

*Kieran D. Taylor*

## *The Innes Review at 70*

Under the auspices of the Edinburgh branch of the Newman Association of Great Britain, a residential conference open to all interested in Scottish Catholic History was held at the Ogilvie Training College, Polmont, Stirlingshire, in May, 1949. The conference was attended by over thirty people. Four papers were read; Mr. Donald Nicholl spoke on the Catholic's approach to history, Father Anthony Ross, O.P., on the contribution made to Scottish historical studies by Catholic scholars, Father David McRoberts on the Scottish Colleges on the Continent, and Brother Clare (Dr. Handley) on the work still to be done in Scottish social and economic history. Before the conference ended a committee was elected, charged with the organisation of a similar conference in 1950, and with the promotion of research into Scottish Catholic history. It was to consider the possibility of publishing a review for the encouragement of such research.<sup>1</sup>

So began the history of the *Innes Review*. Anthony Ross, a young convert to Catholicism and a Dominican brother, admitted that in the beginning detractors had said 'few people' in Scotland would have an interest in Scottish Catholic history.<sup>2</sup> The journal's hopes looked even more unencouraging as its original finances were a modest sum of £4 and 10s. Moreover, some readers had admitted to Ross that they had been 'disappointed' by some of the articles.<sup>3</sup> Within its first year, however, the *Innes Review* received over three hundred subscriptions and a generous donation from the bishop of Paisley.<sup>4</sup>

Like the history of the Catholic Church in modern Scotland, the *Innes Review* had humble and pilloried beginnings. Yet it has made a significant and lasting contribution to the history of Scotland over the past seventy years. The journal's founders sought to provide answers to significant questions regarding Scottish Catholic history. In the Scotland of the 1950s, Catholic history still lay 'buried' in archives and libraries.<sup>5</sup> This was apparent from the historical ignorance of the clergy and schoolteachers who attended the Scottish Catholic Historical Association's first conferences. As John Durkan, the journal's founder, noted, it was often necessary to correct clergy on their scholarly mistakes.<sup>6</sup> Rather than 'objecting', however, Durkan reported that the clergy seemed to 'enjoy' such robust criticism. It was in this spirit of openness that the *Innes Review* set out to rescue Catholic history from obscurity, providing unbiased and thoroughly researched scholarship of the Church. This was to serve 'not only the Catholic

---

<sup>1</sup> Anthony Ross, 'Miscellany', *IR* 1 (1950), 109–67, at 67.

<sup>2</sup> Anthony Ross, 'The position of the *Innes Review*', *IR* 1 (1950), 77–78, at 77.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, 77.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, 77.

<sup>5</sup> 'Introduction', *IR* 2 (1951), 64.

<sup>6</sup> John Durkan, 'Our first half century', *IR* 50 (1999), i–vi, at ii.

community in Scotland’, but all those ‘concerned about the history of this country and anxious for its deeper exploration’.<sup>7</sup>

The *Innes Review*’s back catalogue has reflected a diverse range of themes and subjects. As Anthony Ross noted in 1950, ‘the history of no section of the human race can be isolated’, and as contributions have frequently shown, the history of Catholicism in Scotland is far from a discrete subject.<sup>8</sup> This survey will reflect on the broad contribution that the *Innes Review* has made to the wider discipline of history, and will outline the core themes which have been addressed within its pages over the past seventy years, highlighting some key articles that have contributed to the journal’s overall success and significance, allowing us to argue that scholarly research in the field of Scottish Catholic history offers insights and perspectives which have enhanced the understanding not only of Scottish history, but that of Great Britain and Ireland, and indeed Europe too.

The journal’s title is a tribute to Fr Thomas Innes, an Aberdeenshire clergyman and historian. Through the worst years of the penal times, Innes took great efforts to collect, record and study the Scottish Church’s history.<sup>9</sup> The *Innes Review*’s initial scholarship was carried out in this same vein. Ross, Durkan and others delved into the history of the medieval and early modern Church. In its early days, the journal specialised in these periods. As John Durkan remarked, the *Innes Review* gave ‘pride of place’ to the time ‘when all Scots shared a common history’.<sup>10</sup> The first contributions reflected subjects closely associated with medieval history, and included hagiography, sacred music, holy orders, religious art, sites of pilgrimage and prominent Scottish clergymen.

The *Innes Review* has charted Scottish history from its earliest Christian beginnings, and it has become known as a crucible for some of the most penetrating scholarship on early medieval Scotland. One of the journal’s greatest contributions to medieval studies has been in field of saints’ cults and their associated hagiography, from the publication of new editions of saints’ *vitae*, such as Alan Macquarrie’s work on *Vita Sancti Servani* (the Life of St Serf), to Thomas Owen Clancy’s revolution in the way we approach the history of a saint and a saint’s cult in his study of ‘The real St Ninian’.<sup>11</sup> Clancy upset cherished orthodoxies when he offered a compelling argument that Ninian was known by another name, *Uinniau*, who was perhaps the teacher of Saint Columba of Iona. Tom Turpie’s examination of the cult of Saint Cuthbert in late Medieval Scotland

---

<sup>7</sup> Ross, ‘The position of the Innes Review’, 77.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*, 77.

<sup>9</sup> ‘Introduction’, 1.

<sup>10</sup> John Durkan, ‘Anthony Ross O.P: a memoir’, *IR* 44 (1994), 113–118, at 113.

<sup>11</sup> Alan Macquarrie, ‘*Vita Sancti Servani*: the Life of St Serf’, *IR* 44 (1993), 122–52; Thomas Owen Clancy, ‘The real St Ninian’, *IR* 52 (2001), 1–28.

demonstrates the range of material that can be brought into a study of a saint's cult in its various manifestations in the later middle ages.<sup>12</sup>

Important aspects of the role of Saint Columba's cult in Scotland's history were investigated in articles by Richard Sharpe and Simon Taylor, applying their expertise in language to the medieval sources.<sup>13</sup> Richard Sharpe made a meticulous study of the usage of *uexillum* in medieval Latin and what it meant in relation to the sources that mention *Brecc Bennach*, showing that *Brecc Bennach* was almost certainly a small portable reliquary associated with Saint Columba whose custody was granted to Arbroath Abbey by King William in 1211 when he was facing a rebellion in Ross. Simon Taylor put his placename scholarship to work on the later medieval manifestations of Saint Columba's cult east of Drumalban, that is, from Inverness to the Firth of Forth, an area which lay within the kingdom of the Picts. He set out the evidence for an argument that linked the later manifestations of the cult to the historical realities of the sixth and seventh centuries, pointing to traces of Saint Columba's cult along the route between Iona and Lindisfarne within fifty years of the saint's death, traces which the incoming Gaelic-speaking Cenél nGabráin amplified to create Columba's 'greatest cult centre east of Drumalban' at Inchcolm.<sup>14</sup>

The *Innes Review* has also helped change how we perceive the origins and nature of Scottish identity in other ways, broadening our appreciation of its intricacy. A policy of editorial flexibility has allowed the publication of some extended scholarship, sometimes running to the length of a small monograph; and this has enabled paradigm-changing studies on the development of the Scottish polity and national identities within the Scottish realm. Dauvit Broun's article on the Welsh identity of the kingdom of Strathclyde, for example, argued how Bishop Jocelin of Glasgow sought to forge a distinctive identity for his bishopric during a period of Scottish political formation and consolidation.<sup>15</sup> Indeed, the independence of the Scottish Church and its influence in shaping the nation in the middle ages has been a regular theme: A. D. M. Barrell, for example, provided the first full, and enduring study of the background and context of *Cum universi*, the papal bull of 1192 which guaranteed the independence of *Scotticana ecclesia* from the interference of the archbishops of York and kings of England.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>12</sup> Tom Turpie, 'A monk from Melrose? St Cuthbert and the Scots in the later middle ages, c. 1371–1560', *IR* 62 (2011), 47–69.

<sup>13</sup> Richard Sharpe, 'King William and the Brecc Bennach in 1211: reliquary or holy banner?', *IR* 66 (2015), 163–190; Simon Taylor, 'Columba east of Drumalban: some aspects of the cult of Columba in eastern Scotland', *IR* 51 (2000), 109–130.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, 120.

<sup>15</sup> Dauvit Broun, 'The Welsh identity of the Kingdom of Strathclyde c. 900–c.1200', *IR* 55 (2004), 111–180.

<sup>16</sup> A. D. M. Barrell, 'The background to *Cum universi*: Scoto-Papal relations, 1159–1192', *IR* 46 (1995), 116–138.

Another ‘blockbuster’ article by Dauvit Broun, in 2015, also demonstrates the journal’s range of coverage in the medieval period, when all history is considered to be ‘Catholic history’. Broun grappled with the exiguous sources not only to reinterpret the evidence for the power of lordly kindreds, the changing relationship of lords to individual settlements, and the origins of Scottish earldoms and the nature of shires; but also proposed a new detail-driven approach to medieval statehood, based on qualities rather than criteria – on practice rather than concepts.<sup>17</sup>

Discussion of monastic life has similarly been afforded a special place in the journal. The physical remains of so many monasteries and abbeys in Scotland, and their enduring mark on the Scottish landscape, means they serve as a reminder of the nation’s deep-rooted Catholic past. Indeed Geoffrey Barrow’s survey of the monastic foundations of Queen Margaret, Edgar, Alexander I, David I, and Earl Henry, argued for a unity of purpose among the Scottish monarchs which changed the face of the Scottish landscape as much as its religious orientation.<sup>18</sup> Sixty years later, Matthew Hammond drew our attention to the overlooked role of women, and the evidence of charters issued in their name, in the endowment of Scottish churches and monastic foundations.<sup>19</sup>

Our understanding of the legacy of monastic archives, as apparently manifested in monastic cartularies, has been transformed through the work of Joanna Tucker, who has shifted attention from text to manuscript, and demonstrated the cartulary’s fundamental diversity as a category, rejecting the ingrained habit of treating cartularies simply as a copy of an archive.<sup>20</sup> Another way in which the *Innes Review* has contributed to our knowledge and study of archival sources is through calendaring and editing. This facilitated the use of such sources and was intended to encourage the study of new material. Classic examples include David McRoberts’ ‘Catalogue of Scottish medieval liturgical books and fragments’ in 1952 (revised and updated in 2011 by Stephen Mark Holmes);<sup>21</sup> Mgr Charles Burns’ ‘Calendar of Scottish documents in the *Missioni* collection of the Vatican Archives’;<sup>22</sup> and Mark Dilworth’s ‘Three documents relating to St John Ogilvie’, from discoveries in the Scottish Catholic Archives.<sup>23</sup> The journal’s 1958 special edition on early Scottish libraries was a foundational

---

<sup>17</sup> Dauvit Broun, ‘Statehood and lordship in “Scotland” before the mid-twelfth century’, *IR* 66 (2015), 1–71; ‘Corrigenda’, *IR* 67 (2016), 62.

<sup>18</sup> G. W. S. Barrow, ‘From Queen Margaret to David I: Benedictines and Tironians’, *IR* 11 (1960), 22–38.

<sup>19</sup> Matthew H. Hammond, ‘Women and the adoption of charters in Scotland north of Forth, c. 1150–1286’, *IR* 62 (2011), 5–46.

<sup>20</sup> ‘Understanding Scotland’s medieval cartularies’, *IR* 70 (2019), 135–170.

<sup>21</sup> David McRoberts, ‘Catalogue of Scottish medieval liturgical books and fragments’, *IR* 3 (1952), 49–63; Stephen Mark Holmes, ‘Catalogue of liturgical books and fragments in Scotland before 1560’, *IR* 62 (2011), 127–212.

<sup>22</sup> *IR* 24 (1973), 51–68; ‘Additions to the *Fondo Missioni* handlist’, *IR* 33 (1982), 31–43.

<sup>23</sup> Mark Dilworth, ‘Three documents relating to St John Ogilvie’, *IR* 34 (1983), 51–65.

text, chronicling the locations and origins of books in the libraries of bishops, lay individuals and institutions. Anthony Ross reminded readers that historians, like archaeologists, should dig up the past, through investigation of the oldest texts. Doing this, Ross argued, would challenge ‘unchecked assumptions’ about the absence of an intellectual past in Scotland prior to the enlightenment.<sup>24</sup> The 1958 publication noted the strength of intellectualism in Scotland and illustrated Scotland’s connections to the Renaissance. Books in Scotland, it was revealed, came from cities across Europe, including Paris, Venice, Basel, Lyons, Antwerp and Prague.

With this in mind it is perhaps not surprising that the *Innes Review* has time and again illustrated the close relations between Scotland and Europe, before and after the reformation. Eila Williamson, for example, not only demonstrated the importance of exploring the Vatican Archives, but also opened a new seam in Scottish ecclesiastical history in the study of Scottish papal familiars.<sup>25</sup> Discussion of the Jesuits in Scotland has been formative in providing insight into the importance of Saint John Ogilvie’s mission.<sup>26</sup> This material evidences Scotland and Scots’ relationship to a wider continental Church. John Durkan, in particular, highlighted the role Scots played on the continent, sketching the careers of several prominent Scots who lived in Italy during the seventeenth century. The work of George Strachan and Thomas Dempster, and their interactions with notable contemporary figures such as Federico Borromeo, Marino Ghetaldi and Cassiano dal Pozzo, illustrates this importance.<sup>27</sup> Equally, David McRoberts outlined the prominence of centres for Scots pilgrims in Rome, such as *Sant’Andrea degli Scozzesi* and *Sant’Andrea delle fratte*.<sup>28</sup> A special edition of the journal, focussing on the Scottish Catholic Archives, meanwhile shed light on the papers of the Jacobite courts which were kept at the Scots College in Paris.<sup>29</sup> Discussion of these subjects is far from parochial, but rather illustrates the strength of Scotland’s links not just to the papacy and Rome, but to the whole of Europe also.

While these subjects may be less well known, the *Innes Review* has not shied away from dedicating scholarship to figures and texts that have been the source of ‘perennial fascination’ to early modernists and the wider public.<sup>30</sup> In a special edition on Mary Queen of Scots, Michael Lynch noted, the ambivalence of Mary Queen of Scots’ status as either a ‘Catholic martyr’ or ‘papist plotter’ has meant that her appeal and notoriety endures.<sup>31</sup> The *Innes Review*’s coverage sought to

---

<sup>24</sup> Anthony Ross, ‘Introduction’, *IR* 9 (1958), 5–23.

<sup>25</sup> ‘Alexander Rait, familiar of the Pope, d.1479’, *IR* 52 (2001), 29–41.

<sup>26</sup> John Durkan, ‘The early Jesuit mission for Scotland’, *IR* 34 (1984), 3–11.

<sup>27</sup> John Durkan, ‘Scots in Italy’, *IR* 22 (1971), 12–18.

<sup>28</sup> David McRoberts, ‘The Scottish national churches in Rome’, *IR* 1 (1950), 110–130.

<sup>29</sup> ‘Chapter III’, *IR* 28 (1977), 75–86.

<sup>30</sup> Michael Lynch, ‘Introduction’, *IR* 38 (1987), 1–29.

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*

free Mary from this historiographical Manichaeism, dedicating no less than eight articles in its special edition to lesser known aspects of the Stuart queen's life. Nicola Royan's exploration of the *Scotichronicon* and the *Scotorum Historia*, well-studied Scottish chronicles, has similarly offered new perspectives on these works. Royan observed that narratives of women in these chronicles have acted as moralistic vehicles through which to reinforce the contemporary expectations of women of the day.<sup>32</sup>

The *Innes Review* has thus been best known for scholarship on medieval and early modern Scotland. Yet its coverage of the nation's later history has been significant. Historians such as Alexander MacWilliam have traced the beginnings of the Church's rebirth in Scotland, revealing that, despite the ferocity of the protestant reformation, some remained faithful. As MacWilliam identified, the Mass was still being celebrated in Glasgow until the second decade of the seventeenth century.<sup>33</sup> Clotilde Prunier's study (in one of the journal's longest articles) of documents held mainly in the National Records of Scotland and the National Library of Scotland relating to the state of the Scottish Mission in the 1720s and 1730s shed new light on the mission and on the contrasting perceptions of Protestants and Catholics about the 'State of Popery' in the early eighteenth century.<sup>34</sup>

The restoration of the Catholic Church in Scotland during the nineteenth century has received significant attention.<sup>35</sup> Contributions have provided fascinating insights into various themes in relation to the Church's rebirth which have considered the politicking of bishops alongside visitations from papal representatives in Rome.<sup>36</sup> The *Innes Review*'s work on the Church in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries has challenged the widely held assumption that Scotland became less religious in the nineteenth.<sup>37</sup> Multiple contributors have shown that the Catholic Church expanded immensely in this period.

Catholicism's revival in Scotland was partially down to its association with Romanticism and Scotland's distant past. Continental ideas too fostered an environment in which Catholicism could flourish in Scotland.<sup>38</sup> Carfin, a

<sup>32</sup> Nicola Royan, 'Some conspicuous women in the *Original Chronicle*, *Scotichronicon* and *Scotorum Historia*', *IR* 59 (2008), 131–144.

<sup>33</sup> Alexander MacWilliam, 'The Glasgow Mission 1792–1799', *IR* 4 (1953), 84–91.

<sup>34</sup> 'Representations of the "State of Popery" in Scotland in the 1720s and 1730s', *IR* 64 (2013), 120–226.

<sup>35</sup> David McRoberts, 'The restoration of the Catholic hierarchy in 1878', *IR* 29 (1978), 3–29. This included a special edition for the Church's centenary in 1978.

<sup>36</sup> Vincent Allan McLelland, 'Documents relating to the appointment of the Delegate-Apostolic for Scotland', *IR* 8 (1957), 93–98; James Darragh, 'Apostolic visitations to Scotland 1912 and 1917', *IR* 41 (1990), 7–118.

<sup>37</sup> Graeme Morton, 'Identity out of place', in *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland*, ed. Trevor Griffiths and Graeme Morton (Edinburgh, 2010), 264.

<sup>38</sup> Bernard Aspinwall, 'Some aspects of Scotland and the Catholic revival in the early nineteenth century', *IR* 26 (1975), 3–19.

‘Scottish Lourdes’, which self-consciously sought to recreate the pilgrimage site in the Pyrénées, is a concrete example of Continental Catholicism’s influence in the first half of the twentieth century. Alana Harris has shown how gendered, ethnic, sectarian and nationalist identities were negotiated and re-inscribed at Carfin, a space which provided a channel for robust Catholic masculinity and male piety in a context of insecurities about socialism, secularisation and the feminisation of religion.<sup>39</sup>

At the zenith of the Catholic revival, more than 103 different religious orders ministered in Scotland.<sup>40</sup> These orders operated essential services such as schools, medical facilities, refuges and orphanages. The Church operated, as Bernard Aspinwall argued, as a kind of state within the state, giving it significant authority.<sup>41</sup> Yet this authority did not translate to political influence. Most Scottish Catholics throughout the nineteenth century remained part of the desperate ‘underclass’, their lives characterised by ‘degradation’.<sup>42</sup> By this token, the church’s ‘welfare state’ was vital, catering for those in the most precarious circumstances.

Nevertheless, not all Catholics were poor, and ‘victimhood’ was not always their experience.<sup>43</sup> As John F. McCaffrey identified, the Catholic community within Scotland was by no means ‘homogenous’ either.<sup>44</sup> It is thanks to the *Innes Review* that we know so much about the diversity and differences among the contemporary Catholic community. The Catholic community, although Scotland’s largest religious minority, remains ‘multi-ethnic’.<sup>45</sup> The journal’s editors have therefore encouraged research on the distinctive Irish, highland, Italian, Polish and Lithuanian origins and traditions of the faithful. Expanding our understanding of Catholic identity is perhaps the *Innes Review*’s greatest achievement in relation to its contribution to modern history, as the migrant perspective has long been excluded from the historiography of the nation.<sup>46</sup>

The experience of the Irish has received significant attention. One of the journal’s co-founders, Dr James Edmund Handley (Br Clare FMS), was influential in documenting the history of the Irish in Scotland with his important

---

<sup>39</sup> ‘Astonishing scenes at the Scottish Lourdes: masculinity, the miraculous, and sectarian strife at Carfin, 1922–1945’, *IR* 66 (2015), 102–129.

<sup>40</sup> Mark Dilworth, ‘Religious orders in Scotland 1878–1978’, *IR* 29 (1978), 92–109.

<sup>41</sup> Bernard Aspinwall, ‘The welfare state within the state: the Saint Vincent De Paul Society in Glasgow, 1848–1920’, *Studies in Church History* 23 (1986), 444–59, at 446.

<sup>42</sup> Bernard Aspinwall, ‘The Catholic minority experience in Scotland: the poorhouse view 1850–1914’, *Immigrants & Minorities* 31 (2013), 127–145, at 137.

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, 128.

<sup>44</sup> John F. McCaffrey, ‘Irish immigrants and radical movements in the West of Scotland in the nineteenth century’, *IR* 39 (1988), 46–60.

<sup>45</sup> Bernard Aspinwall, ‘Baptisms, marriages and Lithuanians; or, “Ghetto? What ghetto?” Some reflections on modern Catholic historical assumptions’, *IR* 52 (2000), 55–67.

<sup>46</sup> Terri Colpi, ‘The Scottish Italian community: *Senza un Campanile?*’, *IR* 44 (1993), 153–167.

book, *The Irish in Scotland 1795–1845* (Cork, 1943). Handley’s work and the forum provided by this journal motivated scholarship of Irish history in Scotland. Indeed, in 1980, Ian S. Wood could quip in these pages that ‘the Irish presence in Scotland has given us more than just Celtic FC’; and over the past seventy years contributors have articulated this position in detail, documenting the social, economic, political and religious contributions made by the Irish in Scotland.<sup>47</sup> Wood’s portrait of the influential ILP politician John Wheatley is an excellent example of this kind of scholarship. Wheatley, a miner, publican and socialist, became a figure of enormous importance in the post-War success of Labour. Inspired in part by his Dutch parish priest, Father Terken, Wheatley easily blended his socialist beliefs with his faith. Owen Dudley Edwards’ biography of Patrick MacGill, another Irish migrant to Scotland, also provides important perspectives on the Irish experience in nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Scotland.<sup>48</sup> Dudley Edwards identified how MacGill’s varied occupations – navy, farmhand, and tramp – equipped him with unique literary and historical insight. MacGill’s vociferous anti-clericalism is illustrative of the diversity of political and religious attitudes of Irish Catholics in Scotland.

The *Innes Review* has therefore expanded the understanding of the place of the Roman Catholic in modern Scotland – and thus Great Britain. But the discussion of Catholicism in modern Scotland inevitably entails consideration of anti-Catholicism, a spectre lurking in the background of many of the articles in this journal. Those who attended the SCHA’s symposium, ‘The Rise and Decline (?) of Anti-Catholicism in Scotland’ on 18 May 2019 will have seen how the issue of bigotry and its exact nature remain deeply contested subjects in Scotland. Yet the *Innes Review* has consistently illustrated the significance of anti-Catholicism as a facet of life in modern Scotland. The work of Stewart J. Brown, Geraldine Vaughan, Richard Finlay, Tom Gallagher and Alana Harris (among many more) in *IR* has recorded and recounted the impact and legacy of this prejudice. The arrival of the Irish deepened anti-Catholic sentiment in Scotland, and during the early twentieth century, theological bigotry was replaced with ideologies influenced by Social Darwinism.<sup>49</sup> Political anti-Catholicism culminated during the inter-war period with the formation of several Protestant fascist parties and a campaign by the Church of Scotland to repatriate the Irish.<sup>50</sup> This type of militant bigotry, however, never attracted widespread or sustained support in Scotland.

---

<sup>47</sup> Ian S. Wood, ‘John Wheatley, the Irish and the Labour movement in Scotland’, *IR* 31 (1980), 71–86. It should be said that the *Innes Review* has over the years discussed multiple pieces of literature relating to Celtic FC.

<sup>48</sup> Owen Dudley Edwards, ‘Patrick MacGill and the making of a historical source: with a handlist of his works’, *IR* 37 (1986), 73–99.

<sup>49</sup> Richard J. Finlay, ‘Nationalism, race, religion and the Irish question in inter-war Scotland’, *IR* 42 (1991), 46–67.

<sup>50</sup> Stewart J. Brown, ‘“Outside the Covenant”: The Scottish Presbyterian churches and Irish immigration 1922–1938’, *IR* 42 (1991), 19–45.

Anti-Catholicism, however, has lingered – but often as a sin of omission.<sup>51</sup> Catholics and their contribution to Scottish society were long obscured from the nation's history. It was partially in response to this collective oversight that this journal was founded. Thus, the contributions to the *Innes Review* have provided a scholarly basis for better public understanding of anti-Catholicism in contemporary Scottish society.

Another subject which has concentrated the attention of modern historians in the *Innes Review* is Catholic schooling. The journal has published no fewer than nineteen articles on this theme (not including the three published in the Spring issue of vol. 71). Catholic schools developed in response to the need for poor Catholics to be educated during the mid-nineteenth century. J. H. Treble pointed out that enquiries by the clergy in Glasgow during the 1860s found most Catholic children went either unschooled or attended poorly run adventure schools;<sup>52</sup> and T. A. Fitzpatrick charted the transformative role that the Marist Brothers played in establishing a network of schools in the densely populated Irish ghettos of Calton, the Gallowgate and Townhead.<sup>53</sup> Other religious orders – the Franciscan Sisters, the Sisters of Mercy, the Sisters of Notre Dame, the Jesuits, and the Christian Brothers – following the Marists' lead established networks of Catholic schools across Scotland.<sup>54</sup> And the foundation of a Catholic teacher training college by the Notre Dame Sisters at Dowanhill allowed generations of Catholic teachers to be trained in Scotland.<sup>55</sup>

In spite of what schools run by religious orders achieved, most Catholics prior to 1914 still had fewer than ten years of education, and this significantly limited their social mobility.<sup>56</sup> It was the introduction of state funding for Catholic schools in 1918 which transformed life for many Catholics. As Brother Kenneth showed, however, state funding for Catholic education in 1918 created 'deep anxiety' and 'acute controversy'.<sup>57</sup> On the fiftieth anniversary of the introduction of the 1918 Education Act, it was noted that the Catholic Church had originally declined the opportunity to join the state system in 1872, fearing that Catholic schools would lose their distinctive character if they merged with the state system.<sup>58</sup> State provision for Catholic education, regardless of the controversy

---

<sup>51</sup> James MacMillan, 'Scotland's Shame', in *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry and Sectarianism in Modern Scotland*, ed. T. M. Devine (Edinburgh, 2000), 15.

<sup>52</sup> J. H. Treble, 'The development of Roman Catholic education in Scotland 1878–1978', *IR* 29 (1978), 111–139, at 112.

<sup>53</sup> T. A. Fitzpatrick, 'The Marist Brothers in Scotland before 1918', *IR* 49 (1998), 1–10, at 6.

<sup>54</sup> Francis J. O'Hagan, Robert A. Davis, 'Forging the compact of church and state in the development of Catholic education in late nineteenth-century Scotland', *IR* 58 (2007), 72–94, at 73.

<sup>55</sup> Bernard Aspinwall, 'Catholic teachers for Scotland: the Liverpool connection', *IR* 45 (1994), 47–70.

<sup>56</sup> Aspinwall, 'Baptisms, marriages and Lithuanians', 65.

<sup>57</sup> Brother Kenneth, 'The Education (Scotland) Act 1918', *IR* 19 (1968), 91–128, at 91.

<sup>58</sup> *Ibid.*, 91.

that it generated, however, was instrumental in changing the economic status of Catholics in Scotland. Aspinwall saw how the introduction of state schooling in 1918 alongside the introduction of universal male suffrage afforded Catholics greater opportunities allowing them to escape the ‘ghetto’.<sup>59</sup> But O’Hagan and Davis have observed that the incorporation of Catholic education into the state ‘inadvertently contributed’ to growing secularisation,<sup>60</sup> while Teresa Gourlay showed how the role of the clergy in education declined just as the influence of the laity, as custodians of their own faith, increased.<sup>61</sup>

Catholic schooling, as many contributions to the *Innes Review* have shown, remains one of the Church’s greatest influences on Scottish society in the twentieth century. In 2014, around 418 Catholic schools were in operation; these comprised around 15% of state schools in Scotland.<sup>62</sup> During the centenary of the 1918 Education Act last year, politicians from various political parties renewed their commitment to Catholic schools. Indeed, the First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon, gave the Cardinal Winning Lecture on Catholic education, marking one hundred years of ‘partnership between the Catholic Church and the state’.<sup>63</sup> Calls have been made, recently, by some public figures who argue that Catholic schooling should end.<sup>64</sup> As was noted, however, at an SCHA conference which celebrated the centenary of Catholic education, challenges towards Catholic education are no longer purely sectarian in motivation. A growth in secularism, the perceived incompatibility of the Church’s moral teachings with modern life, and the role of clerics in child abuse, are presented as powerful arguments against Catholic schooling.

Nevertheless, as T. M. Devine (a former convenor of the SCHA) has argued, Catholic schools should be recognised as assisting Catholics in achieving occupational parity with the rest of Scots.<sup>65</sup> Catholic schools expanded occupational and educational avenues for their pupils, and the contributions to the *Innes Review* have shown that this provided Catholics with a range of new opportunities. The obituary of John Durkan reveals that he himself was a beneficiary of this system,<sup>66</sup> and Clifford Williamson has pointed out that the

---

<sup>59</sup> Aspinwall, ‘Baptisms, marriages and Lithuanians’, 65.

<sup>60</sup> O’Hagan and Davis ‘Forging the compact of church and state’, 73.

<sup>61</sup> Teresa Gourlay, ‘Catholic schooling in Scotland Since 1918’, *IR* 41 (1990), 119–131, at 131.

<sup>62</sup> John Flint, ‘Catholic schools and sectarianism in Scotland: educational places and the production and negotiation of urban space’, *Policy Futures in Education* 10 (2014), 507–517, at 508.

<sup>63</sup> Ian Dunn, ‘First Minister to Deliver Lecture to Mark Catholic Schools Centenary’, *Scottish Catholic Observer*, 19 January 2018.

<sup>64</sup> Henry Hepburn, ‘Catholic schools are very opposite of hateful bigotry’, *TES*, 27 November 2019.

<sup>65</sup> T. M. Devine, ‘The Long Road: Catholic schools and Catholic social integration since 1918 (Cardinal Winning Lecture, 2017)’, *Scottish Affairs* 28 (2019), 63–72, at 72.

<sup>66</sup> Clifford Williamson, *History of Catholic Intellectual Life in Scotland 1918–1965* (Basingstoke, 2016), 209.

founders of the *Innes Review* set out to encourage the laity to a better understanding the place of their faith in Scotland by its historical study.<sup>67</sup> Therefore, the *Innes Review*, as a constituent part of Catholic intellectual culture in Scotland, could be regarded as a by-product of the Catholic school system.

During the last seventy years, the *Innes Review* has provided a forum for the scholarly examination of many of the historical issues that lie behind contemporary debates in Scotland. The contributions made to its pages have consistently allowed us to view Scottish Catholic history from new perspectives, and often in a clearer light. The *Innes Review* has therefore furnished Scotland with a shared understanding of its history and allowed the nation's 'complex' and 'global past' to be revealed.<sup>68</sup>

KIERAN D. TAYLOR IS UNDERTAKING DOCTORAL STUDIES AT THE UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING.

---

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>68</sup> Aspinwall, 'Baptisms, marriages and Lithuanians', 67.