


SCOTTISH HOME AND HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Higher Police Training in Scotland

*Report of a Working Party of the
Police Advisory Board for Scotland*



EDINBURGH

HER MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

1968

WORKING PARTY ON HIGHER POLICE TRAINING

Membership

Mr W. HUTCHISON (<i>Chairman</i>)*	Scottish Home and Health Department
Mr J. H. W. BLACK	Scottish Police Federation
Dr D. J. DOCHERTY*	Counties of Cities' Association
Mr J. DOUGLAS, S.S.C., J.P.*	Convention of Royal Burghs
Mr W. S. GRAY	Independent Member
Bailie R. M. KNOX*	Counties of Cities' Association
Mr W. I. McLAREN	Association of Scottish Police Superintendents
Mr A. L. McCLURE	Chief Constables' (Scotland) Association
Mr J. McWILLIAM, J.P.*	Association of County Councils
Mr A. MELDRUM, C.B.E.	H.M. Chief Inspector of Constabulary
Mr J. H. ORR	Chief Constables' (Scotland) Association
Col. R. C. ROBERTSON-MACLEOD, D.S.O., M.C., T.D., B.A.	Commandant, Scottish Police College
Mr J. SCOTLAND, M.A., LL.B., M.ED.	Independent Member
Mr A. SMAIL	Association of Scottish Police Superintendents
Mr A. C. SMYTH, O.B.E., J.P.	Convention of Royal Burghs
Mr D. WILSON	Scottish Police Federation
Mr J. A. SCOTT, M.V.O., (<i>Secretary</i>)	Scottish Home and Health Department

* Mr Hutchison became Chairman after the death of Mr I. A. H. More. Dr Docherty, Mr Douglas, Bailie Knox and Mr McWilliam replaced Councillor Mrs I. Carter, Mr J. R. Liddell, Bailie G. Drummond, and Sir James Dundas respectively. Dr H. Gillies ceased to act as a member of the Working Party after its third meeting and was not replaced.

CONTENTS

	<i>Para.</i>	<i>Page</i>
INTRODUCTION	1	1
CHAPTER I: <i>The Senior Staff Course</i>		
Introductory	4	3
Analysis of the situation	5	3
The initial interviews	7	3
The extended interviews	8	4
Inducements to applicants	11	4
A senior staff course at the Scottish Police College ...	14	5
CHAPTER II: <i>The Accelerated Promotion Course</i>		
Introductory	15	7
The selection examination	16	7
The interviews	19	8
Eligibility for entry to the course	20	8
Attempts at the examination	23	9
Participation by policewomen	24	10
CHAPTER III: <i>University Courses for Police Officers</i>		
Introductory	25	11
The number of graduates required	27	11
The means of providing university courses	28	11
Part-time courses	29	12
Scholarships following Police College courses	30	12
Local arrangements	32	13
Types of degree	34	13
Selection of students	35	13
Conditions of service of officers attending University ...	36	14
Financial arrangements	38	14
Participation by women	39	14
CHAPTER IV: <i>Attraction of Better Educated Recruits</i>		
Introductory	40	16
The English working party's recommendations ...	41	16

CHAPTER V: <i>Promotion Examinations</i>	Para.	Page
Introductory	44	18
A further qualification for promotion beyond the rank of inspector	47	18
Abolition of the educational examination	49	19
Minimum period of service before sitting the examination	51	20
Abuse of the system	52	20
Passes in individual subjects	54	21
Date of the examination	55	21
Reciprocal arrangements	56	21
The content of the professional examination	57	22
CHAPTER VI: <i>Man-management Training</i>		
Introductory	59	24
Man-management training for senior officers	61	24
Man-management training at the Scottish Police College	62	25
Local arrangements	63	25
General	64	25
CHAPTER VII: <i>Travel Abroad</i>		
Introductory	65	26
Arrangements for study abroad	66	26
CHAPTER VIII: <i>Summary of Conclusions and Recommendations</i>	67	27

INTRODUCTION

1. At a meeting on 8th February, 1963 the Scottish Police Council appointed a Working Party to consider the means of introducing in Scotland arrangements for higher police training similar to those which had shortly before been adopted in England and Wales. The Working Party (referred to throughout this report as the original Working Party) made recommendations in an interim report, which it produced in September 1963, which led to the introduction of the Accelerated Promotion Course at the Scottish Police College and to the reservation of places on the English Senior Staff Course for Scottish police officers. It was accepted by the Working Party that further matters relating to training required examination and the suggestion was made that the Scottish arrangements for the courses mentioned above should be reviewed after some experience of their working had been gained.

2. On 7th July, 1966 the Police Advisory Board for Scotland, the successor to the Scottish Police Council, decided that the Working Party on Higher Police Training should be reactivated and reconstituted to complete the work of the original Working Party and to consider a number of other matters relating to police training which had come to the fore since the original Working Party had issued its interim report. The first meeting of the reactivated Working Party was held on 26th January, 1967. Thereafter we held a further five meetings, completing our work in December 1967. A sub-committee of the Working Party was appointed under the Chairmanship of H.M. Chief Inspector of Constabulary, Mr Meldrum, to consider the problems involved in running a senior staff course at the Scottish Police College, to determine the staffing needs of such a course and to consider what help such staff could give with the senior division courses already run at the College. The sub-committee's conclusions on these matters are incorporated in our report.

3. During the time that we were engaged on our task the reports of two working parties appointed by the Police Advisory Board for England and Wales — one on police manpower and the other on the recruitment of people with higher educational qualifications into the police service — were published. Both of these working parties made recommendations which related to our field of study and we have taken these recommendations into account in arriving at our conclusions.

CHAPTER I

The Senior Staff Course

Introductory

4. In 1963 a senior staff course was established at the English Police College at Bramshill which was "of a primarily professional character, designed to equip officers of the rank of inspector or above for the highest posts in the service". The duration of the first course was six months and similar courses have been held every year since then. Under arrangements approved by the original Working Party, a regular allocation of two places on each course for Scottish police officers has been made.

Analysis of the situation

5. There is no doubt in our minds that attendance at the course is of considerable benefit to Scottish officers in terms of broadening of experience and intellectual stimulus. It is clear to us, however, that the course is failing to attract sufficient candidates from within the Scottish police and that officers in senior ranks show little or no interest in it. An analysis of the applications for the course since 1964 bears us out in this view. The numbers of applications were 17 for the 1964 course, 7 for the 1965 course, 4 for the 1966 course, 17 for the 1967 course and 7 for the course starting in 1968. Over two-thirds of the total of 52 applicants were inspectors, none were in the rank of chief superintendent and only 3 were superintendents. Of the 7 applicants for the 1968 course two held the rank of chief inspector and the remainder were inspectors. By contrast the ranks of the 17 successful English candidates for the 1967 course were 2 chief superintendents, 8 superintendents and 7 chief inspectors.

6. The reasons for the lack of appeal for Scottish officers of the Senior Staff Course have been discussed on many occasions by the Police Advisory Board for Scotland and the Board of Governors of the Scottish Police College. In these discussions it has been suggested that the main factors involved are a dislike on the part of potential candidates for the course of the Scottish selection procedure, the fact that attendance at the Senior Staff Course has not in Scotland led to quicker promotion, and a reluctance on the part of likely candidates to be separated from their wives and families for six months. We examined each of these factors in turn with a view to determining what changes could be made in the existing procedure to lessen their influence.

The initial interviews

7. All applicants for a place on the course undergo an initial interview by a selection board made up of a representative of each of the police associations under the chairmanship of H.M. Chief Inspector of Constabulary. This selection board picks out six candidates for extended interview if a suitable number of qualified candidates comes forward. It was suggested to us that dislike of the existing selection procedure has arisen because the Scottish police is an extremely close knit service and candidates for the course are hesitant to reveal their weaknesses to their colleagues from other forces. An alternative suggestion

made to us was that it is the composition of the initial interview team which is at the root of the problem, since candidates do not like to be questioned by officers of the same rank as themselves or officers of subordinate rank. We do not accept that either of these hypotheses is necessarily correct and we are inclined, in any case, to think that all the police associations should continue to be represented on the interviewing team as a means of demonstrating to the federated ranks that the procedure is fair. We do not, therefore, recommend that any change should be made in the initial interview procedure for the time being, but suggest that the composition of the board should be kept under review. To this end we recommend that views on the composition of the Initial Interview Board should be sought from both successful and unsuccessful candidates following future meetings of the Board.

The extended interviews

8. The officers selected by the Initial Interview Board attend the Scottish Police College for extended interview by a team under the chairmanship of a chief constable and comprising a representative of the Association of Scottish Police Superintendents and a non-police member — the present incumbent being a member of the Applied Psychology Unit of Edinburgh University. This extended interview team makes its recommendations to the Board of Governors of the College and the officers approved by the Board are sent forward to the course.

9. Both interview boards have always accepted that they should attempt to select candidates of as high a standard as that demanded of English applicants; that there should be no question of filling a Scottish "ration" of places; and that the course is not intended for good middle grade officers, but that only potential chief constables should be put forward. Nonetheless, the English Final Selection Board, although they endorsed the Scottish nominations for the 1967 course, "expressed some concern at the apparent variation in standard, on paper at least, of the Scottish officers as compared with the officers from England and Wales who have been selected for the course". The Board suggested to the Home Office that the only fair way of maintaining a common standard would be to invite Scottish officers recommended for extended interview to appear before the English Board. In referring the matter to the Scottish Home and Health Department, the Home Office offered to appoint a Scottish chief constable to the English Selection Board should their suggestion be agreed.

10. We have considered this suggestion and recommend that it should be accepted as should the offer of a place for a Scottish chief constable on the English Board. We regard it as essential, however, that places are reserved for Scottish officers who are up to the standards of the course and that they are not simply lumped in with the English candidates to take their chance according to the total number of places available. Our recommendations in this respect have already been endorsed by the Police Advisory Board for Scotland, following an interim report, and have been implemented.

Inducements to applicants

11. In 1966 the Secretary of State recommended to police authorities that all vacancies in the post of chief constable, assistant chief constable and deputy chief constable and one in three of vacancies in other ranks down to and including

that of chief inspector should be advertised. The Secretary of State expressed the belief, in the circular in which these recommendations were made, that advertisement of appointments in these ranks would help to achieve the objective of providing the fullest opportunity for those who attended the senior courses at the Scottish Police College and the Senior Staff Course at the English Police College to gain experience for the highest ranks. The suggestion was made in the circular that it was to be expected that, when applications submitted in response to such advertisements were being considered, successful completion of the Senior Staff Course would be a factor taken into account. We do not doubt that, if it could be demonstrated that successful completion of the course led to promotion, its attractiveness to Scottish applicants would be greatly increased. The fact remains that to date only one of the Scottish officers who have attended a senior staff course has been promoted.

12. One of our number suggested that, in the absence of promotion, an officer who had successfully completed a senior staff course should be granted a monetary award, which might take the form of an annual payment until such time as he was promoted. It is our view, however, that this possible solution to the problem would present major difficulties, not least in its negotiation in the Police Council for Great Britain and we do not, therefore, recommend it. We are, in any case, of the opinion that it is the existing system of appointments to the most senior posts in the police service which lies at the root of this problem. The Secretary of State's power to promote the candidature for senior posts of individual officers is strictly limited. At present lists of applicants in response to advertisements for posts of chief constable, assistant chief constable and deputy chief constable are submitted to him so that he may indicate if there are any whose appointment he could not approve. He cannot, however, indicate to a police authority that it should give preferential treatment to a particular officer who has completed the Senior Staff Course. In these circumstances considerably more weight may be placed by a police authority on their knowledge of a candidate from their own force than on the paper qualifications of an outsider.

13. We are satisfied that, under the existing arrangements for the making of appointments to the most senior posts in the police service, proof of attendance at a senior staff course is of little or no assistance to a candidate. The recommendation of changes in this system is outwith our competence. We therefore confine ourselves to drawing the problem to the attention of the Police Advisory Board for Scotland with the suggestions that the Board should review the existing method of appointment to the higher posts with a view to making arrangements which would give officers who have completed the Senior Staff Course a better chance of promotion than hitherto and that the Board should consider whether, until such time as they receive substantive promotion, those who have successfully completed the Senior Staff Course should automatically be upgraded by one rank.

A senior staff course at the Scottish Police College

14. The original Working Party expressed in its interim report the desire to give further consideration to the possibility of introducing a separate senior staff course for Scotland. It is self evident that the introduction of such a course would meet the objection of Scottish officers to a prolonged separation from their wives and families. We therefore appointed a sub-committee under the Chairmanship of H.M. Chief Inspector of Constabulary, Mr Meldrum, to consider the

problems involved in running a senior staff course at the Scottish Police College, to determine the staffing needs for such a course and to consider what help such staff could give with the senior division courses already run at the College. The sub-committee, after holding two meetings at Tulliallan and after two of its members had visited the English Police College while a senior staff course was in progress in which two Scottish officers were participating, reluctantly came to the conclusion that, on both economic and practical grounds, it would not be possible to mount a course at the Scottish Police College which would be of the same standard or have the same status as the English Senior Staff Course. In reaching this decision the sub-committee was influenced by the fact that the number of Scottish officers eligible for a senior staff course is such that a course at the Scottish Police College could probably be held only once in every four years. In view of their general conclusions on the feasibility of running a senior staff course at the Scottish Police College the sub-committee did not consider what help the staff required for the running of such a course could give with the senior division courses held at the College. We accept the sub-committee's findings and do not recommend the establishment of a senior staff course at the Scottish Police College.

CHAPTER II

The Accelerated Promotion Course

Introductory

15. In October, 1962 the first of a series of courses for selected constables of 12 months' duration, designed to bring forward promising constables at an early stage in their career and to give students a working knowledge of various aspects of police duty, was started at the English Police College. The original Working Party recommended in its interim report the introduction of a similar course in Scotland and the first of these, which were later to become known as Accelerated Promotion Courses, commenced at the Scottish Police College on 13th July, 1964. Each year since then an Accelerated Promotion Course has been held, catering for 12 students, and there is widespread agreement that they have been successful. Perhaps because of this the arrangements made for selection for and the running of the course in progress at present show few changes from those made for the first. A review of these arrangements seemed to us therefore to be opportune.

The selection examination

16. The initial selection for the course is by means of the statutory elementary promotion examination conducted by the Police (Scotland) Examinations Board. A number, which has varied in each year, of those with the highest marks in the examination go on to the next stage in the selection procedure — namely, initial interview. Account is taken only of the results in the examination in police subjects, i.e. the subjects at the elementary level listed in paragraph 2(b) of Schedule I to the Police (Scotland) Regulations 1956 but excluding items (v) and (vi) — local regulations and bye laws and extra duties performed by the particular force concerned. We noted that in the past the spread of marks in the examination has been such that large numbers of candidates receive the same mark and that the bulk of the candidates are separated by a very few marks. As a result the drawing of a line at a particular level can mean that a not inconsiderable number of good candidates can be excluded from consideration for the course because their score in the examination is marginally below the pass mark decided on. We noted also that experience of the course has shown that there is a very poor correlation between performance in the statutory examination and success in the subsequent interviews and on the course itself. In the light of these considerations we have come to the conclusion that the statutory promotion examination is defective as a means of sifting candidates for interview in that it is not designed to provide an adequate test of the qualities required of students on the Accelerated Promotion Course.

17. It is our unanimous opinion that those who wish to be considered for selection for the course should in future be asked to sit a separate examination and that the initial selection of candidates should be based on performance in this examination alone, always provided that knowledge of police duties has been demonstrated by a pass in the statutory promotion examination. This examination should be held in a limited number of centres as soon as possible after the results of the statutory examination have been announced. While we

are undivided in our view that a special selection examination should be introduced, we were unable at first to achieve unanimity on the form which the examination should take. We therefore sought advice on this matter from Mr Dennis McMahon, a psychologist at Edinburgh University who has been associated with selection for the Accelerated Promotion Course since its inception.

18. Mr McMahon and Dr A. E. G. Pilliner of the Godfrey Thomson Unit for Educational Research of Edinburgh University prepared for us a sample of a non-traditional type of examination designed to test comprehension, reasoning, comprehension of statistics and intelligence and came to one of our meetings to explain its purpose and content. We recognise that such a test leaves important qualities unassessed; but we believe that initiative and practical ability as a policeman can adequately be covered by reference to performance in the promotion examinations, chief constables' reports and at extended interview. Subject therefore to the inclusion in the examination of questions designed to cover *in extenso* reasoning, to the determination of an appropriate standard of difficulty, and to the satisfactory testing of the validity of the proposed examination, we recommend the adoption of a non-traditional type of examination in substitution for the existing initial selection procedure based on performance in part of the promotion examination plus interview. We believe that chief constables' reports could most appropriately be considered at extended interview stage.

The interviews

19. The number called to initial interview has varied from course to course — in 1967 the number was 58. The candidates are interviewed before a panel consisting of one representative from each of the three police associations, the aim being to reduce the number to about 36. The candidates successful at the initial interview are then subjected to extended interviews spread over a period of two days which result in the selection of up to 12 students who will take part in the course. There are two interviewing teams for the extended interviews, each consisting of a chief constable, a superintendent and a psychologist and, to ensure the application of comparable standards, the work of both teams is co-ordinated by a third chief constable. We are satisfied that the selection examination to which reference is made in the immediately preceding paragraphs of this report will make a better job of the initial selection of candidates than the initial interviews (which take up a considerable amount of senior officers' time) do at present, and we have therefore recommended that the initial interview procedure should be abolished once the special examination has been introduced. We heard no evidence to the effect that the extended interview procedure is unsatisfactory and we make no recommendations for changes to it.

Eligibility for entry to the course

20. Students are given temporary promotion to sergeant for the duration of the course and substantive promotion on completing it successfully. Thus, in order to be eligible for the course, candidates must satisfy certain statutory qualifications for promotion to sergeant. These are set out in regulation 15 of the Police (Scotland) Regulations 1956, which provides, *inter alia*, that the constable should:

- (i) have completed five years' service and have, for the two years immediately prior to his promotion, been free from punishment other than reprimand or caution;
- (ii) have had not less than two years' service in the performance of outside police duty.

So far as eligibility for entry to the course is concerned, the requirement of five years' service can be set aside, but, because a constable is allowed to sit the promotion examination only after he has completed four years' service, he is bound to have completed five years' service during the course and before becoming eligible for substantive promotion. We understand that it is the Secretary of State's intention that the Police (Scotland) Regulations should be amended to abolish the service qualification for promotion to sergeant and to reduce the minimum period of service before sitting the promotion examination to two years. In these circumstances we do not wish to make any recommendations concerning the service qualifications for entry to the course.

21. It was suggested to us that we should consider whether an upper age limit or maximum length of service for candidates for the course should be introduced. We noted that the average age and length of service of those selected for the course has decreased steadily since its inception and consider that this is a trend which is likely to continue in future. We therefore, make no recommendation on these matters.

22. Two other problems concerning eligibility were brought to our notice. The first of these arises out of the experience of several candidates for the course who had been promoted to sergeant shortly after they had passed the statutory examination and before they had been called for initial interview. Regulation 18A of the Police (Scotland) Regulations might be held to require that only those in the rank of constable may be selected for the course and that the officers concerned therefore became ineligible. However, had they been selected for the course and promoted during the period between the date of selection and the commencement of the course they would, if they wished, have been allowed to take part in it. We recommend that a constable who opted to sit the selection examination should continue to be eligible for selection regardless of his being promoted at any subsequent date prior to his entry to the course. The second point relates to the date at which eligibility for selection for the course should be determined. While the general service requirement presents little difficulty in this respect, it often occurs that a candidate does not fulfil the other requirements for promotion to sergeant at the date of sitting the examination, whereas he would do so at the date of the commencement of the course. We, therefore, recommend that eligibility for selection for the course should be determined as at the date of its commencement, except that all candidates should have passed the promotion examination before being allowed to sit the selection examination recommended in paragraph 18.

Attempts at the examination

23. The original Working Party recommended in its interim report that a candidate should have three chances of admission to the course, the first being when he passes the promotion qualifying examination, even when he has opted not to be considered for the course on that occasion (the recommendation with regard to the first chance has not, however, been implemented). The candidate

would be free to make use of his other two chances when he pleased. A late withdrawal or failure to attend an examination would count as one of the chances for entry, unless the candidate could advance reasons which were acceptable to the selection authority. We were asked to give further consideration to the proposal that a late withdrawal should count as a chance and, in particular, to give the term "a late withdrawal" a more precise definition. Our decision to recommend the introduction of a special selection examination for the course is relevant here. We are agreed that candidates should be allowed three attempts at this examination and that a late withdrawal should count as one attempt. A late withdrawal should, we recommend, be defined as one which takes place within one month of the date of the special examination. If good reason can be shown for a late withdrawal it should not count as an attempt at the examination. We are of the opinion that it should be for the applicant's chief constable to decide whether the reasons adduced are sufficient for this purpose.

Participation by policewomen

24. In its interim report the original Working Party suggested that they saw no reason why policewomen should not be selected for the Accelerated Promotion Course, but recommended that the first course should be on an all male basis, principally because of the lack of accommodation for female students at Tulliallan at the time. We were advised that the problem of accommodating female students at the College is no less acute at present. A further argument advanced against the participation of policewomen in the course is that the promotion prospects of women police officers in Scotland are severely limited. Nonetheless we recommend that women should be eligible for the course, but that consideration of the means of implementing this recommendation should pay due regard to the availability of accommodation at the College and the promotion prospects for women.

CHAPTER III

University Courses for Police Officers

Introductory

25. In recent years there has been a growing awareness of the need for the police service to have a larger number of university graduates in its ranks. Reporting in 1962, the Royal Commission on the Police observed that "the police today are not securing a sufficient share of the better educated section of the community" and more recently the Select Committee on Estimates on the Police noted, in their report to Parliament in August 1966, that the number of graduates in the police service was very small and suggested a number of means by which the situation might be remedied. A survey undertaken by the chief constables in 1966 revealed that there were at that time 18 graduate policemen in Scottish forces, 13 of whom had obtained their degrees after joining the service. It is significant that six of these graduates hold chief constable posts. Equally significant is the fact that, when we discussed this topic, no graduate had joined a Scottish force in the preceding five years (a graduate was, however, recruited by Aberdeen this summer).

26. We have no doubt that the Scottish police service would benefit from an increase in the number of graduates in its ranks. However, we realise that, in the absence of assured career prospects, graduates are unlikely to be attracted to the police service in significant numbers. The recommendations in the succeeding paragraphs, therefore, relate to the provision of university courses for serving police officers, it being our hope that the introduction of these provisions will help to attract well qualified school leavers into the police service, as well as providing the police service with the graduates it needs.

The number of graduates required

27. In industry and commerce middle and top management posts are increasingly becoming the preserve of university graduates. It seems fair to suggest that middle management in the police starts at superintendent level and therefore that in the Scottish police service there are approximately 130 officers occupying what might be described as middle and top management posts. We do not suggest that it would in present circumstances be desirable that all, or even the greater part, of these appointments should be held by graduates. However, we envisage that the eventual aim should be to have a sufficient pool of graduates scattered throughout the service to approximate to the number of posts in top and middle management, although naturally most of the officers concerned would not at any particular time be in the running for promotion to these posts. To this end we recommend that between eight and twelve police officers should be given the opportunity each year of taking university courses. This target is necessarily somewhat arbitrary and is intended merely to provide a rough guide to police authorities. We feel that it should be reviewed when some experience of the operation of the scheme has been gained.

The means of providing university courses

28. We discussed three possible means of providing university courses for police officers — part-time courses, scholarships following successful completion

of Police College courses, and local arrangements made by individual police authorities. Our conclusions are set out in the following paragraphs.

Part-time courses

29. In its report, published in May 1966, a Working Party of Chief Constables on Educational Facilities for the Police in Scotland included the recommendation that "means be found to enable suitable police officers to transfer to stations near universities where they might study while continuing to do part-time police duty". The Working Party's report was considered by the Police Advisory Board for Scotland who referred this recommendation to the Working Party on Higher Police Training for consideration in the first instance. At one time many Scottish universities awarded degrees, study for which could be undertaken on a part-time basis, but because of the increasing competition for university places this is no longer the case. Part-time degree courses are not now provided as a matter of course at any Scottish university, although it is possible in certain cases to make arrangements with the Deans of particular Faculties for the acceptance of part-time students. Thus the implementation on a substantial scale of the scheme recommended by the chief constables would be difficult, if not impossible. We consider, in any case, that the combination of police duties and university studies might well prove to be an intolerable burden for officers selected for such courses. It seems to us that the best outlet for police officers who wish to pursue their studies on a part-time basis lies in another of the recommendations of the chief constables' working party. This is that there should be instituted a Higher National Certificate in Police Studies, to be awarded by the Scottish Council for Commercial, Administrative and Professional Education.

Scholarships following Police College courses (Bramshill-type scholarships)

30. The Bramshill scholarship scheme started in 1964 when three former students of the Special Course at the English Police College (the equivalent of the Scottish Accelerated Promotion Course) were admitted to the Law Faculty of University College, London. The number of scholarships awarded has increased each year since then and in 1967 a total of 21 places has been made available at universities throughout England. It has recently been decided that the scheme should be extended to include students from the "A" course at Bramshill.

31. We realise that there might be difficulties in introducing such a scheme in Scotland since many of those who would benefit from it would not hold the Certificate of Attestation of Fitness of the Scottish Universities Entrance Board, which is a prerequisite for acceptance by most Scottish universities. Special arrangements for the admission of mature students are however made by all Scottish universities and we envisage that it might, in any case, be possible for agreement to be reached with the universities on special arrangements for the admission of police students. We recommend the introduction of a scheme whereby selected students who have successfully completed an Accelerated Promotion Course or an "A" or "B" course at the Scottish Police College will be awarded university places.

Local arrangements

32. Several police forces in England have made arrangements on a local basis to send suitably qualified officers to university. We were informed of three cases in Scotland in which police authorities have taken an initiative of this type. We recommend that police authorities should be encouraged to nominate officers whom they consider suitable for university training for interview as described in paragraph 35 of our report. It would, however, in our view be wrong for police authorities to nominate new entrants since it is not possible at that stage to determine whether they will make the grade as policemen. Consideration of an officer's suitability to attend university should not, we think, be undertaken until such time as he has satisfactorily completed his probationary period. In this connection we note that the English Working Party on the Recruitment of People with Higher Educational Qualifications into the Police Service has recommended a scheme whereby up to 20 specially selected sixth formers would be recruited on the understanding that they would take up university places after two years' service. We return to this point later in our report.

33. We considered whether police officers selected for university places should be asked to give an undertaking to the effect that they would return to police duty for a stated minimum period of years. Such an undertaking would, of course, be unenforceable and some of us felt that its only effect might be to give the police officers concerned the impression that they had discharged their obligation to their police authority at the end of the period stated in the undertaking. We are not unanimous on this point but recommend by a majority that no form of undertaking need be sought.

Types of Degree

34. The broadening of experience which a police officer is likely to gain at university is clearly a prime justification for the introduction of the arrangements which we have suggested above, and to this extent the degree course which a police officer chooses to pursue is a secondary consideration. However, there are without doubt a number of courses which have not the slightest bearing on the work which a policeman might be expected to undertake. We recommend, therefore, that there should be as few limitations as possible on the degree courses open to police officers, but that selection committees should have discretion to decide whether or not a particular officer's choice of subject is suitable.

Selection of students

35. In England the universities involved in the Bramshill scholarships scheme have accepted successful completion of the Special Course as a qualification for university entrance. Initial selection of students regarded as suitable for university entrance is made by the directing staff at the College. Those selected are then interviewed by the universities participating in the scheme and scholarships are awarded to those who fare best in these interviews. We recommend that selection for the Bramshill-type scholarships in Scotland should be by means of interviews conducted by representatives of the universities and of the Scottish Office and that the interviewing panels should have before them assessments prepared by the directing staff at the Scottish Police College of the candidate's performance on the College course concerned. The nomination of candidates for university places under local arrangements should be undertaken by the police

authorities concerned. Thereafter, the officers nominated should be selected to attend university courses after interview by the panel set up to make the final selection for the Bramshill-type scholarships. We would expect that, in nominating officers for interview, police authorities would have regard both to their ability to spare them and to re-absorb them on their return from university and to finance their course, and that they would, all other things being equal, give precedence to the claims of younger officers as against those of men with longer service.

Conditions of service of officers attending University

36. We consider that police officers selected to attend university should continue to receive full pay and all relevant allowances payable prior to attendance at university. They should not, of course, continue to receive allowances related to the performance of specific police duties, such as detective, extra duty or temporary duty allowances. Many of the officers selected to attend university will require to move their homes temporarily to the university town. In the case of single officers we recommend that either the cost of accommodation provided by the university should be reimbursed to the student, or, in cases where accommodation is not provided, that the student should be paid the flat rate rent allowance applicable to members of the force of the area in which the university town is situated. So far as married officers are concerned, we recommend that arrangements should be made for police houses in the university town to be made available. We realise that this is a counsel of perfection and suggest that, where such arrangements cannot be made, the officer concerned should become entitled to payment of the maximum limit rent allowance applicable to members of the force of the area in which the university town is situated. Consultation with the Police Council for Great Britain and an amendment of the Police (Scotland) Regulations 1956 would be required to bring this recommendation into effect.

37. It seems to us desirable that students should spend some part of the long summer vacation on police duty but we think that a decision as to the length of time involved should be taken in consultation with the universities so that time can be allowed for required vacation study. Provision should be made for the normal police leave to be taken during this period. We recommend that students should not be expected to undertake any police duty during the two short vacations, nor should these vacations be counted as part of police leave, since most universities set vacation work during these periods.

Financial arrangements

38. We consider that police officers selected to attend university should be reimbursed the cost of their tuition fees and the required textbooks and any other expenses relating to the chosen course of study. The costs of sending police students to university could be met either by individual police authorities or by all police authorities on a common police service basis. We think that a decision on this matter is not for us, but should be taken by the Police Advisory Board for Scotland.

Participation by women

39. In the light of decisions not to exclude women from any of the courses at the Scottish or English Police Colleges, it would be illogical of us to deny to women the opportunity of obtaining university places. However, we have already

noted that the promotion prospects of women in the Scottish police are relatively limited and a further factor which must be taken into account is the high wastage rate due primarily to marriage. Against this background it seems to us unlikely that the extension of the scheme to include women would have the effect of adding significantly to the efficiency of the Scottish police. Nonetheless we recommend by a majority that the scheme should apply equally to men and women, but that selection boards should take into account promotion opportunities when considering applications from women.

CHAPTER IV

The Attraction of Better Educated Recruits

Introductory

40. Several times in this report we make mention of the Working Party of the English Police Advisory Board on the Recruitment of People with Higher Educational Qualifications into the Police Service. The Working Party, which reported in May, 1967, came to the conclusion that there was a need for a substantial increase in the proportion of better educated recruits to the police and made a number of recommendations for action which might achieve this end. These recommendations have been approved by the Home Secretary. We endorse the Working Party's general premise that special measures to attract better educated recruits to the police are necessary and we believe that the provision of opportunities for serving police officers to take university courses which we recommend in Chapter III will, by enhancing the attractions of a police career for the well educated school leaver, have a beneficial effect. Nevertheless we thought it right to go on to examine, in detail, three of the recommendations made by the English Working Party which fall within our remit.

The English working party's recommendations

41. The first of these recommendations was "that up to twenty specially selected sixth formers should be recruited on the understanding that they would take up University places as police officers after two years' service". We noted that if a proportionate number of sixth formers were to be recruited in Scotland, it would result in only two recruits per year and we were strongly advised by the representatives of the police associations that serving officers would resent this proposal to give preferential treatment to a particular group of recruits. A cumbersome selection procedure would be required to deal with applicants; and in any event the recommendations made earlier in our report concerning university courses for serving police officers are likely to appeal directly to good sixth formers. Finally, we adhere to the view expressed in paragraph 32 that demonstrated performance as a policeman is desirable before police authorities can reasonably be expected to commit themselves to spend money on university training. In these circumstances we do not support the adoption of this recommendation for Scotland.

42. The second recommendation was "that up to twenty specially selected graduates should be considered after a minimum of two years' service for the Special Course at Bramshill provided they passed the sergeants' examination". Again, the numbers involved, proportionately, for Scotland would be low and we were assured by the representatives of the police associations that to single out graduates in this way would create intense suspicion amongst serving members of the police service, with a strong possibility of detrimental effects on recruitment by normal channels and on wastage. Furthermore, all police officers who have passed the sergeants' examination are eligible to apply for the Accelerated Promotion Course at Tulliallan and the advantage offered to graduates selected by procedures similar to those recommended by the English Working

Party is minimal at best. On the other hand we accept the presentational difficulties involved in rejecting this proposal out of hand: although the advantages may not be substantial, they may well appear worthwhile to graduates who are potential recruits and to the appointments officers to whom they turn for advice. In these circumstances we recognise the danger that such graduates will turn to forces South of the border if they wish to follow a police career. Opinion was divided in the Working Party on the weight to be attached to these two conflicting considerations and we decided, while recording the unanimous opposition of the representatives of the police associations to adoption of this recommendation, to leave a decision on the point to the Police Advisory Board for Scotland.

43. Finally we have considered the Working Party's recommendation "that the possibility of a sandwich scheme be further explored". We simply noted this suggestion because we are unaware of the existence of provision in any Scottish university for such courses at present. Certain Central Institutions in Scotland are, however, introducing sandwich courses leading to degrees conferred by the Council for National Academic Awards. When the range of courses on offer widens from the technical field to the point where they would serve police purposes, the position will require re-examination.

CHAPTER V

Promotion Examinations

Introductory

44. No member of a police force can be promoted to the rank of sergeant or inspector unless he has passed an examination in educational subjects and an examination in police duties. Candidates can sit any of the qualifying examinations, except that in advanced police duties, at any time after they have completed four years' service and can sit the examination in advanced police duties at any time after they have passed the elementary examination in that subject. (The service requirement is, as indicated in paragraph 20, under review.) A candidate who passes the elementary examination in both groups is eligible for promotion to sergeant, while passes in both groups in the advanced examination qualify the candidate for promotion to inspector. A pass in the advanced examination in educational subjects counts as a pass in the elementary examination. It is not necessary that candidates should pass in both groups on one and the same occasion and there are no restrictions on the number of occasions on which an unsuccessful candidate may present himself for examination.

45. The examinations are in the following prescribed subjects:

Educational Subjects Group

English, including handwriting, spelling, punctuation, comprehension and composition;

Arithmetic;

Geography, especially the geography of the British Isles;

General knowledge and intelligence

Police Duties Group

Criminal law;

Evidence and procedure;

Structure of local and central government;

General statutes, regulations and orders;

Local regulations and byelaws;

Extra duties performed by the particular force concerned.

46. The examinations are held annually in October, their conduct being regulated by the Police (Scotland) Examinations Board, which consists of two chief constables, two superintendents, two inspectors and two persons having knowledge and experience of education nominated by the Secretary of State, one of whom is Chairman. Secretarial assistance is provided by the Scottish Education Department and that Department is also responsible for the preparation of the educational papers. Otherwise the Board makes its own arrangements for papers and for the conduct of the examinations, except in the case of papers on local police duties which are set by the appropriate chief constable with the approval of the Board.

A further qualification for promotion beyond the rank of inspector

47. As they stand at present the examinations serve no more than a weeding out purpose, a pass in them being merely a precondition for consideration for

promotion. They can, therefore, give no assistance in the selection of officers for promotion to ranks above that of inspector. It was suggested to us that a further qualification for this purpose might be introduced. We accept that there is a need for the introduction of such a qualification and consider that it should relate to police duties rather than to educational subjects. The most appropriate qualification for this purpose would clearly be attendance at an "A" or "B" course at the Scottish Police College. However, such a requirement could not in equity be introduced until such time as all inspectors in the promotion field have had an opportunity to attend either an "A" or "B" course. In present circumstances the shortage of places on these courses would make it impossible to envisage such a situation in the foreseeable future, but we think that it may be possible to alter the arrangements for Senior Division courses at the College in such a way as to create the conditions in which this requirement could be introduced within a few years. We therefore recommend that, provided the practical difficulties can be overcome, attendance at an "A" or "B" course should be introduced as a requirement for promotion beyond the rank of inspector when an adequate pool of officers who have completed these courses has been built up. In this connection we understand that the Scottish Home and Health Department is undertaking a review of arrangements at the College designed to establish the practical difficulties involved and how soon it might be possible to implement this recommendation.

48. While this additional qualification may be of some assistance to chief constables in making their promotion arrangements, we accept that it should not unduly limit the chief constable's discretion to determine which of his men should be promoted. This might be the result if a distinction were to be drawn for promotion purposes between attendance at a course and successful completion of the course. We are, therefore, not in favour of the introduction of a pass/fail system but recommend that the College should continue as at present to provide chief constables with assessments of the performance of officers on the courses.

Abolition of the educational examination

49. On the advice of the English Police Advisory Board, the Home Secretary decided recently that the educational papers in the promotion examinations should be abolished in England and Wales. The English Board took the view that an officer's general education was not improved by a period of intensive preparation directed specifically towards the educational examination and suggested that its abolition would serve as an inducement to better educated recruits. We accept that the existing educational examinations present few difficulties for police officers who hold "O" grades and that in some cases they are less rigorous than the entrance examination. However we believe that there is advantage in testing the educational standards of police officers before promotion and do not favour the principle of granting exemptions to those who can show that they have been educated to a standard higher than that required for promotion. We therefore considered alternative methods of assessing educational background, in substitution for the existing educational examinations, which, we believe, do not adequately serve the purpose for which they are intended.

50. Arrangements are at present being made by the Police Advisory Board for Scotland for the introduction of a standard entrance examination for the police.

This will be designed to provide a more accurate assessment of educational potential than the existing non-standard examinations and the suggestion was made to us that the new examination could take the place of the educational part of the promotion examinations. This is an attractive idea but is impracticable since the pass mark for the standard entrance examination will be determined by the need to maintain an adequate flow of recruits into the police service. It could therefore be too low to act also as an indication of fitness for promotion. A further objection is that, although the new standard examination should provide a useful guide to an officer's general standard of education, it will not go far enough in that it will provide no indication as to how he applies his intelligence in relation to his duties as a police officer. It seems to us that this might perhaps be done by combining the professional and educational examinations in a single examination in which candidates would be required to demonstrate how they would react to particular situations likely to arise in the course of their duties. We therefore recommend the abolition of the educational examination, provided that a standard entrance examination is introduced and that the form of the police duties examination is altered so that it also tests command of language and educational background. The content of the police duties examination is discussed later in our report.

Minimum period of service before sitting the examination

51. It was suggested that we should consider whether the existing qualifying period of four years should be shortened. We note that the English Working Party on the Recruitment of People with Higher Educational Qualifications into the Police Service has recommended that the qualifying period should be shortened, in effect, to two years and that the Police Advisory Board for Scotland is considering whether this recommendation should be implemented in Scotland. As the Board is seized of this matter we make no recommendation.

Abuse of the system

52. In the period from 1962 to 1966 the percentage pass rate in the Scottish promotion examinations has been as low as 16.8% and has at no time during that period exceeded 28%. The reason for this poor overall performance seems fairly clear. Candidates have nothing to lose by sitting the examination and the evidence of the high failure rate leads inescapably to the conclusion that a great many of those who do sit are inadequately prepared. In view of the unnecessarily high load of work and expense which is thus being imposed on the examination system to no discernible purpose, we were invited to consider whether some means should be introduced of deterring officers who are not adequately prepared from sitting the examination.

53. Our recommendation that a new form of professional examination should be introduced is relevant, since its introduction might well lead to a change in the pass/fail rate. Until such time as experience of the operation of the new form of examination has been gained we are in no position to determine what disincentives, if any, are required. We must, however, emphasise our extreme dissatisfaction with the waste of time and public money revealed by the existing failure rate and our opinion that the situation should be reviewed at an appropriate time after the introduction of the new form of examination to ensure that the high failure rate is not allowed to continue. We also wish to reserve the right to

look at this matter again if it seems to us likely that the introduction of the new form of examination will be long delayed. Meanwhile, we recommend that the fullest use be made by forces of the greatly expanded further education facilities available in colleges run by Scottish education authorities so that candidates for the promotion examinations can enjoy professional educational help to complement the job training they already receive.

Passes in individual subjects

54. At present no provision is made for a pass in an individual subject in one examination to exempt the candidate concerned from the necessity of having to sit papers in the same subject in subsequent attempts at the examination. In considering the provisions which might be made with regard to the proposed new form of professional examination, we were advised that it is now the practice in certain examinations consisting of three or more papers which are marked separately for a candidate who has failed narrowly in one paper to be "referred" in that paper and not to be required to sit those papers which he has passed in a subsequent attempt at the examination. The form of professional examination which we recommend later in this report lends itself to the application of this system of "referral" and we recommend that it should be introduced.

Date of Examination

55. The statutory promotion examinations have since 1965 been held in October of each year. Prior to this they were held in February. The change has not been well received in the police service since education authority evening classes terminate at the end of April and do not resume until the middle of September and because most police officers, particularly married men, find it easier to study during the winter than in the summer. We accept that these are valid reasons for changing the date of the examination. A further factor which must be taken into account is the selection examination for the Accelerated Promotion Course which must be held after the promotion examinations but leaving adequate time for the remaining selection procedures to be carried out before the start of the course. We are, however, assured by the Deputy Commandant of the Scottish Police College that it would be possible to start Accelerated Promotion Courses in October, rather than in July as at present. This leaves some discretion in choosing the best season of the year for the statutory promotion examination. All this leads us to the conclusion that the promotion examination should be held fairly late in the winter. We acknowledge, however, that this is a matter which falls clearly within the responsibilities of the Police (Scotland) Examinations Board and we recommend that it should be left to the Board to determine the month in which the examinations should be held.

Reciprocal arrangements

56. At present a pass in the Scottish promotion examinations is not recognised in English forces and vice versa. The two examinations boards have for some time been considering the problems involved in accepting each others' examinations but have made very little progress. The principal obstacles in the way of reciprocity appear to be the longer duration of the English as compared with the Scottish examinations, and the facts that candidates are examined on different legal systems; that constables in Scotland can take the examinations up to

advanced level, but in England only sergeants can sit the examination for promotion to inspector; and that in Scotland the pass mark is decided after the examination marks are known, while in England pass marks are set beforehand. In effect the lack of reciprocity serves only to discourage transfers in the ranks of constable and sergeant: those in higher ranks, who do not need to pass further examinations for promotion, are unaffected. This distinction seems to us to be nonsensical and we recommend that the attempt to achieve reciprocity should be pursued further. It may well be that the altered and expanded professional examination which we propose in the following paragraphs will be more directly comparable to the equivalent examination in England and Wales and might smooth the path to reciprocity. We further recommend that, in the event of continued failure to reach agreement on reciprocal arrangements, the Police Advisory Board for Scotland should give consideration to unilateral acceptance by Scottish forces of English qualifications.

The content of the professional examination

57. In recent years the increase in the number of statutes, regulations and orders which relate to police duties has caused the syllabus for the professional examination to become overloaded. As a result it is claimed in police circles that the examination no longer provides a true reflection of the candidate's ability but is instead merely a test of his memory. We have already mentioned our decision to recommend the introduction of a new form of professional examination which would provide a more effective means of determining a candidate's fitness for promotion; we now consider what form this examination might take.

58. To assist us in our review of the content of the professional examination we have studied examples of examination papers on police professional subjects set at the Scottish Police College to members of the "A" Course and the Accelerated Promotion Course, and by the Metropolitan Police, the English Promotion Examinations Board, and the Police (Scotland) Examinations Board. In particular the questions set by the College staff and by the Metropolitan Police demonstrated to our satisfaction that it would be possible to test command of language, ability to marshal facts and facility of expression through the medium of the police duties examination. Our recommendations on the content and administration of a new examination to take the place of the existing examinations in both educational and professional subjects, are as follows:

- (i) There is no need to retain the paper on local regulations and bye-laws and extra duties in the police duties examination since the latter are falling into desuetude and the former are better tested on a local basis, given the increasing tendency towards transfers between forces.
- (ii) Papers on criminal law, evidence and procedure, and general statutes, regulations and orders should be retained.
- (iii) The paper on structure of local and central government should be expanded in scope to take in elements from the general knowledge and intelligence paper formerly set in the examination in educational subjects, and in addition, to test knowledge of the functioning of police representative machinery and the principal statutes governing the Scottish police. Such a paper might be entitled "Police background, including structure of local and central government".

(iv) On the assumption that the change proposed in the immediately preceding sub-paragraph is made, the appropriate weighting for marking should be 2:2:2:3 as between criminal law, evidence and procedure, police background and structure of local and central government, and general statutes, regulations and orders respectively.

(v) A greater number of marks should be allocated than at present to each paper in order to allow a wider spectrum of marks.

(vi) Each of the papers should include, (in addition to questions confined solely to facts), questions demanding a narrative response to a practical situation that might face an officer of the rank for which a pass in the examination is required, so devised that the reply would demonstrate both factual knowledge of law and procedures and also lucidity of expression and validity of argumentation.

(vii) Candidates should be required to answer questions of both the types mentioned in the immediately preceding sub-paragraph but greater weight in marking should be attached to those demanding a narrative response.

(viii) A generous time limit for answering would be appropriate.

(ix) There should be a choice of questions to cater for the constable sitting the advanced examination who might not, in all cases, have personal experience of the kind of situation set out in a given question as likely to arise for an officer of the rank of inspector.

(x) Since the marking of "narrative" questions will not be easy, it would seem to be best if the number of markers were kept to a minimum and if markers were to allocate a pre-determined proportion of marks to the correctness of replies on fact; to the way in which the answer was expressed; and to a contingency reserve to be applied where a candidate made an unexpected but valid point in reply. Markers would also have to bear in mind that for certain questions, particularly those bearing on procedure, there might be no single correct answer; they would have to make allowance for the different points of view of, e.g., a county officer and a detective, and assess the quality of the answer largely on whether the conclusion followed from the premises.

(xi) To facilitate the marking of purely factual questions, it might be appropriate to introduce a system of "multiple choice" answers.

CHAPTER VI

Man-management Training

Introductory

59. Increasing concern has been expressed in recent months about the magnitude of the man-power wastage problems experienced by police forces in both England and Scotland. This has given rise to a number of investigations of the factors which might influence the level of wastage and one of those which has come under study is man-management training. The English Police Advisory Board's Working Party on Operational Efficiency and Management, which reported in December, 1966, recommended that in England immediate attention should be given to the provision throughout the police service of training in the principles of man-management. In Scotland man-management training was one of the subjects considered by the Working Party on Service Conditions which was set up by the Police Advisory Board in 1966 "to examine service conditions in Scottish forces so that discontents might be remedied, recruitment improved and wastage reduced". The Working Party came to the conclusion that arrangements might usefully be made for supplementing the existing provisions for man-management training. They, therefore, recommended to the Police Advisory Board that the Working Party on Higher Police Training should be asked to consider this matter and to make recommendations.

60. There is, we are satisfied, a need to rationalise and extend existing arrangements for man-management training. We note that research is being undertaken by the Research and Planning Branch of the Home Office and by the Social Survey of the C.O.I. into detailed aspects of man-management practice in individual forces, including forces in Scotland, and that the results of this survey will be relevant to the training to be given. Nevertheless, given the importance of ensuring that police officers at all levels are trained in man-management as a method of reducing wastage, we are in favour of the introduction as soon as possible of interim arrangements which can later be modified in the light of the results of the research currently being undertaken. A general criticism of man-management training as undertaken to date is that it is often conducted in general terms and, where it is specific, is related more to the problems of industry than to those of the police. We recommend, therefore, that in future training should, if possible, be directed to an exposition of the theory of man-management and its application to practical situations which might arise in police experience. More particularly we recommend that man-management training should be provided from three sources, as detailed in the following paragraphs.

Man-management training for senior officers

61. We were informed that the University of Strathclyde provides a residential senior management course of four weeks' duration, which has already been attended by a small number of senior Scottish police officers. The idea here is sound but the Strathclyde course is open to the objection, mentioned above, that it does not relate specifically to the problems of man-management in the police. We recommend that two special courses, for chief constables and assistant chief

constables, and superintendents respectively, should be organised under the direction of civilian specialists in man-management training, on a residential basis either at a university or at the Scottish Police College. These courses should be directed to making sure that supervisory officers are aware of the principles of man-management and accept the importance of ensuring that these principles are applied at all levels in their own force.

Man-management training at the Scottish Police College

62. The syllabus for the "B" course has hitherto provided for approximately 3½ days to be devoted to a study of man-management subjects, out of a total of 54 working days. The period devoted to man-management training in the six months of the "A" course is somewhat less than this. It seems to us that the present provision for man-management or related studies in the "B" course could be extended. We recommend, however, that it should be concentrated in a single sequence of periods in each course and be conducted under the direction of civilian specialist instructors from, say, Strathclyde University who would be given considerable discretion in determining the content of the instruction but would be expected to relate it directly to police problems. The man-management content of the "A" courses is, in our view, decidedly inadequate at present. We recommend that it should be expanded and handled in the same way as for the "B" courses, although its content should be related more to middle management than to senior management problems. We understand that the Commandant of the Scottish Police College already has action in hand to meet some of the points made in this paragraph.

Local arrangements

63. The provision for man-management training recommended in paragraph 62 will not be sufficient to cope with the training of more than a small number of junior ranks. We therefore recommend that chief constables should be encouraged to make the best possible use of local facilities for training such ranks, including senior constables, at force level.

General

64. We envisage that measures such as those which we have recommended above will produce greater expertise in the police service on the theory of man-management and, conversely, a greater appreciation of specific police problems amongst the civilian lecturers who undertake the training of policemen. This will produce a new corpus of knowledge which will be supplemented by the results of the research programmes presently being undertaken and will increase the usefulness of the training offered to policemen. In due course we hope that it may be possible to produce written guidance for all police officers on the principles of man-management and that trained policemen will eventually emerge to assist in training at force level and, perhaps, at the College as well.

CHAPTER VII

Travel Abroad

Introductory

65. In 1965 an award of £500 from the Ford (Dagenham) Trust enabled the two most successful students on the first Accelerated Promotion Course to spend three weeks in the United States on a study of American police methods and organisation. The award was not repeated in the following year and attempts to obtain funds from other endowments for this purpose have proved to be unsuccessful. We were invited to consider whether arrangements should be made for the establishment of some form of Scottish police fellowship scheme, which would sponsor study visits abroad or exchanges with foreign forces.

Arrangements for study abroad

66. It is clearly desirable that Scottish police officers should be given the opportunity of learning from the methods and equipment used by the police of other countries. It is, however, not possible to justify the extension of this opportunity to more than a very few officers and we feel, therefore, that there is no need for the introduction of formal arrangements such as a fellowship scheme. We recommend instead that the Scottish Home and Health Department should make it clear to police authorities that they will look sympathetically, from the point of view of allowing police grant, at specific suggestions for study abroad of value to the Scottish police service generally, made by an individual police officer and endorsed by his chief constable and police authority. Such arrangements would, of course, be additional to the use by police officers of existing funds — such as the Churchill Trust — for study projects overseas. It might be that in a particular case a specific proposal for study or research abroad had the support of the chief constable, but the police authority concerned was not prepared to accept a share of the costs. We recommend in such cases that the Scottish Home and Health Department should consider the possibility of arranging for all the costs to be borne by the Secretary of State.

CHAPTER VIII

Summary of Conclusions and Recommendations

67. We summarise the more important of our conclusions and recommendations as follows:

The Senior Staff Course (Chapter I)

(i) We draw attention to the reluctance of Scottish officers, particularly in the ranks of superintendent and chief superintendent, to apply for places on the course and describe suggested reasons for this (paragraphs 5 and 6).

(ii) We do not recommend any change in the initial interview procedure but suggest that the composition of the interviewing board should be kept under review. We further recommend that views on the composition of the Initial Interview Board should be sought from candidates following future meetings of the board (paragraph 7).

(iii) We recommend that Scottish officers selected for extended interview should appear before the English Selection Board and that a Scottish chief constable should be given a place on the English Board. We regard it as essential that a number of places should be set aside for Scottish police officers, provided sufficient suitably qualified officers come forward (paragraphs 9 and 10).

(iv) We do not favour the payment of a monetary award to officers who have successfully completed a senior staff course (paragraph 12).

(v) Of the Scottish officers who have attended a senior staff course only one has been promoted to date. We think that the cause of this lies in the existing system of appointments to the most senior posts in the police service and recommend that the Police Advisory Board for Scotland should review this system with a view to making arrangements which would give officers who have completed the Senior Staff Course a better chance of promotion than hitherto. We further recommend that the Board should consider whether those who have completed the Senior Staff Course should automatically be upgraded by one rank (paragraphs 12 and 13).

(vi) We are not in favour of the introduction of a senior staff course at the Scottish Police College (paragraph 14).

The Accelerated Promotion Course (Chapter II)

(vii) The statutory promotion examination is inappropriate as a means of selection for the Accelerated Promotion Course. We recommend the introduction of a separate selection examination for the course and make suggestions as to the form which it should take (paragraphs 16 to 18).

(viii) We recommend that the initial interview procedure should be abolished once the selection examination has been introduced. We make no recommendations with regard to the extended interview procedure (paragraph 19).

(ix) We make no recommendation about service qualifications for entry to the course, since we understand that the Secretary of State intends to amend the relevant regulations. We do not favour the introduction of an upper age limit or maximum length of service for candidates (paragraphs 20 and 21).

(x) We recommend that a constable who has opted to sit the selection examination, should continue to be eligible for selection regardless of his being promoted at any subsequent date prior to his entry to the course, and that eligibility for selection for the course should be determined as at the date of its commencement (subject to a pass in the promotion examination being a prerequisite for sitting the selection examination) (paragraph 22).

(xi) We recommend that candidates should be allowed three attempts at the selection examination and that a late withdrawal should count as one attempt. We define a late withdrawal as one which takes place within one month of the date of the examination. If a candidate can show to his chief constable's satisfaction that he has good reason for a late withdrawal it should not count as an attempt at the examination (paragraph 23).

(xii) We recommend that women should be eligible for the Accelerated Promotion Course, but that consideration of the means of implementing this recommendation should pay due regard to the availability of accommodation at the College and the promotion prospects for women (paragraph 24).

University Courses for Police Officers (Chapter III)

(xiii) We accept that there is a need for an increase in the number of graduates in the Scottish police service and conclude that graduates are unlikely to be attracted into the service in present circumstances (paragraphs 25 and 26).

(xiv) We recommend that between 8 and 12 police officers should be given the opportunity each year of taking university courses and that this number should be reviewed when experience of the operation of the scheme has been gained (paragraph 27).

(xv) We are not in favour of part-time university courses for police officers (paragraph 29).

(xvi) We recommend a scheme whereby selected students who have successfully completed an Accelerated Promotion Course or an "A" or "B" course at the Scottish Police College will be awarded university places (paragraph 31).

(xvii) We recommend that police authorities should be encouraged to nominate officers for university courses who have satisfactorily completed their probationary period (paragraph 32).

(xviii) The majority of us recommend that no form of undertaking to return to police duty should be sought from officers selected for university places (paragraph 33).

(xix) We recommend that police officers should be allowed a wide choice of university courses but that selection committees should have discretion to decide whether or not a particular officer's choice of a subject is suitable (paragraph 34).

(xx) We recommend that selection for the Bramshill-type and police authority nominated scholars in Scotland should be by means of interviews conducted by representatives of the universities and of the Scottish Office (paragraph 35).

(xxi) We recommend that police officers selected to attend university should continue to receive full pay and allowances (paragraph 36).

(xxii) The period of police duty to be undertaken by students during the summer vacation should be determined in consultation with the universities concerned. We recommend that students should not be expected to undertake any police duty during the two short vacations (paragraph 37).

(xxiii) We recommend that police officers selected to attend university should be reimbursed the cost of their tuition fees and the required text books. We leave the decision on the means of financing university courses for police officers to the Police Advisory Board for Scotland (paragraph 38).

(xxiv) By a majority we recommend that policewomen should be given the opportunity of obtaining university places, but that selection boards should take into account promotion opportunities when considering applications from women (paragraph 39).

Attraction of Better Educated Recruits (Chapter IV)

(xxv) We do not support the introduction in Scotland of a scheme whereby specially selected sixth-formers are recruited on the understanding that they would take up university places as police officers after 2 years' service (paragraph 41).

(xxvi) We could not agree on a proposal that a number of specially selected graduates should be considered after 2 years' service for the Accelerated Promotion Course provided they passed the promotion examination; and accepted that a decision would have to be taken by the Police Advisory Board, which would have to weigh the presentational advantages of such a scheme against the adverse effects which, we were assured by our police members, it would have on serving police officers (paragraph 42).

Promotion Examinations (Chapter V)

(xxvii) We recommend that, provided the practical difficulties can be overcome, attendance at an "A" or "B" course at the Scottish Police College should be introduced as a requirement for promotion beyond the rank of inspector (paragraph 47).

(xxviii) We recommend the abolition of the existing examination in educational subjects, provided that a standard entrance examination is introduced and that the form of the police duties examination is altered as recommended in paragraph 58 of our report (paragraphs 49 and 50).

(xxix) The Police Advisory Board for Scotland is seized of a proposal that the minimum period of service before sitting the examination should be shortened. We therefore make no recommendation in this matter (paragraph 51).

(xxx) We note the unacceptably high failure rate in the existing promotion examination. We recommend that the working of the proposed new professional examination should be examined in due course to determine

whether means of deterring inadequately prepared candidates from sitting the examination should be introduced. Meanwhile, the fullest use should be made of the professional educational help available at colleges of further education (paragraphs 52 and 53).

(xxxix) We recommend that a system of "referral" should be applied in relation to the proposed new professional examination (paragraph 54).

(xxxix) We recommend that the promotion examination should in future be held late in the winter but leave it to the Police (Scotland) Examinations Board to determine the month in which it should be held (paragraph 55).

(xxxix) We recommend that further attempts should be made to introduce reciprocal arrangements in relation to the promotion examinations set in England and Wales and those set in Scotland. We further recommend that if this initiative meets with no success the Police Advisory Board for Scotland should give consideration to unilateral acceptance by Scottish forces of English qualifications (paragraph 56).

(xxxix) We recommend the introduction of a new professional examination to take the place of both the professional and educational parts of the existing examination and specify the form which it should take (paragraphs 57 and 58).

Man-management training (Chapter VI)

(xxxix) We recommend the introduction of two special courses in man-management for chief constables and assistant chief constables, and superintendents respectively, to be organised on a residential basis (paragraph 61).

(xxxix) We recommend that the present provision for man-management training in the "B" courses at the Scottish Police College should be concentrated in a single sequence of periods in each course under the direction of civilian instructors. The man-management content of the "A" courses should be expanded and handled in the same way as for the "B" courses (paragraph 62).

(xxxix) We recommend that chief constables should be encouraged to make the best possible use of local facilities for training junior ranks at force level (paragraph 63).

Travel abroad (Chapter VII)

(xxxix) We recommend that the Scottish Home and Health Department should inform police authorities that specific suggestions for study abroad made by an individual police officer and endorsed by his chief constable and police authority will be considered sympathetically for grant purposes. We further recommend that the Department should consider the possibility of arranging for the costs to be borne by the Secretary of State in cases where a specific proposal has the support of the chief constable but the police authority concerned is not prepared to accept a share of the cost (paragraph 66).