came to Edinburgh, and after a period of gaiety became a carpenter and fell under the influence of George Whitefield, who preached in Scotland in 1742.

The Rising of the '45 touched him little, until his clansman the Laird of Arnprior was hanged, which was a crisis in his life. He threw himself into the movement for educating the Highlands and started a school at Balquhider. His school gradually got recognition, civilised the wild people, and did much good. He published his poems in 1767, and died a few months later. There was almost an armed conflict for his ashes, but his saintly character prevailed, and they were buried in the kirkyard of Little Leny of Balquhider. The book is a tribute to the memory of a great Gaelic writer.

Dr. W. P. Ker's studies in unstudied preparation for the Chair of Poetry at Oxford perhaps rarely found a happier platform from which to expound them than when he lectured at the Sorbonne last year on Sir Walter Scott. First printed in the *Anglo-French Review* (August 1919), this discursive criticism, notable for its many comparisons, has now been issued (MacLehose, Jackson & Co., 1919, pp. 28) as an independent publication. The subject was suggested by Sir Walter's visit at Paris in 1826 to the Odéon to see the opera of *Ivanhoe*, when he was struck with the strangeness of hearing words which at least recalled what he had dictated, in agony with spasms, at Abbotsford seven years before. Showing what Scott gained by giving

up verse for story-telling, Prof. Ker analyses his humorous dialogue, with a superb illustration in Dandie Dinmont's consultation with Counsellor Pleydell. There is emotion as well as grace in the lecturer's closing acknowledgment of the honour done in allowing him, as he styles it, 'to speak in Paris however unworthily of the greatness of Sir Walter Scott.' Professor Ker's selection for the Chair at Oxford has received wide approbation in England, and Scotland gratefully appreciates the choice.

Among publications by the British Academy, two papers have European themes. One by Professeur G. de Reynold bears the title *Comment se forme une nation : la Suisse sa terre et son histoire* (pp. 8, price 1s. net). It is a rather rhetorical summary of the historic processes which made Switzerland a unity, but its object is to point out that the Swiss, like other people, are meeting a new world now and need the sympathy of Great Britain. The address is a 'heroic salute of the Alps to the sea.' Lieutenant-Colonel F. de Filippi writes on *The Relations of the House of Savoy with the Court of England* (pp. 22, price 2s. net). This biographical account, which has six portraits from a Turin gallery, is a notice of the historic ancestry of the reigning house of Italy. A third publication has a still wider sweep of theme: it is Viscount Bryce's address, the Raleigh lecture, on *World History* (pp. 27, price 2s. net). It arrays the world-making forces, that is, the unifying tendencies—conquest, commerce, religion, the proletariat, philosophy—as well as the processes of union—absorption and fusion. Along with convergence Lord Bryce sees divergence; but the number of tongues and peoples has decreased. He refrains from attempting the estimate of remote futures, and will not scale what Lucretius styles the *flammanitia moenia mundi*. But he asks great questions. Will Europe's intellectual primacy endure? Is Liberty still marching? Is there Moral Progress and a rising standard? He hints that some reactionary symptoms may bring what meteorologists call a transitory depression. It is a noble address, delivered as it were on Pisgah.

*The French Quarterly* for October (Manchester University Press, price 3s. net) has (1) D. Parodi's survey of contemporary Philosophy in France; (2) E. Ripert's sketch of the Provençal renaissance, starting from the middle of the eighteenth century and culminating in F. Mistral; and (3) J. Bury's notice of a modern poet and man of letters, René Boylesve, which assigns him a specially representative quality as *un témoin de la vie française*. In other papers J. M. Devonshire estimates the force of the wave of popularity of Scott in French translations down to 1834; H. C. Lunn collates sources used by Theophile Gautier; and H. Magden tracks Pierre Benoît's debt to Rider Haggard. The bibliography for the quarter is a very serviceable guide.

## Communications

SHEER-CLOTH'D (*S.H.R.*, xvii, p. 156). As the document in which this word occurs was preserved by one old friend, and has been edited by another, it is not inappropriate that I should add a note on its meaning, which is obscured by the unusual but not unique form in which it appears. That it is a variant of 'cere-cloth'd' is proved by the following examples of the noun 'sheer-cloth' (in the sense of 'cere-cloth'), which are noted in the Oxford English Dictionary and the English Dialect Dictionary :—

'When her body should be wrapt in sheer-cloth, they should in no case suffer her linsens to be taken off.'—1675, in *Select Biographies* (Wodrow Soc.), vol. ii, p. 506.

'Wrapping in shear cloath, oyle, poulders, and perfumes, and the chirurgeon attendance.'—1692, in Macgill, *Old Ross-shire* (1901), p. 152.

'Ane accompt off the Laird of Balnagowns funeral charges . . . imbowellling . . . and sheer cloath.'—1711 *ibid.*

'*Sheer-cloth* . . ., a large plaster; what is also called by country-people a 'strengthenin' plaster.'—1887, T. Darlington, *Folk-speech of South Cheshire*, p. 337.

In the latter sense 'cere-cloth' was in use from the sixteenth to the nineteenth century.

With a slight variation, the form occurs at a much earlier date than any of the above examples, viz. in the account of the death of Henry V. contained in one continuation of the *Brut*.

'And thanne was his body enbawmyd and dight with riche Spicerie and oynementis, and closid in *shire clothe*, and closid faste in a cheste.'—*The Brut or the Chronicles of England* (E.E.T.S.), vol. ii, p. 430.

Although the verb 'cere-cloth' is rarer than the noun, three examples (in different senses) are given in the O.E.D., and one of these is relevant to the present case :—

'The body of the Marquis of Dorset seemed sound and handsomely cere-clothed.'—1658, Sir T. Browne, *Hydrotophia*, ii, 31.

In view of the above examples, there can be no doubt that Robert Watt's coffin had a lining of cere-cloth as well as of 'white crape.'

W. A. CRAIGIE.

THE LAST DAYS OF CLEMENTINA WALKINSHAW.

Clementina Walkinshaw, Prince Charlie's mistress, on her flight from him, received from the Emperor Francis I. the title of Comtesse d'Albestroff,<sup>1</sup> and on the adoption of her daughter, Charlotte Stuart, by her father, who created her Duchess of Albany, retired first to Paris and then to Switzerland, where, on her daughter's death, she lived on a pension paid in accordance with her daughter's will by the Cardinal York. The Coutts' MSS., edited in *The Life of Thomas Coutts, Banker*, by Mr. E. Hartley Coleridge, cast some new light upon her latter days and also on the character of the Cardinal.

The Comtesse d'Albestroff lived 'chez La Veuve Friond, pres de St. Nicholas, at Fribourg in Switzerland' in 1793, and Thomas Coutts the Banker, in London, kept up a friendly correspondence with her. He was in Scottish fashion, through his relations the Stuarts of Allanbank, the Setons of Touch, the Walkinshaw Crawfords of Crawfordland, her 'cousin,' and he felt all the obligations of kinship. 'The unhappy affairs in France' rendered her position and circumstances 'very cruel and distressing,' and Mr. Coutts wrote 1st April, 1794,<sup>2</sup> telling her that he had used his influence with Monsignor Erskine, 'lately appointed auditor of his Holiness the Pope,' to help her 'in regard to the Cardinal,' no doubt concerning the pension which Cardinal York was charged to pay her, and which was already in arrears. On 10th August, 1795,<sup>3</sup> he sent her twenty-five guineas (the first of many remittances), and wrote: 'It made Mrs. Coutts and my daughters very happy to hear you was in good health, tho' we were much mortify'd with the behaviour of the Prince Cardinal, who's High Birth & misfortunes should make him feel more for others.'

On the 4th August, 1796, Mr. Coutts wrote a letter to William Wickham, Esq., to recommend the Comtesse. 'She is,' he wrote, 'born of a very respectable family in Scotland and I am confident will always be found in every respect deserving of your protection.' He kept her supplied with money and news about his family from time to time. In January, 1799, she was, in spite of the war terrors, still at Fribourg, and we find him writing: 'May Heaven give you the comfort which this vile world denies.' On 26th December of that year, dating from Bath,<sup>4</sup> he sent her twenty-five guineas with this news: 'I have had the pleasure to hear that His Majesty with His usual goodness has extended His bounty to the Cardinal Duke and that Lord Minto, Minister at Vienna, has been ordered to pay him £2000 & to assure him He will receive the same sum half-yearly that is four thousand pounds a year. Surely He cannot refuse a small degree of Humanity towards you—when he is receiving it so liberally himself, from our most amiable and best of Kings.'

On the 15th July, 1800,<sup>5</sup> he was forced to write, however, sending the usual sum: 'I have always been in hope to hear that the Cardinal on

<sup>1</sup> Ruvigny's *Jacobite Peerage*, p. 190a.

<sup>2</sup> *Life of Thomas Coutts*, vol. ii. pp. 33-54.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.* pp. 67, 69.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.* p. 109.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.* pp. 113-4.



receiving from our most amiable Sovereign a very liberal allowance of Four Thousand pounds per annum, had ordered your Pension to be regularly paid—and even that He might have ordered me to pay it to your order out of the sum he receives from this Country.

I think you should write him a letter stating that you know the generous allowance made to him from England and implore his justice and generosity to make you an allowance out of it, adding that 'tho' you are almost forgotten in England, yet still you have some friends left there, to whom you may represent the hardship of your situation. That you hope He will prevent the necessity of your doing so by writing to *Mr. Coutts Banquier de la Cour à Londres* to pay your small annuity out of the allowance made to His Eminence—as it must make His Eminence appear in a bad light to refuse such a trifle to the Mother of the Duchess of Albany, especially as he inherited all her effects & was charged with the support of her Mother, who is now distressed and languishing among strangers in a foreign land.'

The Comtesse wrote later to say that she had heard that the Cardinal had refused 'The Bounty of England,' but Mr. Coutts corrected this on 1st January, 1802<sup>1</sup>: 'you may be assured you have been misinformed & that His Eminence has received it regularly—at two payments in the year, each of them two thousand pounds. He is always solicitous to have it, and I believe his agent Mr. Sloane at Rome sometimes has advanc'd the money by anticipation.

I receive it here and am now assured of receiving £2000 in a few days. The period of payment being the 5th of this month. He might surely out of such a sum pay your pittance 1500 livres—which you inform me he offers, he reduces to 500 livres, & even that trifle perhaps does not pay punctually.

His conduct is shameful and cruel.'

Had it not been for Mr. Coutts' remittances, which amounted at least to £50 a year, the poor Comtesse would have been in sad straits. On 16th November, 1802, he wrote again, sending her her money, and ended his letter<sup>2</sup> with the criticism: 'The Cardinal Duke must have outliv'd all sense of shame.' Clementina Walkinshaw died in the same month and year. She died aged and poor, but bequeathed to her kind benefactor, Thomas Coutts, a small gold box 'comme petit gage de ses bontés pour moi.'

Among the Coutts' papers there is, in addition, a curious note<sup>3</sup> of 'Money generously sent by Thomas Coutts Esq. to my poor Grand Mother, the Countess of Albestroff,' amounting from 1795 to 16th November, 1802, in all to 250 guineas. The note ends '£262 10 shs. which amount my strongest desire is to repay. I have however every reason to believe that more money has been paid to my grand-mother, and I hope, one day to come to be able to know and settle the whole. R.'

Who this grandchild could be might be a mystery were it not for a letter from Thomas Coutts' daughter, Lady Bute, to her father, 19th September, 1815,<sup>4</sup> which gives her account of his origin. 'I am

<sup>1</sup> *Life of Thomas Coutts*, vol. ii. p. 130.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.* p. 142.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.* p. 142-3.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.* p. 333.

most happy you approve of my having refused to lend money to Le Baron Roehenstart: he is a gentlemanlike man, very like Madame D'Albestroff. It seems his mother, the Duchess D'Albany, married Mons. Roehenstart.'

The Duchess of Albany (through a marriage to a Prince of Sweden, Adolph, Duke of Eurhes, Gothland, brother of Gustaf III., was once talked about and who in consequence saw many Swedes) mentioned neither marriage nor child in her will, naming only her intimates, her household, and her uncle the Cardinal. The Cardinal she made her heir, but provided for her mother, to whom she desired an annual pension of fifteen thousand francs to be paid for her life, with the power of disposing at her death of fifty thousand francs in favour of her necessitous relations.<sup>1</sup> A Swede, Charles Edward Stuart Baron Roehenstart, who at the age of seventy-three was killed by a coach accident in Perthshire, 28th October, 1854, and buried in Dunkeld Cathedral, claimed, it is said, to be a grandson of Prince Charlie, and, as we have just seen, perhaps so. It does not seem, however, that his mother ever acknowledged him or that his grandmother left any memorandum about his origin. Clementina Walkinshaw, indeed, in her will, made the following pathetic note about her Scottish kin only: 'To each of my relations should any of them still remain I give a Louis, as a means of discovering them.'<sup>2</sup>

A. FRANCIS STEUART.

SCOTTISH MIDDLE TEMPLARS. (*S.H.R.* xvii., p. 103.)

To Mr. Bedwell's list the Editor appended some interesting notes. The following biographical details are submitted as a further contribution:

1615. John, Earl of Cassilis.  
The fifth Earl. Died 1616.
1671. Alexander Blair.  
Was this a son of the well-known Covenanting minister, Robert Blair of St. Andrews? The Rev. Robert Blair had a son named Alexander. See Scott's *Fasti*.
1713. David Cannady.  
Died at Ayr, 1754.
1775. John Richardson.  
Oriental scholar. Published *Dictionary of Persian, Arabic and English*, 1777.
1822. William Hugh Scott, second son of Hugh S. of Harden. The father, Hugh S., was at the time chief of the Scott clan, and afterwards Lord Polwarth. See Lockhart's *Life of Scott*.
1839. William Campbell Gillan.  
His father, Rev. Robert G., was minister of Hawick, 1789-1800.
1840. William Weir.  
Journalist. Editor of *Daily News*, 1854-8.

<sup>1</sup> Will of the Duchess of Albany, *Miscellany, Scottish History Society*, vol. ii. pp. 433-456.

<sup>2</sup> Dennistoun's *Memoirs of Sir Robert Strange*, ii. Appendix vi. p. 324.

1862. Alexander Kennedy Isbister.  
Educational writer. Master of Stationers' Company's School,  
1858-82.
1869. Patrick Blair.  
Afterwards Sheriff-Substitute at Inverness.
- George Smeaton (1863), John George Charles (1864), John Brown  
Thomson (1868), and Julius Wood Muir (1869), were all in the  
Indian Civil Service.
- Charles Erskine (1733) and A. K. H. Boyd (1842) were both admitted  
at the age of seventeen.

JOHN WARRICK.